

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology

**Manuscript NO:** 49282

**Title:** Cryoablation combined with radiotherapy for hepatic malignancy: Five case reports

**Reviewer's code:** 02860871

**Position:** Editorial Board

**Academic degree:** MD, MSc, PhD

**Professional title:** Research Scientist, Senior Lecturer

**Reviewer's country:** Indonesia

**Author's country:** China

**Reviewer chosen by:** Ying Dou

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2019-09-09 06:23

**Reviewer performed review:** 2019-09-12 04:54

**Review time:** 2 Days and 22 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

## SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This article entitled “Cryoablation combined with radiotherapy for hepatic malignancy: five cases reports” by Liu Ye et al is interesting in its field. The authors reported 5 cases of advanced-stage hepatic malignancies and analyzed a comprehensive program of cryoablation combined with radiotherapy for the treatment of hepatic malignancies. This article is well written with few typos inside. Here are some comments : 1. It would be better if authors provide a comprehensive table consisting those 5 cases and the differences 2. In the abstract authors mentioned the quality of life of the patient was significantly improved and the survival was prolonged while there is no criteria/definition or statistic test about the quality of life / prolonged survival were mentioned 3. In the abstract’s conclusion, author mentioned cryoablation combined with IMRT is a safe and effective treatment for hepatic malignancies. This conclusion is too far because no statistics finding and this study has only 5 case studies and 2 of them were death. 4. Please provide a structured description for each case

#### **INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT**

##### ***Google Search:***

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

##### ***BPG Search:***

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No