

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 46001

Title: A case of cirrhosis complicating Shwachman-Diamond syndrome and review of hepatic involvement in Shwachman-Diamond syndrome.

Reviewer's code: 03741310

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-01-25 15:19

Reviewer performed review: 2019-01-27 07:38

Review time: 1 Day and 16 Hours

| SCIENTIFIC QUALITY | LANGUAGE QUALITY | CONCLUSION | PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS |
|---|--|--|---|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept | Peer-Review: |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language | (High priority) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept | <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of | (General priority) | Peer-reviewer's expertise on the |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not | language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision | topic of the manuscript: |
| publish | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection | <input type="checkbox"/> General |
| | | | <input type="checkbox"/> No expertise |
| | | | Conflicts-of-Interest: |
| | | | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes |
| | | | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No |

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this article, Sandra et al reported a patient with Shwachman-Diamond syndrome (SDS) who had cirrhosis, a relatively rare complication of SDS. I have the following concerns: 1) I fully agree that cirrhosis is a rare complication of SDS but the diagnosis of cirrhosis in



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

this case was apparently unclear. Cirrhosis usually presented at the late stage of chronic liver damage. It's not common in a 32-month old boy particularly his liver inflammation was not severe according to the ALT level. The authors must provide more solid evidences supporting the diagnosis of cirrhosis. If the liver biopsy was performed, the pathological results should be showed. Did the liver biopsy sample stained for cirrhosis markers? Did the patients have any radiological exams e.g. MRI, CT, Ultrasound or Fibroscan with any support for the presence of cirrhosis? 2) The authors should give more detail about the mutation of SBDS gene of the patient as well as his family history. 3) In the figure, why the ALT data form age 4 to age 9 were missing?

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 46001

Title: A case of cirrhosis complicating Shwachman-Diamond syndrome and review of hepatic involvement in Shwachman-Diamond syndrome.

Reviewer's code: 02526287

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-01-26 16:59

Reviewer performed review: 2019-02-20 00:10

Review time: 24 Days and 7 Hours

| SCIENTIFIC QUALITY | LANGUAGE QUALITY | CONCLUSION | PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS |
|--|---|--|---|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept | Peer-Review: |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language | (High priority) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept | <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of | (General priority) | Peer-reviewer's expertise on the |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not | language polishing | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision | topic of the manuscript: |
| publish | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection | <input type="checkbox"/> General |
| | | | <input type="checkbox"/> No expertise |
| | | | Conflicts-of-Interest: |
| | | | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes |
| | | | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No |

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

We read with interest the paper entitled: "Cirrhosis complicating Shwachman-Diamond syndrome: case report and review of the literature" by Sandra M. Camacho et al. It is a case report of a 16-month-old white male presented with failure to thrive first noted

around 2-months of age, persistent hyper-transaminasemia and developing an histologically proven cirrhosis at 32 months of age. Cirrhosis was cryptogenic since all the etiologic tests including a panel of genetic tests were negative. This is a nice report of a SDS with severe hepatic involvement which is, as stated by the authors, quite infrequent in these patients (only five patients described by an old review) even in presence of mild elevation of aminotransferase and mild hepatomegaly. The clinical history is well detailed even though any data on imaging, either ultrasounds or CT/MRI were described. Hepatic involvement in SD syndrome has been only marginally addressed in the past years being the most recent contribution from 2009. Review of the literature is concise and references seem to be updated. Language is good and does not deserve major editing

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No