



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 53482

Title: A systematic review on the efficacy of mesenchymal stem cells in the treatment of gastrointestinal malignancies

Reviewer's code: 02944278

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Associate Professor, Doctor, Research Assistant Professor

Reviewer's country: Italy

Author's country: China

Manuscript submission date: 2020-01-02

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-01-03 11:36

Reviewer performed review: 2020-01-12 05:36

Review time: 8 Days and 17 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Well written paper on an interesting subject

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 53482

Title: A systematic review on the efficacy of mesenchymal stem cells in the treatment of gastrointestinal malignancies

Reviewer’s code: 03478635

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: PhD

Professional title: Senior Research Fellow

Reviewer’s country: Japan

Author’s country: China

Manuscript submission date: 2020-01-02

Reviewer chosen by: Jin-Zhou Tang

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-01-16 00:32

Reviewer performed review: 2020-01-16 01:17

Review time: 1 Hour

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer’s expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting study about the efficacy of mesenchymal stem cells in the treatment of gastrointestinal malignancies.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 53482

Title: A systematic review on the efficacy of mesenchymal stem cells in the treatment of gastrointestinal malignancies

Reviewer’s code: 02567328

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: PhD

Professional title: Assistant Professor

Reviewer’s country: Italy

Author’s country: China

Manuscript submission date: 2020-01-02

Reviewer chosen by: Jin-Zhou Tang

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-01-16 16:00

Reviewer performed review: 2020-01-21 13:14

Review time: 4 Days and 21 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer’s expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this manuscript the authors carry out a systematic review on the efficacy of mesenchymal stem cells (MSCs) in the treatment of gastrointestinal malignancies. The topic is interesting but there are some criticisms: - In the text when a sentence begins with the author's name followed by et al, it is mandatory to put the name of the first author, then et al and then the reference in brackets. Instead the authors of the manuscript put the name of the last author (and not the first) followed by et al and the reference is often placed at the end of the sentence. For example the authors state "Zhang et al. found that hMSCs depressed H7402 proliferation by downregulating the mRNA level of NF- κ B [71]." Reference [71] is L. Qiao, T.-j. Zhao, F.-z. Wang, C.-l. Shan, L.-h. Ye, X.-d. Zhang, NF-kappa B downregulation may be involved the depression of tumor cell proliferation mediated by human mesenchymal stem cells, *Acta Pharmacologica Sinica* 29(3) (2008) 333-340." Zhang is the last name and not the first name and reference is at the end of sentence. The correct sentence is "Qiao et al. [71] found that hMSCs depressed H7402 proliferation by downregulating the mRNA level of NF- κ B." Please correct throughout the manuscript - In Table 1 please replace PC with pancreatic cancer and CRC with colorectal cancer. - In Table 1 it would be necessary to highlight in the title that are listed only in vitro studies. - In paragraph "MSCs" the authors state "and cord blood stem cells, which include 2 subtypes, namely, hematopoietic stem cells and MSCs". Hematopoietic stem cells and MSCs derived not only from cord blood stem cells but also and mostly from bone marrow. Please correct this sentence. - In paragraph "MSCs" the authors state "In a specific microenvironment, MSCs can differentiate into mesodermal-derived cells, such as osteoblasts, chondrocytes, adipocytes, tendon cells, and muscle cells [27]. This sentence is a repetition. Please delete. - The neural differentiation of MSC is still under discussion



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

today. It is not enough to express neuronal markers but it is necessary to have electrophysiology experiments. For this reason MSC neural differentiation it cannot be simply described with the sentence "In Liu's study, MSCs differentiated into neural stem cells and immature neurons, which specifically expressed Nestin and β -Tubulin III, respectively [30]. Doubts about the real differentiation should be highlighted by the authors - In paragraph "MSCs for gastric cancer" the authors state "BMSCs, which are a type of stem cell found in bone marrow, possess differentiation features and migration tendencies towards tumour tissues. BMSCs can release various kinds of cytokines to affect tumour growth...". Please modify the sentence because this concept has been repeated several times. - Throughout the manuscript the authors often do not indicate the species from which the stem cells derive. Please specify - The authors use the term "scholar". Please substitute this term. - In paragraph "MSCs for hepatoma" the author state "Other studies have also shown that MSCs prevent hepatoma growth via the Wnt signalling pathway." Please add references - In "Discussion" the conclusions of the authors are rather obvious and add nothing to what is already known in the literature. In this manuscript the authors list articles and report their results, but a discussion of the data of the different articles is completely missing. This makes reading difficult. - The manuscript should be rewritten considering what has been said previously. Please not only a list.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- [] The same title
- [] Duplicate publication
- [] Plagiarism
- [Y] No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No