

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Clinical Cases

**Manuscript NO:** 46209

**Title:** Open Reduction Of A Total Talar Dislocation After Unsuccessful Closed Reduction In The Emergency Room Due To A Fractured Medial Malleolus Blocking Relocation: A Case Report And Literature Review

**Reviewer's code:** 02990500

**Reviewer's country:** Lebanon

**Science editor:** Fang-Fang Ji

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2019-03-26 06:20

**Reviewer performed review:** 2019-03-26 12:50

**Review time:** 6 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

## SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Title • The title is too long, should be shortened and clarified

\*\*\* Title has been shortened and clarified as

**"Open Reduction of a Total Talar Dislocation: A Case Report and Literature Review"**

Introduction • This section is poor, need to be more developed and more referenced.  
Only three references are few.

\*\*\* introduction has been improved and 12 references have been cited.

• The aim of the case report should be clearly mentioned

\*\*\* The aim has been clearly mentioned as "We aim to share our clinical experience and outcomes of this rare dislocation in order to improve clinical understanding of TTD."

Case presentation • This section is inexistent and need to be more developed, especially in that related to the "history of past illness" and "Laboratory examinations" subsections.  
Please give more information

\*\*\* Case presentation title has been added. Required information has been added in "history of past illness" and "Laboratory examinations" subtitles.

Discussion • This section is unclear and confusing, and need to be re-written as follows:  
o The major finding of the current study o Comparison with previous findings o  
Strengths and limitations of the study o Conclusion

\*\*\*\* Discussion section has been re-written with appropriate care requested to the subtitles  
a)The major finding of the current study b)Comparison with previous findings c)



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://** www.wjgnet.com

Strengths and limitations of the study d) Conclusion

#### INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

##### *Google Search:*

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

##### *BPG Search:*

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Clinical Cases

**Manuscript NO:** 46209

**Title:** Open Reduction Of A Total Talar Dislocation After Unsuccessful Closed Reduction In The Emergency Room Due To A Fractured Medial Malleolus Blocking Relocation: A Case Report And Literature Review

**Reviewer's code:** 00123524

**Reviewer's country:** Brazil

**Science editor:** Fang-Fang Ji

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2019-03-26 12:46

**Reviewer performed review:** 2019-04-02 00:16

**Review time:** 6 Days and 11 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

#### SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting case report about a rare orthopaedic condition. The authors' main argument regarding the importance of this case report is that in cases where closed reduction of total talar dislocation is not possible, open reduction may be associated with good prognosis. I have a few comments to share with the authors regarding their manuscript and sincerely hope that my humble comments be helpful.

1. I believe the manuscript requires some degree of English polishing. For example, the authors built some sentences which are unusual in English such as "The patient had a free previous medical history". They probably mean that the patient's previous medical history was unremarkable.

\*\*\* The manuscript has been edited with professional care "editage.com"

Editing certificate has been added to this reviewer response letter.



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

## CERTIFICATE OF ENGLISH EDITING

This document certifies that the paper listed below has been edited to ensure that the language is clear and free of errors. The logical presentation of ideas and the structure of the paper were also checked during the editing process. The edit was performed by professional editors at Editage, a division of Cactus Communications. The intent of the author's message was not altered in any way during the editing process. The quality of the edit has been guaranteed, with the assumption that our suggested changes have been accepted and have not been further altered without the knowledge of our editors.

### TITLE OF THE PAPER

Correspondence to: Furkan Yapici, MD

### AUTHORS

furkan yapici

### JOB CODE

FUYAP\_3\_3



Signature

*Vikas Narang*

Vikas Narang,  
Senior Vice President,  
Operations-Author Services, Editage

Date of Issue  
May 03, 2019

Editage, a brand of Cactus Communications, offers professional English language editing and publication support services to authors engaged in over 500 areas of research. Through its community of experienced editors, which includes doctors, engineers, published scientists, and researchers with peer review experience, Editage has successfully helped authors get published in internationally reputed journals. Authors who work with Editage are guaranteed excellent language quality and timely delivery.



**CACTUS**



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://www.wjgnet.com**

2. The authors abbreviated “Total Dislocation of the Talus” as TTD instead of TDT. Although I agree that TTD is the usual abbreviation for this condition, it should stand as the abbreviation of “Total Talar Dislocation”.

\*\*\* Revised according to your suggestions.

3. The “Outcome and follow-up” section of the manuscript cites the absence of Hawkins’ sign but provides no information regarding the occurrence of avascular necrosis, which is only mentioned in the discussion section.

\*\*\* Hawkins sign has been added, detailed, and cited in the “Outcome and follow-up” section.

4. I also believe that the discussion section should describe the meaning of the Hawkins’ sign and its absence as a prognostic marker for avascular necrosis. See for instance the article available in the following link: <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/17805020>

\*\*\* Revised according to your suggestions.

5. The literature review requires much improvement. There is scarce quantitative information regarding several features of previous case reports of TTD, which is essential to put the present case report into context. Additionally, the authors did not make any reference to a systematic review of 86 cases of TTD that was published in 2015 by Weston et al (<https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/26033988>).

\*\*\* The literature review has been enlarged, more references have been added. Weston’s systematic review has been added to the manuscript.

## INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

### *Google Search:*

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

### *BPG Search:*

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No



10.05.19 2<sup>nd</sup> review:

**Special comments from the editor:**

**We are editing the paper, there are problems as below:**

**1 Ref 15 repeat with ref 7, please correct it.**

**\*\*\*References have been corrected.**

**2 About figures 1 and 2, please provide the decomposable figure, whose separate parts are movable and words can be edited.**

**\*\*\*Decomposable Figures 1 and 2 have been added.**

**Please make changes on 46209-Review file, you can download it from the system.**

**\*\*\*Reviewer response file has been edited.**