

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 46209

Title: Open reduction of a total talar dislocation: A case report and review of literature

Reviewer's code: 02990500

Reviewer's country: Lebanon

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-03-26 06:20

Reviewer performed review: 2019-03-26 12:50

Review time: 6 Hours

| SCIENTIFIC QUALITY | LANGUAGE QUALITY | CONCLUSION | PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS |
|---|---|---|---------------------------------------|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept | Peer-Review: |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language | (High priority) | <input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept | <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of | (General priority) | Peer-reviewer's expertise on the |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not | language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision | topic of the manuscript: |
| publish | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision | <input type="checkbox"/> Advanced |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection | <input type="checkbox"/> General |
| | | | <input type="checkbox"/> No expertise |
| | | | Conflicts-of-Interest: |
| | | | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes |
| | | | <input type="checkbox"/> No |

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Title • The title is too long, should be shortened and clarified **Introduction** • This section is poor, need to be more developed and more referenced. Only three references are few. • The aim of the case report should be clearly mentioned **Case presentation** • This section is inexistent and need to be more developed, especially in



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

that related to the “history of past illness” and “Laboratory examinations” subsections.
Please give more information Discussion • This section is unclear and confusing,
and need to be re-written as follows: o The major finding of the current study o
Comparison with previous findings o Strengths and limitations of the study o
Conclusion

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ [Y] No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ [Y] No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 46209

Title: Open reduction of a total talar dislocation: A case report and review of literature

Reviewer's code: 00123524

Reviewer's country: Brazil

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-03-26 12:46

Reviewer performed review: 2019-04-02 00:16

Review time: 6 Days and 11 Hours

| SCIENTIFIC QUALITY | LANGUAGE QUALITY | CONCLUSION | PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS |
|---|---|---|---------------------------------------|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept | Peer-Review: |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language | (High priority) | <input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept | <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of | (General priority) | Peer-reviewer's expertise on the |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not | language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision | topic of the manuscript: |
| publish | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision | <input type="checkbox"/> Advanced |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection | <input type="checkbox"/> General |
| | | | <input type="checkbox"/> No expertise |
| | | | Conflicts-of-Interest: |
| | | | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes |
| | | | <input type="checkbox"/> No |

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting case report about a rare orthopaedic condition. The authors' main argument regarding the importance of this case report is that in cases where closed reduction of total talar dislocation is not possible, open reduction may be associated with good prognosis. I have a few comments to share with the authors regarding their

manuscript and sincerely hope that my humble comments be helpful. 1. I believe the manuscript requires some degree of English polishing. For example, the authors built some sentences which are unusual in English such as “The patient had a free previous medical history”. They probably mean that the patient’s previous medical history was unremarkable. 2. The authors abbreviated “Total Dislocation of the Talus” as TTD instead of TDT. Although I agree that TTD is the usual abbreviation for this condition, it should stand as the abbreviation of “Total Talar Dislocation”. 3. The “Outcome and follow-up” section of the manuscript cites the absence of Hawkins’ sign but provides no information regarding the occurrence of avascular necrosis, which is only mentioned in the discussion section. 4. I also believe that the discussion section should describe the meaning of the Hawkins’ sign and its absence as a prognostic marker for avascular necrosis. See for instance the article available in the following link: <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/17805020> 5. The literature review requires much improvement. There is scarce quantitative information regarding several features of previous case reports of TTD, which is essential to put the present case report into context. Additionally, the authors did not make any reference to a systematic review of 86 cases of TTD that was published in 2015 by Weston et al (<https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/26033988>).

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No