



**PEER-REVIEW REPORT**

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Meta-Analysis

**Manuscript NO:** 46560

**Title:** Prospects for immunotherapy as a novel therapeutic strategy against hepatocellular carcinoma

**Reviewer’s code:** 02904354

**Reviewer’s country:** China

**Science editor:** Fang-Fang Ji

**Date sent for review:** 2019-02-20

**Date reviewed:** 2019-02-27

**Review time:** 3 Hours, 7 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer’s expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

**SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

The authors had experiences in cancer immunotherapy, especially GPC3 related immunotherapy. They should be congratulated. Some issues needed to be revised before publication. The authors introduced lots of unpublished results. They are of



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://www.wjgnet.com**

uncertainty. The manuscript is not carefully prepared. The errors are readily observed. "Systemic chemotherapy and has been ..." "Liver cirrhosis often create a ..." Some words are unclear. The authors said "Based on these results, large-scale clinical trials of tremelimumab against HCC were not conducted. " However, why were the large-scale clinical trials of tremelimumab against HCC not conducted? The authors did not clarify. Additionally, in the paragraph of 4-2. Anti-CTLA-4 antibody, the authors said "Instead, clinical trials for a novel combination therapy that combines anti-PD1/PD-L1 antibodies is underway in patients with advanced HCC." The words are seemingly wrongly placed. Some perspectives are wrong. "Sorafenib, an inhibitor of tyrosine kinase, is the only molecular targeted drug against HCC that is approved by the Food and Drug Administration (FDA)". Other inhibitors of tyrosine kinase approved should be learned. Some perspectives can be improved. The authors said "Many standard therapies are considered for HCC treatment today, including surgical therapy, radiofrequency ablation therapy (RFA), transarterial embolization (TAE), and systemic chemotherapy. Surgical hepatic resection is considered as ideal for early-stage HCC patients..." Please see a recent publication to overview all meta-analysis regarding management of HCC (PMID: 27167195). This overview suggests that systemic chemotherapy is not considered as the standard therapy for HCC and that RFA and surgical resection seem to have comparable outcomes. Please learn the reference and improve your perspectives. Some sentences could be improved, "...immunotherapy is a promising strategy for HCC therapy". "...survival prognosis..." A scheme regarding mechanisms of immunotherapy for HCC should be drawn to increase the publication possibility.

#### **INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT**

##### ***Google Search:***

[ ] The same title



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243  
**E-mail:** [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)  
**https://**[www.wjgnet.com](http://www.wjgnet.com)

Duplicate publication

Plagiarism

No

***BPG Search:***

The same title

Duplicate publication

Plagiarism

No



**PEER-REVIEW REPORT**

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Meta-Analysis

**Manuscript NO:** 46560

**Title:** Prospects for immunotherapy as a novel therapeutic strategy against hepatocellular carcinoma

**Reviewer’s code:** 02438768

**Reviewer’s country:** China

**Science editor:** Fang-Fang Ji

**Date sent for review:** 2019-02-20

**Date reviewed:** 2019-03-01

**Review time:** 21 Hours, 8 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer’s expertise on the topic of the manuscript:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> General
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

**SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

Comments for ESPS Manuscript NO 46560 As an alternative therapy, immunotherapy has achieved great success in many different cancer types. In particular, with the approval of immunological checkpoint inhibitors, the prospects for immunotherapy



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://**www.wjgnet.com

have changed dramatically. This review is interesting. The followings are my several major and minor concerns. Major concerns: 1.The authors should provide a clear and concise introduction. 2.The authors described the results of those unpublished analyses and consider them as evidence for immunotherapy. Indeed, the authors are only allowed to state concrete evidence in this manuscript. 3.In patients with HCC, the expression of PD-L1 in tumour tissue and the expression of tumour-infiltrating lymphocytes have not been reportedly associated with the efficacy of immunotherapy. The authors should address these facts in this manuscript. 4.The authors should address the problems and challenges of immunotherapy in this manuscript. For example, immunotherapy is not effective in all patients with HCC; how to promote the activation of T cells, improve the killing power and proliferation efficiency of immune cells on tumors, reduce the side effects of drugs on the liver. Minor concerns: Minor language polishing is needed.

#### **INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT**

##### ***Google Search:***

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

##### ***BPG Search:***

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No