



**PEER-REVIEW REPORT**

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery

**Manuscript NO:** 47711

**Title:** Use of absorbable meshes in laparoscopic paraesophageal hernia repair

**Reviewer's code:** 02728252

**Position:** Editorial Board

**Academic degree:** PhD

**Professional title:** Professor

**Reviewer's country:** Egypt

**Author's country:** Argentina

**Reviewer chosen by:** Ying Dou

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2019-06-04 12:54

**Reviewer performed review:** 2019-06-08 07:36

**Review time:** 3 Days and 18 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

**SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

It is a narrative review conducted for the evaluating the use of absorbable mesh in



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://www.wjgnet.com**

laparoscopic paraesophageal hernia repair. The review is interesting but it lack the integration and need some modernization by adding figures, tables, methodology (databases searched) to be more systemically organized. In addition, English language editing is mandatory.

#### **INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT**

##### ***Google Search:***

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

##### ***BPG Search:***

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No



**PEER-REVIEW REPORT**

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery

**Manuscript NO:** 47711

**Title:** Use of absorbable meshes in laparoscopic paraesophageal hernia repair

**Reviewer's code:** 02549888

**Position:** Editorial Board

**Academic degree:** DNB, FRCS (Gen Surg), MBBS, MNAMS

**Professional title:** Full Professor

**Reviewer's country:** India

**Author's country:** Argentina

**Reviewer chosen by:** Ying Dou

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2019-05-30 12:28

**Reviewer performed review:** 2019-06-12 13:39

**Review time:** 13 Days and 1 Hour

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

**SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

Title: Apt. Abstract: satisfactory. Introduction: Good Discussion: Needs adequate



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://www.wjgnet.com**

correlation. Tables summarizing the various studies and their results would have been better and added to the quality of the article. Conclusion: Adequate

#### **INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT**

##### ***Google Search:***

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

##### ***BPG Search:***

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No