



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Transplantation

Manuscript NO: 53953

Title: Large Riedel's Lobe and atrophic left liver in a Donor - Accept for transplant or call off?

Reviewer's code: 03755443

Position: Associate Editor

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Professor, Surgeon

Reviewer's country: Brazil

Author's country: United Kingdom

Manuscript submission date: 2020-01-05

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-01-06 08:05

Reviewer performed review: 2020-01-06 08:22

Review time: 1 Hour

| SCIENTIFIC QUALITY | LANGUAGE QUALITY | CONCLUSION | PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS |
|--|--|--|---|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept | Peer-Review: |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language | (High priority) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept | <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of | (General priority) | Peer-reviewer's expertise on the |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not | language polishing | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision | topic of the manuscript: |
| publish | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection | <input type="checkbox"/> General |
| | | | <input type="checkbox"/> No expertise |
| | | | Conflicts-of-Interest: |
| | | | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes |
| | | | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No |



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https:// www.wjgnet.com

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Well written manuscript describing useful information. Provide a better explanation of the caval anastomosis. How was it done? Provide a good drawing of the technique and explain it step-by-step.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Transplantation

Manuscript NO: 53953

Title: Large Riedel's Lobe and atrophic left liver in a Donor - Accept for transplant or call off?

Reviewer's code: 03013053

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Assistant Professor

Reviewer's country: Egypt

Author's country: United Kingdom

Manuscript submission date: 2020-01-05

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-01-07 19:51

Reviewer performed review: 2020-01-21 19:42

Review time: 13 Days and 23 Hours

| SCIENTIFIC QUALITY | LANGUAGE QUALITY | CONCLUSION | PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS |
|---|---|--|---|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept | Peer-Review: |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language | (High priority) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept | <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of | (General priority) | Peer-reviewer's expertise on the |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not | language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision | topic of the manuscript: |
| publish | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection | <input type="checkbox"/> General |
| | | | <input type="checkbox"/> No expertise |
| | | | Conflicts-of-Interest: |
| | | | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes |
| | | | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No |



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https:// www.wjgnet.com

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors presented two cases of transplanted deceased donor grafts with Riedels lobes with a good outcome. However some comments need to be addressed. 1- Grafts with Riedel lobes are not contraindicated to be donated (to the best of my knowledge). Is there awritten policy for that? The first case was rejected by other centers for other causes than the Riedel lobe (logestic reasons and CT condition of the donor) 2-The shape of the liver is of no significance as long as the vascular in and outflow are normal. 3- P 7. Why should a Riedle lobe become congested in the receipient, any outflow problem should be reflected on the whole graft and not in the Riedel lobe. (the choice of the recipient size depends on the whole liver volume and not just an anatomical variant) 4- If the vascular anatomy is different in Riedels lobe then that should not be a problem in whole liver donation, even in split donations many venous variants are accepted. 5- P 5 last sentence (the drawings....) please put it in the figure legends. 6-Please omit the third case which is not complete. 7- Minor language editing Thanks

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

[] Plagiarism

[Y] No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Transplantation

Manuscript NO: 53953

Title: Large Riedel's Lobe and atrophic left liver in a Donor - Accept for transplant or call off?

Reviewer's code: 00071178

Position: Editor-in-Chief

Academic degree: FACS, MD

Professional title: Associate Professor

Reviewer's country: Turkey

Author's country: United Kingdom

Manuscript submission date: 2020-01-05

Reviewer chosen by: Jin-Zhou Tang

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-01-16 07:27

Reviewer performed review: 2020-01-26 11:22

Review time: 10 Days and 3 Hours

| SCIENTIFIC QUALITY | LANGUAGE QUALITY | CONCLUSION | PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS |
|---|---|--|---|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept | Peer-Review: |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language | (High priority) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept | <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of | (General priority) | Peer-reviewer's expertise on the |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not | language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision | topic of the manuscript: |
| publish | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection | <input type="checkbox"/> General |
| | | | <input type="checkbox"/> No expertise |
| | | | Conflicts-of-Interest: |
| | | | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes |
| | | | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No |



