

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 51812

Title: Iron metabolism imbalance at the time of listing increases overall and infectious mortality after liver transplantation

Reviewer's code: 03998375

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MBChB, MSc

Professional title: Assistant Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Iraq

Author's Country/Territory: France

Manuscript submission date: 2019-12-30

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-12-30 18:59

Reviewer performed review: 2020-01-12 22:09

Review time: 13 Days and 3 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

PATIENTS AND METHODS I was mentioned in methods that the study included patients who underwent liver transplantation between January 2001 and December 2011. For how long after last one liver transplantation (December 2011) follow up has been performed? **RESULTS** What types of infections that caused mortality after liver transplantation? There is no data in this regard.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 51812

Title: Iron metabolism imbalance at the time of listing increases overall and infectious mortality after liver transplantation

Reviewer's code: 03648851

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: N/A

Professional title: N/A

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Japan

Author's Country/Territory: France

Manuscript submission date: 2019-12-30

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-12-31 01:28

Reviewer performed review: 2020-01-13 04:02

Review time: 13 Days and 2 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Fallet et al., find that imbalance of iron metabolism in patients with liver disease is involved in mortality after liver transplantation. This finding is interesting in a lot of readers in this field. However, following points should be revised before publication in this journal. 1. Author should describe in detail why the mechanism for serum iron levels are involved in mortality after LT. In discussion, although it is described "TS >75% and low SF were risk factors of overall mortality", why both lower and higher levels of iron bring low survival rate. If you consider that oxidative stress and immunosuppression are key events in understanding relationship between iron imbalance and mortality, you should measure biomarkers for evaluation of oxidative stress and immune function. 2. The groups in the figure of Kaplan Meier survival curves can not be distinguished in my PC. Please revise the figure 1 and 2.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 51812

Title: Iron metabolism imbalance at the time of listing increases overall and infectious mortality after liver transplantation

Reviewer's code: 04367131

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Doctor, Full Professor, Professor, Senior Lecturer

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Turkey

Author's Country/Territory: France

Manuscript submission date: 2019-12-30

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-12-31 06:02

Reviewer performed review: 2020-01-14 07:40

Review time: 14 Days and 1 Hour

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an important study that shows that iron metabolism has an important impact on the survival after liver transplantation. The dataset includes a large group of patients and the statistical analysis have been well studied, performed in detail. I want to congratulate the researchers for their effort. Albeit, the study seems to have two major methodological limitations that might affect the results. The first one is: Patients lost to follow up were considered to be dead. This might cause a bias since the patients might not be dead but moved to another referral center etc. This must be clarified. The second one is: There both male and female patients in the study group. It is well known that average serum ferritin levels differ a lot between man and woman. The authors might argue that most of the woman included in the study group are post menopausal: Average age of the study group is 55 [49-60.5] years. yet the difference in ferritin levels still persist after the menopause. So, it would be wiser to analyse iron status in man and woman seperarately.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

[] Plagiarism

[Y] No

RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 51812

Title: Iron metabolism imbalance at the time of listing increases overall and infectious mortality after liver transplantation

Reviewer's code: 03998375

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MBChB, MSc

Professional title: Assistant Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Iraq

Author's Country/Territory: France

Manuscript submission date: 2019-12-30

Reviewer chosen by: Ze-Mao Gong

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-04-01 14:35

Reviewer performed review: 2020-04-01 15:59

Review time: 1 Hour

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors have responded to all reviewer recommendations.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No