

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Clinical Oncology

**Manuscript NO:** 54716

**Title:** IS THERE A ROLE FOR TREATMENT-ORIENTED SURGERY IN LIVER METASTASES FROM GASTRIC CANCER?

**Reviewer's code:** 00505438

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

**Academic degree:** MD

**Professional title:** Professor

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** Australia

**Author's Country/Territory:** Italy

**Manuscript submission date:** 2020-02-14

**Reviewer chosen by:** Ya-Juan Ma

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2020-05-07 07:37

**Reviewer performed review:** 2020-05-25 06:56

**Review time:** 17 Days and 23 Hours

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Re-review</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)  
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

#### **SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

Interesting analysis of resection of gastric liver mets Several issues 1. Eastern studies include mostly early stage disease patients often identified through screening. western patients as mentioned are usually at a much later stage. Is it valid to use eastern studies and compare then with western cohorts. Although touched on, this needs further discussion and expansion 2. Have the authors looked at the role of chemo therapy as a method of identification. ie have patients with liver mets then had chemotherapy for a period prior to restaging and potential metastectomy 3. similiarly have the authors looked at whether the patients undergoing metastectomy were chemo naive prior to surgery

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Clinical Oncology

**Manuscript NO:** 54716

**Title:** IS THERE A ROLE FOR TREATMENT-ORIENTED SURGERY IN LIVER METASTASES FROM GASTRIC CANCER?

**Reviewer's code:** 03017458

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

**Academic degree:** MD, PhD

**Professional title:** Assistant Professor

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** Ukraine

**Author's Country/Territory:** Italy

**Manuscript submission date:** 2020-02-14

**Reviewer chosen by:** Xiao-Quan Yu

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2020-05-19 18:22

**Reviewer performed review:** 2020-05-25 20:20

**Review time:** 6 Days and 1 Hour

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Re-review</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

## **SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

The systematic review is methodically properly organized and the article is well balanced. However, it is necessary to pay attention to the following remarks:

- **Abstract Conclusion:** "Serous infiltration and lymph node involvement of the primary tumor and the presence of single metastasis or a number lower than 3 associated to a size of < 5 cm may be considered data that does not contraindicate liver resection. " But, Serous infiltration and lymph node involvement in the text of article are considered as contraindications to liver resection. Must be rephrased.
- **Introduction:** "Hepatectomy for gastric liver metastases reportedly has 5-year survival rate of 13-37% ... [10]" But, the [10] reference is not an review. It is necessary to provide the correct literary reference.
- **Results:** "...This would open a future therapeutic opportunity even in H2-H3 patients..." It is necessary to decipher for the reader what "H2-H3" means according to Japanese Gastric Cancer Association.
- It should be briefly noted the influence of the morphological structure of the tumor (including Lauren's type of tumor) on the survival of patients after liver resection. Because the diffuse type is very tropical to metachronous implantation metastasis.

## RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Clinical Oncology

**Manuscript NO:** 54716

**Title:** IS THERE A ROLE FOR TREATMENT-ORIENTED SURGERY IN LIVER METASTASES FROM GASTRIC CANCER?

**Reviewer's code:** 03017458

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

**Academic degree:** MD, PhD

**Professional title:** Assistant Professor

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** Ukraine

**Author's Country/Territory:** Italy

**Manuscript submission date:** 2020-02-14

**Reviewer chosen by:** Ze-Mao Gong

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2020-06-08 12:20

**Reviewer performed review:** 2020-06-09 19:53

**Review time:** 1 Day and 7 Hours

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

## SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)  
**https://**[www.wjgnet.com](http://www.wjgnet.com)

Respond of the authors is appropriate, the article can be accepted for publishing.

## RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Clinical Oncology

**Manuscript NO:** 54716

**Title:** IS THERE A ROLE FOR TREATMENT-ORIENTED SURGERY IN LIVER METASTASES FROM GASTRIC CANCER?

**Reviewer's code:** 00505438

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

**Academic degree:** MD

**Professional title:** Professor

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** Australia

**Author's Country/Territory:** Italy

**Manuscript submission date:** 2020-02-14

**Reviewer chosen by:** Ze-Mao Gong

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2020-06-10 07:31

**Reviewer performed review:** 2020-06-10 07:45

**Review time:** 1 Hour

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

## SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)  
**https://**[www.wjgnet.com](http://www.wjgnet.com)

The authors have met my concerns to my satisfaction and I recommend acceptance.