

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 52382

Title: Diverting colostomy is an effective and reversible option for severe hemorrhagic radiation proctopathy

Reviewer's code: 03737603

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD, MSc, PhD

Professional title: Surgeon

Reviewer's country: United Kingdom

Author's country: China

Manuscript submission date: 2019-10-30

Reviewer chosen by: Jin-Zhou Tang

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-11-10 14:46

Reviewer performed review: 2019-11-12 19:56

Review time: 2 Days and 5 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dear Editor Thank you for asking me to review the manuscript. I would like to propose the following amendment; if the authors perform intention to treat analysis of the whole sample of the 50 colostomies and compare its results with the cohort of the 14 investigated patients will present more pragmatic picture of the topic.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☒ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☒ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 52382

Title: Diverting colostomy is an effective and reversible option for severe hemorrhagic radiation proctopathy

Reviewer's code: 05225448

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Doctor

Reviewer's country: Japan

Author's country: China

Manuscript submission date: 2019-10-30

Reviewer chosen by: Jin-Zhou Tang

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-11-11 01:10

Reviewer performed review: 2019-11-18 09:56

Review time: 7 Days and 8 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Thank you for allowing me the opportunity to review the manuscript titled: "Diverting colostomy is an effective and reversible option for severe hemorrhagic radiation proctopathy." The authors report that the diverting colostomy is associated with a significantly higher bleeding remission rate than conservative treatment. They further assert that this procedure can achieve high colostomy reversal rates with improved quality of life of patients. I found this paper to be well-written and engaging; however, some points require clarification. The issues that are listed below must be addressed before the paper can be considered for publication. Sincerely, Koichi Taira
Department of Gastroenterology, Osaka City University Graduate School of Medicine
Major comments: 1. The authors need to explain the various complications associated with colostomy. 2. The authors should state, as a limitation, that EUS, MRI and anorectal manometry were all performed on patients undergoing colostomy reversal. Minor comments: 1. Please mention the number of people, n=44, in Figure 1. 2. I think that 36 cases are mistake and correctly 32 cases (Page 7, Line 3). 3. The authors mention that 13 patients presented with severe anemia and should, therefore, change 14 to 13 (Page 8, Line 7). 4. Please provide the number of patients who underwent EUS (Page 9, Line 2).

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No