Baishideng Publishing Group

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite 160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 46157

Title: Novel AT mutation in a Chinese family with hereditary spastic paraplegia: A case report and review of literature

Reviewer's code: 00504436

Reviewer's country: Serbia

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-02-11 07:18

Reviewer performed review: 2019-02-11 11:17

Review time: 3 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
[ ] Grade A: Excellent [ ] Grade B: Very good [Y] Grade C: Good [ ] Grade D: Fair [ ] Grade E: Do not publish	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing [ ] Grade B: Minor language polishing [Y] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing [ ] Grade D: Rejection	[ ] Accept (High priority) [ ] Accept (General priority) [Y] Minor revision [ ] Major revision [ ] Rejection	Peer-Review: [Y] Anonymous [ ] Onymous Peer-reviewer's expertise on the topic of the manuscript: [ ] Advanced [Y] General [ ] No expertise Conflicts-of-Interest: [ ] Yes [Y] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Minor remarks: • Grammar and style should have a revision. • Some of the references are inadequate, and some new, more resent, should be added. • Technical errors in the text of the manuscript - for an example, writing number and unit, spacing, introducing

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite 160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

abbreviations. • The title should be changed - delete the last part of it "and review of literature", because it is something that is assumed. • Last part of the Abstract should be deleted starting from the last sentence in Core tip part "In addition..." until the end. • Last part of the Introduction part should be deleted starting from the last sentence "In addition..." until the end. • Technical representation of the results should be improved.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

[ ] The same title

[ ] Duplicate publication

[ ] Plagiarism

[Y] No

BPG Search:

[ ] The same title

[ ] Duplicate publication

[ ] Plagiarism

[Y] No

Baishideng Publishing Group

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite 160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 46157

Title: Novel AT Y mutation in a Chinese family with hereditary spastic paraplegia: A case report and review of literature

Reviewer's code: 00646249

Reviewer's country: Russia

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-02-11 07:41

Reviewer performed review: 2019-02-12 11:23

Review time: 1 Day and 3 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
[ ] Grade A: Excellent [Y] Grade B: Very good [ ] Grade C: Good [ ] Grade D: Fair [ ] Grade E: Do not publish	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing [Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing [ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing [ ] Grade D: Rejection	[ ] Accept (High priority) [ ] Accept (General priority) [Y] Minor revision [ ] Major revision [ ] Rejection	Peer-Review: [Y] Anonymous [ ] Onymous Peer-reviewer's expertise on the topic of the manuscript: [ ] Advanced [Y] General [ ] No expertise Conflicts-of-Interest: [ ] Yes [Y] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript of Xiao and co-authors is devoted to a case report of novel ATL1 mutation in a Chinese HSP family. Besides of finding of unknown mutation authors describe a novel clinical phenotype of hearing loss in SPG3A family. The text is good

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite 160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

written however some minor improvement should be done before publishing. MINOR "Laboratory examinations" chapter should be written more extensively. There is no description or reference on the gene panel test used for the mutation detection. It is important to indicate genes included in the panel. It is recommended to add more citations into the review as it is stated in the title of the manuscript, e.g. Willkomm L Heredia R Hoffmann K Wang H Voit T et. al. Homozygous mutation in Atlastin GTPase 1 causes recessive hereditary spastic paraplegia // Journal of Human Genetics. 2016 vol: 61 (6) pp: 571-573. Despite the overall good language of the manuscript it is recommended to perform final "polishing" of English text by a native speaker or proof-reading company.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

[ ] The same title

[ ] Duplicate publication

[ ] Plagiarism

[Y] No

BPG Search:

[ ] The same title

[ ] Duplicate publication

[ ] Plagiarism

[Y] No

Baishideng Publishing Group

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite 160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 46157

Title: Novel AT mutation in a Chinese family with hereditary spastic paraplegia: A case report and review of literature

Reviewer's code: 04434748

Reviewer's country: Brazil

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-02-13 11:55

Reviewer performed review: 2019-02-13 12:12

Review time: 1 Hour

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
[ ] Grade A: Excellent [Y] Grade B: Very good [ ] Grade C: Good [ ] Grade D: Fair [ ] Grade E: Do not publish	[Y] Grade A: Priority publishing [ ] Grade B: Minor language polishing [ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing [ ] Grade D: Rejection	[ ] Accept (High priority) [Y] Accept (General priority) [ ] Minor revision [ ] Major revision [ ] Rejection	Peer-Review: [Y] Anonymous [ ] Onymous Peer-reviewer's expertise on the topic of the manuscript: [ ] Advanced [Y] General [ ] No expertise Conflicts-of-Interest: [ ] Yes [Y] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I consider the manuscript very intersting and could be publish

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Baishideng Publishing Group

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite 160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

Google Search:

[ ] The same title

[ ] Duplicate publication

[ ] Plagiarism

[Y] No

BPG Search:

[ ] The same title

[ ] Duplicate publication

[ ] Plagiarism

[Y] No

Baishideng Publishing Group

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite 160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 46157

Title: Novel AT Y mutation in a Chinese family with hereditary spastic paraplegia: A case report and review of literature

Reviewer's code: 00646291

Reviewer's country: United Kingdom

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-02-11 11:55

Reviewer performed review: 2019-02-20 15:21

Review time: 9 Days and 3 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
[ ] Grade A: Excellent [Y] Grade B: Very good [ ] Grade C: Good [ ] Grade D: Fair [ ] Grade E: Do not publish	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing [Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing [ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing [ ] Grade D: Rejection	[ ] Accept (High priority) [Y] Accept (General priority) [ ] Minor revision [ ] Major revision [ ] Rejection	Peer-Review: [Y] Anonymous [ ] Onymous Peer-reviewer's expertise on the topic of the manuscript: [ ] Advanced [ ] General [Y] No expertise Conflicts-of-Interest: [ ] Yes [Y] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript is a clear description of a clinical case of hereditary spastic paraplegia. The manuscript is easy to follow, the figures of acceptable quality and the list of references extensive with articles published relatively recently. To make this case study

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite 160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

more useful for the specialist clinicians in this area authors might consider discussing potential reasons explaining the fact that the same mutation results in the exhibition of different clinical manifestations in different members of the family.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

[ ] The same title

[ ] Duplicate publication

[ ] Plagiarism

[Y] No

BPG Search:

[ ] The same title

[ ] Duplicate publication

[ ] Plagiarism

[Y] No