



**PEER-REVIEW REPORT**

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Methodology

**Manuscript NO:** 50615

**Title:** DNA extraction from archived hematoxylin and eosin stained tissue slides for downstream molecular analysis

**Reviewer's code:** 00504167

**Position:** Editorial Board

**Academic degree:** MD,N/ A

**Professional title:** Associate Professor

**Reviewer's country:** Italy

**Science editor:** Ruo-Yu Ma

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2019-08-13 07:36

**Reviewer performed review:** 2019-08-13 09:12

**Review time:** 1 Hour

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

**SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

"DNA extraction from archived H&E stained tissue slides for downstream molecular



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://**www.wjgnet.com

analysis" by Pushkal et al. In this manuscript, the authors describe several protocols for the extraction of high quality DNA from FFPE tissues that could be used for downstream molecular analysis. The authors identified two protocols that perform best in terms of DNA yield and DNA quality. The protocols suggested in this work are particularly suitable in settings where the resources for buying standardized kits are limited.

#### **INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT**

##### ***Google Search:***

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

##### ***BPG Search:***

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No



**PEER-REVIEW REPORT**

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Methodology

**Manuscript NO:** 50615

**Title:** DNA extraction from archived hematoxylin and eosin stained tissue slides for downstream molecular analysis

**Reviewer's code:** 03976790

**Position:** Editorial Board

**Academic degree:** DSc,PhD

**Professional title:** Full Professor

**Reviewer's country:** France

**Science editor:** Ruo-Yu Ma

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2019-08-13 08:45

**Reviewer performed review:** 2019-08-14 09:06

**Review time:** 1 Day

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

**SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

The manuscript entitled: "DNA extraction from archived H&E stained tissue slides for



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://www.wjgnet.com**

downstream molecular analysis" is about an interesting study concerning the extraction of genes in formaline preserved and hemaalum-eosin stained tissues from medical collections. This study is useful for the study of old pathological histological samples belonging to medical collections, in order to provide new elements about pathologies. This method can also be useful for the study of animal and vegetal samples tocked in meseum collections. The study is well done, and I have only minor remarks to do. 1. In the title, it would be useful to specify "formaline-preserved tissues",because it exists a lot of tissue samples preserved in other fixatives such as alcohol,-formaline, Bouin's fluid, Carnoy's fluid... 2. Centrifugation speeds must be given in g number, not rpm (rpm depends on the model of centrifuge); specify also the "maximum speed". 3. In "de-staining and ethanol regulation" (pages 6-7), specify the reference of mineral oil used, for it is rhe first time at which mineral oil appears in the text. 4. In the discussion, a sentence generalizi g this kind of method to the tissues fixed with another fixative and stained with other dyes could open the field of investigations.

#### **INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT**

##### ***Google Search:***

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

##### ***BPG Search:***

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA

**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242

**E-mail:** [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)

**https://**[www.wjgnet.com](http://www.wjgnet.com)

[Y] No