



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Oncology

Manuscript NO: 54716

Title: IS THERE A ROLE FOR TREATMENT-ORIENTED SURGERY IN LIVER METASTASES FROM GASTRIC CANCER?

Reviewer's code: 00505438

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Australia

Author's Country/Territory: Italy

Manuscript submission date: 2020-02-14

Reviewer chosen by: Ya-Juan Ma

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-05-07 07:37

Reviewer performed review: 2020-05-25 06:56

Review time: 17 Days and 23 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Interesting analysis of resection of gastric liver mets Several issues 1. Eastern studies include mostly early stage disease patients often identified through screening. western patients as mentioned are usually at a much later stage. Is it valid to use eastern studies and compare then with western cohorts. Although touched on, this needs further discussion and expansion 2. Have the authors looked at the role of chemo therapy as a method of identification. ie have patients with liver mets then had chemotherapy for a period prior to restaging and potential metastectomy 3. similiarly have the authors looked at whether the patients undergoing metastectomy were chemo naive prior to surgery



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Oncology

Manuscript NO: 54716

Title: IS THERE A ROLE FOR TREATMENT-ORIENTED SURGERY IN LIVER METASTASES FROM GASTRIC CANCER?

Reviewer's code: 03017458

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Assistant Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Ukraine

Author's Country/Territory: Italy

Manuscript submission date: 2020-02-14

Reviewer chosen by: Xiao-Quan Yu

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-05-19 18:22

Reviewer performed review: 2020-05-25 20:20

Review time: 6 Days and 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The systematic review is methodically properly organized and the article is well balanced. However, it is necessary to pay attention to the following remarks:

- **Abstract Conclusion:** "Serous infiltration and lymph node involvement of the primary tumor and the presence of single metastasis or a number lower than 3 associated to a size of < 5 cm may be considered data that does not contraindicate liver resection. " But, Serous infiltration and lymph node involvement in the text of article are considered as contraindications to liver resection. Must be rephrased.
- **Introduction:** "Hepatectomy for gastric liver metastases reportedly has 5-year survival rate of 13-37% ... [10]" But, the [10] reference is not an review. It is necessary to provide the correct literary reference.
- **Results:** "..This would open a future therapeutic opportunity even in H2-H3 patients..." It is necessary to decipher for the reader what "H2-H3" means according to Japanece Gastric Cancer Association.
- It should be briefly noted the influence of the morphological structure of the tumor (including Lauren's type of tumor) on the survival of patients after liver resection. Because the diffuse type is very tropical to metachronous implantation metastasis.



RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Oncology

Manuscript NO: 54716

Title: IS THERE A ROLE FOR TREATMENT-ORIENTED SURGERY IN LIVER METASTASES FROM GASTRIC CANCER?

Reviewer's code: 03017458

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Assistant Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Ukraine

Author's Country/Territory: Italy

Manuscript submission date: 2020-02-14

Reviewer chosen by: Ze-Mao Gong

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-06-08 12:20

Reviewer performed review: 2020-06-09 19:53

Review time: 1 Day and 7 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

Respond of the authors is appropriate, the article can be accepted for publishing.



RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Oncology

Manuscript NO: 54716

Title: IS THERE A ROLE FOR TREATMENT-ORIENTED SURGERY IN LIVER METASTASES FROM GASTRIC CANCER?

Reviewer's code: 00505438

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Australia

Author's Country/Territory: Italy

Manuscript submission date: 2020-02-14

Reviewer chosen by: Ze-Mao Gong

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-06-10 07:31

Reviewer performed review: 2020-06-10 07:45

Review time: 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

The authors have met my concerns to my satisfaction and I recommend acceptance.