

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 52417

Title: Complete response to trastuzumab and chemotherapy in recurrent urothelial bladder carcinoma with HER2 gene amplification: A case report

Reviewer's code: 00003345

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: PhD

Professional title: Professor

Reviewer's country: France

Author's country: China

Reviewer chosen by: Le Zhang

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-11-25 08:26

Reviewer performed review: 2019-11-27 09:50

Review time: 2 Days and 1 Hour

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this manuscript entitled “Complete response to trastuzumab and chemotherapy in recurrent urothelial bladder carcinoma with HER2 gene amplification: A case report” the authors report that treatment of a patient with trastuzumab in combination with chemotherapy induced a clinically complete remission for 34 months. This was associated to the decrease of serum ferritin and related to the amplification of HER2 gene (analyzed by NGS). The authors conclude that NGS as a promising tool to accurate exploration of genetic alterations could identify gene targets that help better determining which patients could more benefit from trastuzumab therapy. This study raises some questions and comments: - This study does not allow this type of conclusion. These results must be found on other patients. - It is very light like amplification of HER2 gene. Not sure that this could have an impact on HER2 activation. Normally, this type of amplification is much larger. - Table 1 and Figure 1 must be presented in a clearer form. - I do not see Figure legend for Fig 1 and 2?

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 52417

Title: Complete response to trastuzumab and chemotherapy in recurrent urothelial bladder carcinoma with HER2 gene amplification: A case report

Reviewer's code: 01560504

Position: Editor-in-Chief

Academic degree: DNB, FACS, FRCS, MBBS, MD, MNAMS

Professional title: Professor, Surgical Oncologist

Reviewer's country: India

Author's country: China

Reviewer chosen by: Le Zhang

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-12-03 01:04

Reviewer performed review: 2019-12-03 01:15

Review time: 1 Hour

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

I enjoyed reading the manuscript. A few details about the surgical management would give a complete clinical profile of the patient - 1. Why regional lymph nodes were not addressed during partial cystectomy (first surgery)? what was the margin status? 2. Why ureterocutaneostomy and not ileal conduit during second surgery? 3. What was the third surgery undertaken? 4.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☒ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☒ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 52417

Title: Complete response to trastuzumab and chemotherapy in recurrent urothelial bladder carcinoma with HER2 gene amplification: A case report

Reviewer's code: 02505493

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: DPhil

Professional title: Professor

Reviewer's country: Greece

Author's country: China

Reviewer chosen by: Le Zhang

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-12-03 04:17

Reviewer performed review: 2019-12-03 15:26

Review time: 11 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

The manuscript can be accepted for publication.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 52417

Title: Complete response to trastuzumab and chemotherapy in recurrent urothelial bladder carcinoma with HER2 gene amplification: A case report

Reviewer's code: 02446191

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MSc, PhD

Professional title: Assistant Professor

Reviewer's country: India

Author's country: China

Reviewer chosen by: Le Zhang

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-11-27 14:09

Reviewer performed review: 2019-12-04 10:00

Review time: 6 Days and 19 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

The authors have described a case of recurrent urinary bladder cancer where HER2 gene status was used as a tool for deciding treatment modality. Study highlights that patient with HER2 gene amplification tested by targeted next-generation sequencing (NGS), benefits from targeted trastuzumab. This is a case study, nevertheless many such cases are required to investigate for HER2 status before taking treatment decisions.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No