

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery

Manuscript NO: 54594

Title: Giant low-grade collecting duct renal carcinoma mimicking a hepatic hydatid cyst.
A challenging diagnosis and therapy

Reviewer's code: 02549888

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: DNB, FRCS (Gen Surg), MBBS, MNAMS

Professional title: Full Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: India

Author's Country/Territory: Romania

Manuscript submission date: 2020-02-06

Reviewer chosen by: Ying Dou

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-02-16 13:17

Reviewer performed review: 2020-02-16 13:23

Review time: 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Title can be modified. Abstract: satisfactory. Case report: Well documented. Discussion is quite elaborate and provides most of the details. However in the said case there was no need to consider hepatic hydatid as one of the differentials. The imaging findings are quite clear. Conclusion is quite satisfactory.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery

Manuscript NO: 54594

Title: Giant low-grade collecting duct renal carcinoma mimicking a hepatic hydatid cyst.
A challenging diagnosis and therapy

Reviewer's code: 02840817

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: PhD

Professional title: Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: China

Author's Country/Territory: Romania

Manuscript submission date: 2020-02-06

Reviewer chosen by: Ying Dou

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-03-02 03:22

Reviewer performed review: 2020-03-02 04:10

Review time: 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

It is a well-written manuscript. The patient's information is detailed and the pathology result is clear and confirmed. The discussion part is thorough. But I have to say that missing data of CEA, AFP and HCG is a little drawback. And in the second paragraph of Case Presentation-Imaging examinations, 10UH should be 10HU.