Baishideng Publishing Group

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite 160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 52524

Title: OFD1 mutation induced renal failure and polycystic kidney disease in a childhood male twins in China

Reviewer's code: 00503228
Position: Editorial Board
Academic degree: MD
Professional title: Doctor
Reviewer's country: Iran
Author's country: China
Reviewer chosen by: Jin-Lei Wang
Reviewer accepted review: 2019-11-23 14:04
Reviewer performed review: 2019-11-24 05:36
Review time: 15 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	[ ] Accept (High priority)	Peer-Review:
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] Accept (General priority)	[Y] Anonymous
[Y] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[Y] Minor revision	[ ] Onymous
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejection	[ ] Major revision	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the topic of the manuscript:
[ ] Grade E: Do not publish		[ ] Rejection	[ ] Advanced
			[Y] General
			[ ] No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			[ ] Yes
			[Y] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Baishideng Publishing Group

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite 160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

- The title isn't proper, since OFD1 mutation is supposed to make PKD and renal failure, but you better specify something specific in your cases. For example this particular missense mutation in exon 19 is not reported to my knowledge. So you may say instead "An exon 19 c.2524G>A (p. G842R) hemizygous mutation in OFD1 gene in 14 y/o Chinese male twins with PKD as the sole disease presentation' or something - Instead of using 'vs.' in giving data of the two patients better to say "&" also better to assign a number to each patient (p.1 & p.2) so a reader can distinguish differential results between the two cases. -Instead of listing all the laboratory tests in the text, you better give them in a table - Instead of stating 'no abnormal dysmorphic features' you should at least specifically name the most prevalent dismorphies like buccal, nasal, digital & intellectual problems (you may find a list in a series [doi: 10.1136/jmg.2004.027672]) - Had they any family history of renal failure/PKD in their maternal side? - You specified that "The twins are monozygotic. ". Have you confirmed it or just due to their feature similarities; - In table 1, you specify your patients as elder and younger, but they were supposed to be monozygotic twins! - "they denied ... hematuria" You should confirm with laboratory tests. - Try to find disparities in the disease presentations between the two, it is very interesting to see if the same mutation in a monozygotic twin(?) might represent different features and at what extent? - Have you not related the ankle pain to their present illness? How both of them presented the ankle pain in such a short time interval? and what was its relation to their renal signs and symptoms (have you found their renal disease by routine check or there were any complaints. If so, be very precise in giving details in a time trail.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

[ ] The same title

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite 160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

[ ] Duplicate publication

[ ] Plagiarism

[Y] No

BPG Search:

[ ] The same title

[ ] Duplicate publication

[ ] Plagiarism

[Y] No

Baishideng Publishing Group

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite 160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 52524

Title: OFD1 mutation induced renal failure and polycystic kidney disease in a childhood male twins in China

Reviewer's code: 00503254
Position: Editorial Board
Academic degree: MD, PhD
Professional title: Doctor
Reviewer's country: Japan
Author's country: China
Reviewer chosen by: Jin-Lei Wang
Reviewer accepted review: 2019-11-21 01:31
Reviewer performed review: 2019-11-25 07:10
Review time: 4 Days and 5 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
[Y] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	[Y] Accept (High priority)	Peer-Review:
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] Accept (General priority)	[Y] Anonymous
[ ] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Minor revision	[ ] Onymous
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejection	[ ] Major revision	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the topic of the manuscript:
[ ] Grade E: Do not publish		[ ] Rejection	[Y] Advanced
			[ ] General
			[ ] No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			[ ] Yes
			[Y] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite 160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

In this manuscript, the authors report rare cases of renal failure and polycystic kidney disease induced by OFD1 mutation in a childhood male twins. This case report is clinically interesting and useful. However, there is one point that needs to be addressed. Minor comment: There is a typing error. "Compliment" should be corrected to "Complement".

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

[ ] The same title

[ ] Duplicate publication

[ ] Plagiarism

[Y] No

BPG Search:

[ ] The same title

[ ] Duplicate publication

[ ] Plagiarism

[Y] No