

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 47913

Title: Clinical characteristics of young patients with early Barrett's neoplasia

Reviewer's code: 00036194

Reviewer's country: Australia

Science editor: Jia-Ping Yan

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-04-03 05:10

Reviewer performed review: 2019-04-05 02:24

Review time: 1 Day and 21 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I realise that your study was retrospective but, in future, a validated reflux questionnaire would be appropriate to determine frequency and severity of reflux symptoms

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 47913

Title: Clinical characteristics of young patients with early Barrett's neoplasia

Reviewer's code: 03259368

Reviewer's country: Germany

Science editor: Jia-Ping Yan

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-04-03 10:05

Reviewer performed review: 2019-04-06 18:09

Review time: 3 Days and 8 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors present an interesting study and should be commended for their work. Iwaya Y et al. aim to assess Early Barrett's neoplasia in young patients. This study adds to the literature. The topic is very interesting and important. I do agree with the conclusion of the paper based on their results. The paper is well structured and well



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

written. I have minor comments: The paper has no comparison group and is purely descriptive. This has been clearly addressed in the discussion. Smoking is protective in the multivariate analysis. Please comment. I suggest acceptance after addressing these minor comments. Congratulations to this paper.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☒ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☒ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 47913

Title: Clinical characteristics of young patients with early Barrett's neoplasia

Reviewer's code: 02535775

Reviewer's country: Turkey

Science editor: Jia-Ping Yan

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-04-01 10:40

Reviewer performed review: 2019-04-09 12:59

Review time: 8 Days and 2 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

To Authors, The article titled "Ongoing GERD symptoms and obesity are more common among patients with early Barrett's neoplasia under 50 years of age" was reviewed. This study has been giving us clear results about the importance of early diagnosis of Barrett's esophagus and Esophageal Adenocarcinoma in people who are younger than



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

50 years of age. On the other hand, it creates a new perspective for guidelines. This study deserves to publishing in priority.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 47913

Title: Clinical characteristics of young patients with early Barrett's neoplasia

Reviewer's code: 02908500

Reviewer's country: Romania

Science editor: Jia-Ping Yan

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-04-02 20:11

Reviewer performed review: 2019-04-18 19:59

Review time: 15 Days and 23 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The paper entitled: ``Ongoing GERD symptoms and obesity are more common among patients with early Barrett's neoplasia under 50 years of age`` is a very nice paper. It has a good number of patients but it is retrospective and the follow-up period is not so long. Why it was the follow-up only one year? However, the results are interesting. I have



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

some specific comments. In the group of patients >50 years there a lot of those with diabetes and hypertension, two conditions which associate dyslipidemia. How do you interpret in table 1 the result for treatment with statins? Are there a relationship between GERD, Barrett's neoplasia and the treatment with statins?

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 47913

Title: Clinical characteristics of young patients with early Barrett's neoplasia

Reviewer's code: 00038340

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Jia-Ping Yan

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-04-02 17:38

Reviewer performed review: 2019-04-22 05:36

Review time: 19 Days and 11 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a well written manuscript summarizing the findings of a retrospective analysis of a prospectively maintained database comprised of consecutive patients with early-stage esophageal and high grade dysplasia at a tertiary-referral center between 2001 and 2017. The conclusion of the paper is to recommend BE screening in patients <50 years of age, if

they suffer from obesity and GERD symptoms. The findings that obesity is linked to Barrett's or neoplasia in younger patients has been reported previously (Assessment of familiarity, obesity, and other risk factors for early age of cancer diagnosis in adenocarcinomas of the esophagus and gastroesophageal junction. Chak A1, Falk G, Grady WM, Kinnard M, Elston R, Mittal S, King JF, Willis JE, Kondru A, Brock W, Barnholtz-Sloan J-AJ Gastroenterology 2009). The additional observation is that younger patients tend to suffer from GERD more frequently than older patients. One of the possibilities mentioned in the paper to explain the observed increases in BE and esophageal neoplasia is the eradication of H pylori. Did the patients in the study undergo H pylori testing or treatment? It would have been informative to know. The long term follow up of patients is also lacking and the final outcome of the differences between old and young patients is unknown. There is no mention about morbidity and mortality (may be because the follow up was only for 1 year although the population was followed over 16 years) Minor comments: Page 11 "Indeed, our data revealed that the percentage of young early-stage EAC/HGD patients was significant (10%). Please specify that the percentage is in your patient population. Page 10: "Figure 1" should be Table 1 Page 6 : "Early-stage stage". Delete stage

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https:// www.wjgnet.com

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No