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https:// www.wjgnet.com

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dear Authors Thank you for your presentation. My comment as below: It is not appropriate to present a study consisting of two cases as a case series. It is more correct to write this as case report. The article was not prepared according to the author's guidelines of the WJG series. I wonder why the authors did not consider the WJG format. Please review the spelling rules. Since the whole liver is used in cadaveric liver transplantation (mostly), the atrophic of the left lobe is not a contraindication. If the Riedel lobe is seen as a developmental variation, it will not be a problem as it is associated with other parts of the liver. Riedel lobe, also known as tongue-like liver, is defined as inferior projection of the right lobe of the liver. On the other hand, authors says that in case-1 presentation , a large right liver lobe (Riedel's lobe) combined with an atrophic left lateral segment was identified. This definition is absolutely wrong. The Riedel lobe is used to describe a tongue-like extension originating from the right lobe. The growth of the right lobe cannot be described as the riedel lobe. Therefore, the definition of the first case was made wrong. When we look at Figure-2, this situation could not be clearly shown. I also recommend the authors to benefit from the article I have mentioned following: Gastric outlet obstruction caused by Riedel's lobe of the liver: a diagnostic and therapeutic challenge for surgeons. Hepatogastroenterology. 2011 Mar-Apr;58(106):589-92

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

[Y] No

BPG Search:

[] The same title

[] Duplicate publication

[] Plagiarism

[Y] No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Transplantation

Manuscript NO: 53953

Title: Large Riedel's Lobe and atrophic left liver in a Donor - Accept for transplant or call off?

Reviewer's code: 00054672

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: FEBG, MD, PhD

Professional title: Associate Professor

Reviewer's country: Croatia

Author's country: United Kingdom

Manuscript submission date: 2020-01-05

Reviewer chosen by: Jin-Zhou Tang

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-01-15 13:37

Reviewer performed review: 2020-01-28 13:11

Review time: 12 Days and 23 Hours

| SCIENTIFIC QUALITY | LANGUAGE QUALITY | CONCLUSION | PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS |
|---|---|--|---|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept | Peer-Review: |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language | (High priority) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept | <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of | (General priority) | Peer-reviewer's expertise on the |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not | language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision | topic of the manuscript: |
| publish | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision | <input type="checkbox"/> Advanced |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General |
| | | | <input type="checkbox"/> No expertise |
| | | | Conflicts-of-Interest: |
| | | | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes |
| | | | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No |



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors present their experience with Riedler's lobe in the context of liver transplantation. Two cases are presented in detail (the third case is only mentioned ?) accompanied by figures, however the article would benefit from the revision of the abstract, introduction and discussion. Journal guidelines for article preparation are completely ignored by the authors. I would recommend a major revision.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ [Y] No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ [Y] No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Transplantation

Manuscript NO: 53953

Title: Large Riedel's Lobe and atrophic left liver in a Donor - Accept for transplant or call off?

Reviewer's code: 05117991

Position: Associate Editor

Academic degree: MD, MSc

Professional title: Associate Professor, Director, Surgeon

Reviewer's country: Turkey

Author's country: United Kingdom

Manuscript submission date: 2020-01-05

Reviewer chosen by: Jin-Zhou Tang

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-01-15 09:57

Reviewer performed review: 2020-02-03 06:47

Review time: 18 Days and 20 Hours

| SCIENTIFIC QUALITY | LANGUAGE QUALITY | CONCLUSION | PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS |
|--|---|--|---|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept | Peer-Review: |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language | (High priority) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | polishing | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept | <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of | (General priority) | Peer-reviewer's expertise on the |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not | language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision | topic of the manuscript: |
| publish | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision | <input type="checkbox"/> Advanced |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General |
| | | | <input type="checkbox"/> No expertise |
| | | | Conflicts-of-Interest: |
| | | | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes |
| | | | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No |

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a well written article of two liver transplant cases with abnormal donor liver anatomy. The figures are very demonstrative and clear. The language and descriptions are clear and easy to follow. The Title is attractive, subject is crucial. Therefore, should be published. However, The readers would expect clarification on, 1- "In context of suboptimal donor utilisation" This is the entrance sentence, which needs to be supported within the article- why suboptimal? 2- "Despite such advanced liver disease, the candidate achieved only limited points in the model of end stage liver disease (MELD) and United Kingdom model for end stage liver disease (UKELD) score with 10 and 54 points, respectively." I would like to hear more about this in the discussion section. Is this a masked critic to the current system, if so the reader would like to see more facts related to the issue. 3- I do agree with other reviewers that this is a presentation with 2 cases, not three. I do not think any major language editing is necessary. I congratulate the authors for managing these two liver transplants with the best care standards. Thank you. Kind Regards, Sanem Cimen

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

[] Duplicate publication

[] Plagiarism

[Y] No