



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 46861

Title: Liver transplantation for hepatocellular carcinoma: Where do we stand?

Reviewer's code: 00008736

Reviewer's country: Germany

Science editor: Jia-Ping Yan

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-03-01 09:11

Reviewer performed review: 2019-03-03 11:01

Review time: 2 Days and 1 Hour

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors provide a concise but complete and up to date review on current Status of liver Transplantation for the Treatment of HCC. They compare the currently used staging Systems and provide a good overview on bridging strategies as well as strategies to reduce Tumor recurrence. The article is well written and only small language and



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

typo corrections are needed. While the authors mostly Focus on known and currently applied clinical Parameters, a perspective on the use of biomarkers (e.g. for Patient selection, bridging strategies and the immunologic Features associated with recurrence) would be very interesting and strengthen the paper (i.e. biomarkers beyond AFP and clinical Parameters like microvessel Invasion).

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 46861

Title: Liver transplantation for hepatocellular carcinoma: Where do we stand?

Reviewer's code: 02441083

Reviewer's country: Spain

Science editor: Jia-Ping Yan

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-03-03 10:24

Reviewer performed review: 2019-03-03 16:52

Review time: 6 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a comprehensive and updated review of the role of liver transplantation in hepatocellular carcinoma (HCC), the manuscript is well structured and the message is clear. However, some points require authors attention: 1. In conclusions, the statement: "Immunosuppressive regimens using inhibitors of mTOR can play a role in the



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

prevention of recurrence after LT" is unaccurate as the own authors described in the manuscript a Phase III trial failed to show advantages (Evidence A). Please, delete or deeply modify this conclusion. 2. Table-2 is somewhat confusing. Please be explicit on the second column (Are these figures the rate of successful downstaging?. Minor points: 1. Des-gamma-carboxy prothrombin should replace dex-gamma-carboxi prothrobin 2. Centers should replace centres.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No