

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Meta-Analysis

Manuscript NO: 46535

Title: PD-1/PD- antagonists in gastric cancer: Current studies and perspectives

Reviewer's code: 03024187

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-02-19 15:35

Reviewer performed review: 2019-02-22 17:50

Review time: 3 Days and 2 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In the present manuscript, Li and co-authors reviewed recent progress in the use of the PD-1/PD-L1 checkpoint inhibitors in gastric cancer. The attention the immunotherapy application in cancer treatment is constantly increasing based successful results obtained in several tumours, but further nvestigation on new targets ar For this reasons the topic



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

of the manuscript is actual in the field. The concept outlined in the review are pertinent, but the English language form is often incorrect. In particular, several time the verb form is not appropriate, generating a misunderstanding of the text. Poor attention has been pay in the written form (i.e. punctuation and English form) and revision of the text by a native English speaker is strongly recommended. Other points to be revised: -In the text check the acronyms "PD-1/PD-L1" that are quite often alone. Please add the annotation "checkpoint","checkpoint inhibitors" or "axis" to the acronyms when appropriate. - The sentence " Evading immune destruction is one of the hallmarks in cancer illustrated by Robert A. Weinberg(2)." should be "Evading immune destruction is one of the hallmarks in cancer illustrated by Hanahan and Weinberg(2).", because the authors of the paper are two. - In the text and in the abstract as well, several times the "-ing" verb form is not correctly used. e.g. "The immunological checkpoint molecules including programmed cell death-1 (PD-1) and cytotoxic T lymphocyte-associated antigen-4 (CTLA-4).". - Please rephrase the sentence: "Due to the lack of specific symptoms and signs in the early stage, most patients diagnosed with gastric cancer at the advanced stage, which seriously affects the prognosis of patients.". - "...possible combination of conventional therapy with PD-1/PD-L1 inhibitors." Should be "....possible combination with conventional therapy with PD-1/PD-L1 inhibitors.". - "As a significant member of the B7/CD28 co-stimulatory molecule superfamily, PD-1 primarily expressed on the surface of activated T and B cells. Both the PD-L1.." should be "....PD-1 is primarily expressed". - I have not list all the mistakes. Please carefully check the text!

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

[] The same title



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<https://www.wjgnet.com>

☐ Duplicate publication

☐ Plagiarism

☐ No

BPG Search:

☐ The same title

☐ Duplicate publication

☐ Plagiarism

☐ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Meta-Analysis

Manuscript NO: 46535

Title: PD-1/PD- Y antagonists in gastric cancer: Current studies and perspectives

Reviewer's code: 00717554

Reviewer's country: Netherlands

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-03-10 09:03

Reviewer performed review: 2019-03-10 09:14

Review time: 1 Hour

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I would like to mention the following comments: 1- Title: Abbreviation of "PD-1/PD-L1" must be explained. 2- Title: Recent progress of What? Progress of knowledge/therapy/... about the effects of PD-1/PD-L1 or ...? 3- Title: It must show that this article is a review. 4- Introduction: The first sentence needs a reference. 5-



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

Immediately, after introduction, subtitles have been started, without any connecting sentences to explain the next subtitles. Good Luck

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Meta-Analysis

Manuscript NO: 46535

Title: PD-1/PD- Y antagonists in gastric cancer: Current studies and perspectives

Reviewer's code: 02462252

Reviewer's country: Canada

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-03-11 10:44

Reviewer performed review: 2019-03-11 10:47

Review time: 1 Hour

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a timely overview of the topic. I would like the authors to emphasize the interpretation of the staining of gastric and OG junction cancers for the antibodies which are drug dependent. What antibodies should be used and how should the staining be scored in histologic slides? Also please look at grammar and spelling in the manuscript.



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ [Y] No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ [Y] No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Meta-Analysis

Manuscript NO: 46535

Title: PD-1/PD- Y antagonists in gastric cancer: Current studies and perspectives

Reviewer's code: 02994003

Reviewer's country: Egypt

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-02-18 07:16

Reviewer performed review: 2019-03-12 06:23

Review time: 21 Days and 23 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This review is well written and focused on important area of cancer immunotherapy, based on human monoclonal antibodies. It was better if authors added one or more figure (s) showing the mechanism and hypothesis of action of these therapeutic antibodies



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ [Y] No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ [Y] No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Meta-Analysis

Manuscript NO: 46535

Title: PD-1/PD- antagonists in gastric cancer: Current studies and perspectives

Reviewer's code: 03731607

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-03-11 00:39

Reviewer performed review: 2019-03-18 02:29

Review time: 7 Days and 1 Hour

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors provide a brief review of PD-1 and PD-L1 inhibitors in gastric cancer. While they do a nice job summarizing the literature and providing some direction for future investigations I have the following concerns about the manuscript 1) The manuscript needs secondary review by a native speaker. There are abundant

grammatical and word choice errors that detract from the manuscript 2) ORR is objective response rate. At one point in the manuscript it is defined as the overall survival rate. Also it does not need to be spelled out each time. After the first time it is spelled out, it is acceptable to use the abbreviated form throughout the manuscript 3) The authors talk about PD-1/PD-L1 positivity as a biomarker for response to PD-1 blockade, however the authors need to discuss the discrepancies in how PD-1 is measured and the issues of cutoff values for "positive" and "negative". furthermore, given the uneven expression of PD-1 in tumor cell populations small needle biopsies may not give an accurate representation of true PD-1 density. Lastly, the authors need to discuss that PD-1 negative patients can still respond to anti-PD-1/PD-L1 therapy and a substantial proportion of PD-1 positive tumors do not respond. Therefore, the authors need to discuss other biomarkers such as deficiencies in mismatch repair (MMR), tumor mutational burden, RNA expression 4) The authors briefly touched on combinational therapies as a future direction. I would recommend expanding this paragraph to include concurrent checkpoint inhibitors and radiation as well. 5) When mentioning chemotherapy for gastric cancer in 2019, one has to include paclitaxel. Please include this in your introduction. 6) The authors state PD-1 may be diagnostic. I think what is meant is predictive or response to therapy with anti-PD-1/PD-L1 therapy. The authors further suggest that because PD-1 expression is correlated with advanced stage that it could be used as for diagnosis of metastasis. This is not supported by the data. It may be a independent prognostic factor associated with advanced gastric cancer but would not really be a diagnostic test for metastasis.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

[] The same title



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

☐ Duplicate publication

☐ Plagiarism

☐ No

BPG Search:

☐ The same title

☐ Duplicate publication

☐ Plagiarism

☐ No