

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 54410

Title: Ectopic hepatocellular carcinoma mimicking a retroperitoneal tumor: A case report and review of literature

Reviewer's code: 02439165

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: PhD

Professional title: Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: China

Author's Country/Territory: Japan

Manuscript submission date: 2020-02-18

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-02-18 23:12

Reviewer performed review: 2020-02-19 02:58

Review time: 3 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	RE-REVIEW	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision		<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair		<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision		Peer-reviewer's expertise on the topic of the manuscript:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection		<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
				<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
				<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
				Conflicts-of-Interest:



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

☐ Yes

☐ No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

There Are some errors in the paper:e.g.report a case and reviews of the ; as an HCC arising from hepatic parenchyma located in an extrahepatic organ or tissue [1]; and a review the literature concerning EHCC

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

☐ The same title

☐ Duplicate publication

☐ Plagiarism

☐ No

BPG Search:

☐ The same title

☐ Duplicate publication

☐ Plagiarism

☐ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 54410

Title: Ectopic hepatocellular carcinoma mimicking a retroperitoneal tumor: A case report and review of literature

Reviewer's code: 00722050

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: FRCP (C), MD, PhD

Professional title: Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Canada

Author's Country/Territory: Japan

Manuscript submission date: 2020-02-18

Reviewer chosen by: Jin-Zhou Tang

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-03-27 13:59

Reviewer performed review: 2020-03-27 14:10

Review time: 1 Hour

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	RE-REVIEW	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision		<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision		Peer-reviewer's expertise on the topic of the manuscript:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
				<input type="checkbox"/> General
				<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
				Conflicts-of-Interest:



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

☐ Yes

☐ No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The ectopic HCC is a very difficult catch in surgical pathology and the case report here is very interesting. I agree that Arg-1 is a very sensitive and specific marker, but the lack of any staining for Hep-Par1 and Glypican may raise difficulties to pathologists and gastroenterologists to accept it. Moreover, this patient is 81 years old and a multi step carcinogenesis discussion with a paragraph on liver embryogenesis seems a little awkward. I consider this manuscript a very important pathology report, but the authors need to add some molecular analysis. Without it, it is extremely difficult to be a topic that will be cited in the future.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

☐ The same title

☐ Duplicate publication

☐ Plagiarism

☐ No

BPG Search:

☐ The same title



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

[] Duplicate publication

[] Plagiarism

[Y] No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 54410

Title: Ectopic hepatocellular carcinoma mimicking a retroperitoneal tumor: A case report and review of literature

Reviewer's code: 02936110

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: PhD

Professional title: Professor, Chief physicianY

Reviewer's Country/Territory: China

Author's Country/Territory: Japan

Manuscript submission date: 2020-02-18

Reviewer chosen by: Jin-Zhou Tang

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-03-31 02:41

Reviewer performed review: 2020-04-01 01:37

Review time: 22 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	RE-REVIEW	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision		<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair		<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision		Peer-reviewer's expertise on the topic of the manuscript:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
				<input type="checkbox"/> General
				<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
				Conflicts-of-Interest:

☐ Yes

☐ No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1. The author described the diagnosis and treatment of the case which was the first ever reported case of ectopic hepatocellular carcinoma (EHCC) on the dorsal side of the pancreatic head. It is of great clinical significance. 2. By analyzing the basic characteristics of the case, as well as the relevant laboratory and image examinations, the team determined the diagnosis and treatment. Also the author provided the pathological and follow-up results. The logical thinking is clear. 3. The author searched "ectopic hepatocellular carcinoma" in PubMed, and expressed the related content in the form of literature review with important reference value. 4. However, the case report lacks the content of physical examination; and the "supplementary Table 1" is not attached to the manuscript; the paper "economic therapeutic carcinoma arising from the peritoneum" which was published in 2019 did not showed in this article. Further discussion on treatment and specific marker is recommended and then the conclusion will be more convincing. 5. In consideration of the above, further modification is recommended.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

☐ The same title

☐ Duplicate publication



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

☐ Plagiarism

☐ No

BPG Search:

☐ The same title

☐ Duplicate publication

☐ Plagiarism

☐ No