

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology

Manuscript NO: 46684

Title: Detection and management of oligometastatic disease in oesophageal cancer and identification of prognostic factors: systematic review

Reviewer's code: 03270518

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-03-26 16:00

Reviewer performed review: 2019-04-02 19:48

Review time: 7 Days and 3 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1) Please explain the reason of your definition of oligometastasis. 2) The data of the literature Search don't corresponde to those of the Figure 1. 3) In the text the reference 27 is actually the 26. 4) in the results the Authors don't report the "p" of statistical analysis;



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

if the p is cited in the original study, it should be reported. 5) In the discussion the Authors should report that pulmonary metastasectomy can be efficacious also in the gastric cancer. 6)The Authors should consider only the squamous cancer. 7)There isn't the referencen. 15. 8)The Table 4 is illegible.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology

Manuscript NO: 46684

Title: Detection and management of oligometastatic disease in oesophageal cancer and identification of prognostic factors: systematic review

Reviewer's code: 03728442

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-03-30 08:40

Reviewer performed review: 2019-04-22 08:44

Review time: 23 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This article systematically reviews the available literature regarding oligometastatic oesophageal cancer, a clinical entity whose management represents a challenge in daily practice. In my opinion, the present manuscript provides a valuable and useful



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

contribution to the current knowledge on the topic. Following, some comments and suggestions to possibly improve the quality of the article: 1) The starting date of the electronic search for relevant articles should be included, both in the Abstract and the Methods. 2) Differences in definition, if any, between “time to recurrence” and “disease-free interval” should be specified as the information reported in the Abstract regarding their prognostic value seems redundant. 3) My understanding is that patients experiencing loco-regional relapse were not included in the analysis: if so, please specify this in the Methods section. 4) As the vast majority of the included studies involve metachronous disease, it is possible to know more regarding the pattern of recurrence by site and potential pretreatment factors affecting the likelihood of recurrence? 5) When citing the FLOT-3 trial in the Discussion, it is important to mention also perioperative chemotherapy in addition to surgery since the study investigated a multimodality approach. 6) Clinical heterogeneity together with the inclusion of Asian-predominant studies should also be discussed as limitations of the present article.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☒ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

[Y] No