



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Transplantation

Manuscript NO: 47671

Title: Considerations for hematopoietic stem cell transplantation in primary immunodeficiency disorders

Reviewer's code: 02726701

Reviewer's country: Chile

Science editor: Ying Dou

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-03-24 22:20

Reviewer performed review: 2019-03-25 20:07

Review time: 21 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the topic of the manuscript:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> General
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Comments on Considerations for hematopoietic stem cell transplantation in primary immunodeficiency disorders. Introduction section Primary immunodeficiency disorders (PID) are rare diseases and is not expected that non specialist physicians know



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

them more than superficially. In this regard, it could be desirable that the author could teach us, which are those more common disorders and how do they cause disease and early mortality. In this same point, it is also desirable to briefly describe the molecular targets failing in those PID to be describe in the manuscript and what are the expected problems/difficulties expected complications transplanting hematopoietic progenitors to them shared or not with hematopioietic cell transplantation (HCT) in other diseases, like, for example, leukemia or lisosomal storage diseases. Individual diseases In the respective subtitles, it is preferably to begin with the all name, for example Severe Combined Immunodeficiency Disorders and not SCID. In HCT, as the author states, there are three main problems: (1) The disorder intended to be transplanted with HCT, (2) The donor/recipient pair, (3) the transplantation itself with its concomitant medication (radio, chemotherapy, conditioning, immunosuppression, etc) I suggest using a common approach considering the former main problems to describe each of the PID and, also for the expected natural history after the HCT, for example, T, B-cell recovery, cytokines, graft versus host disease eventuality, infectious or therapy related complications, etc. Other suggestions To perform or not HCT in specific diseases? When to proceed? When to organize a HCT program for these disorders, after local experience with malignant or nonmalignant diseases? Donor/recipient pair: Haploidentical, HLA-matched, Cord derived embryonic cells?, etc. I think that the manuscript is well written, concise and clear, but it too superficial to HCT specialists and potentially poorly understood to non-specialist physicians. To add some illustrations or tables to improve this manuscript teaching opportunity will, certainly, be welcome by all readers. The manuscript must be modified to improve the delivery of the author's experience in HCT for PID.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT



Baishideng Publishing Group

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Transplantation

Manuscript NO: 47671

Title: Considerations for hematopoietic stem cell transplantation in primary immunodeficiency disorders

Reviewer's code: 02454372

Reviewer's country: United Kingdom

Science editor: Ying Dou

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-03-25 16:32

Reviewer performed review: 2019-03-27 19:39

Review time: 2 Days and 3 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the topic of the manuscript:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> General
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a well written and comprehensive review of an ever developing field.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT



Baishideng Publishing Group

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No