

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Nephrology

Manuscript NO: 46234

Title: A rare presentation of spontaneous atheroembolic renal disease: A case report

Reviewer's code: 00503175

Reviewer's country: Croatia

Science editor: Ying Dou

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-02-12 18:21

Reviewer performed review: 2019-02-13 05:59

Review time: 11 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Article „AN UNUSUAL CASE OF SPONTANEOUS ATHEROEMBOLIC RENAL DISEASE (AERD) MIMICKING ANCA-ASSOCIATED GLOMERULONEPHRITIS (GN)“ by Paramarajan Piranavan et al. according to my opinion need revisions before publication. Minor revisions: a) In the title authors put two abbreviations but



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

usually there is no place for abbreviations in the title, b) In the section „Abstract“ authors put abbreviation (AERD) but without explanation. c) The literature is not written in the unique and consistent way. Otherwise the article is interesting for those involved in the management of kidney disease.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Nephrology

Manuscript NO: 46234

Title: A rare presentation of spontaneous atheroembolic renal disease: A case report

Reviewer's code: 00503257

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Ying Dou

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-02-12 08:24

Reviewer performed review: 2019-02-14 00:58

Review time: 1 Day and 16 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This case report describing AERD with serum cANCA positivity noted by chance is somewhat potentially interesting. However, several concerns are arisen. 1. I understand the reported patient with AERD showed serum cANCA positivity. However, it is unclear how the cANCA positivity influence her clinical status. Was cANCA positivity



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

really involved in the pathogenesis in this patient? This issue should be clearly described. 2. Did the serum titer of cANCA decrease following immunosuppressive therapy? Sequential changes in serum titer of cANCA in this patient should be represented. 3. The discussion section remained irrelevant. Original description contained so many unnecessary general information. This section should focus on the authors' novel observation and speculation. Thus, whole volume of discussion section should be reduced and rewritten. 4. In abstract section, the description of the conclusion was unlikely.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Nephrology

Manuscript NO: 46234

Title: A rare presentation of spontaneous atheroembolic renal disease: A case report

Reviewer's code: 00503182

Reviewer's country: Egypt

Science editor: Ying Dou

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-02-12 12:19

Reviewer performed review: 2019-02-14 06:58

Review time: 1 Day and 18 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

There is missing one reference, Please check all references on pubmed. Authors sometimes used capital letter in the body of statements !!!! Check again Unneeded abbreviations should be cancelled



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Nephrology

Manuscript NO: 46234

Title: A rare presentation of spontaneous atheroembolic renal disease: A case report

Reviewer's code: 00502999

Reviewer's country: Argentina

Science editor: Ying Dou

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-02-12 09:59

Reviewer performed review: 2019-02-14 22:25

Review time: 2 Days and 12 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The topic of the manuscript is interesting. Major concerns: The Case Report description is too long and non contributory in some instances. Units (creatinine for instance) are missing. Words like didn't are colloquial and have no place in a paper. "...of patient to lie flat". Why do not use the word orthopnea in this situation?. Please delete words as "lab".

Discussion is too long and diverted. Authors mention "inactive IgA nephropathy changes"...What on earth does that term mean at all?....How can we tell IgAN is inactive from the histopathology?....Oxford classification does not address those concepts, which are impossible to assess with routine histologic techniques. Patient had eosinophilia. Please introduce this laboratory finding to the discussion and the prevalence in AERD. What do authors mean by AERD being a spectrum of kidney diseases?. I do not agree. Why do authors think the patient had an elevated ANCA titer?. How can they link a positive ANCA titer with a thromboembolic event?. What is the role the damaged endothelium may play in both situations so as to present with ANCA positivity?. Was the vascular inflammation evaluated in the kidney biopsy?. References do not follow WJN instructions. Figure 1 is non-contributory.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Nephrology

Manuscript NO: 46234

Title: A rare presentation of spontaneous atheroembolic renal disease: A case report

Reviewer's code: 00503254

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Ying Dou

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-02-14 05:30

Reviewer performed review: 2019-02-21 02:55

Review time: 6 Days and 21 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this manuscript, the authors report on an unusual case of spontaneous atheroembolic renal disease (AERD) mimicking ANCA-associated glomerulonephritis. This paper is clinically interesting, but one point need to be addressed. Minor comment: The authors should describe the influence of ANCA on the onset of AERD in this case.



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No