

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery

**Manuscript NO:** 55106

**Title:** Influence of postoperative complications on long-term survival in liver transplant patients

**Reviewer's code:** 00057659

**Position:** Editorial Board

**Academic degree:** FACS, MD, PhD

**Professional title:** Chief Doctor, Professor

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** Germany

**Author's Country/Territory:** Spain

**Manuscript submission date:** 2020-03-05

**Reviewer chosen by:** Jia-Ping Yan

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2020-05-11 07:15

**Reviewer performed review:** 2020-05-11 07:33

**Review time:** 1 Hour

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Re-review</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

#### **SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

There are some reports regarding the influence of postoperative complications on long-term survival in liver transplant recipients. Unfortunately, these data give no new informations.

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery

**Manuscript NO:** 55106

**Title:** Influence of postoperative complications on long-term survival in liver transplant patients

**Reviewer's code:** 00506472

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

**Academic degree:** MD, PhD

**Professional title:** Associate Professor

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** Greece

**Author's Country/Territory:** Spain

**Manuscript submission date:** 2020-03-05

**Reviewer chosen by:** Jia-Ping Yan

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2020-05-11 07:50

**Reviewer performed review:** 2020-05-11 09:23

**Review time:** 1 Hour

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Re-review</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

#### **SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

It is a well written retrospective single center study highlighting the possible influence of postoperative complications on long-term survival and the ability of the Comprehensive Complication Index (CCI) to predict it, in liver transplant patients. The results are more or less well expected, however they add to the experience on this category of patients (with liver transplant). In the Discussion there is of high interest to compare these results derived from a single center to similar results fro other centers.

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery

**Manuscript NO:** 55106

**Title:** Influence of postoperative complications on long-term survival in liver transplant patients

**Reviewer's code:** 02726701

**Position:** Editorial Board

**Academic degree:** MD

**Professional title:** Associate Professor

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** Chile

**Author's Country/Territory:** Spain

**Manuscript submission date:** 2020-03-05

**Reviewer chosen by:** Jia-Ping Yan

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2020-05-12 14:27

**Reviewer performed review:** 2020-05-12 23:51

**Review time:** 9 Hours

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Re-review</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://**www.wjgnet.com

## **SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

Comments on Influence of postoperative complications on long-term survival in liver transplant patients The introduction is clear and concise and it explains clearly authors' objective. Methods section is also well written, it is clear. Statistics: What is the intention to perform a multivariate analysis considering that the variables included in the model are not all post-surgical complications (Table 5)? Please add an explanation. Results: Second paragraph: "extracorporeal membrane oxygenator (NECMO)". ECMO or NECMO? Transplanted patients seems to have good performance at baseline: They were young, had normal BMI, relatively good liver function and low Charlson, Meld and BAR scores. It is important because the main prognosis factor after surgery is the patient's physiological reserve that it is correlated to the above mentioned variables and scores. Please, comment this issue. CCI score mean value was  $42 \pm 25$ , but the median value was 33.5 suggesting a broad sample dispersion and, possibly, that some bias could be added when analyzing the sample CCI score with survival prognosis. The authors explore this issue using several cutoff points to estimate survival prognosis and, also, in the multivariate analysis. I am not sure how fair is to be confident about the lack of predictive power of Charlson and BAR scores (What about MELD?) in this small sample of liver transplanted patients. Discussion: It is appropriate, but, it is needed to comment about that main observed complications were transplant associated and they were not strictly "postoperative" and these complications do not need to produce inflammation in the patient to deteriorate their health status and compromise their survival prognosis. The study limitations are mentioned, but I think it is necessary to comment the number of liver transplanted cases must be enough to answer the objective of this trial. Tale 3: Please, give examples of each type of complication. Al other tables and Figures, references, abstract are OK.

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery

**Manuscript NO:** 55106

**Title:** Influence of postoperative complications on long-term survival in liver transplant patients

**Reviewer's code:** 05117991

**Position:** Associate Editor

**Academic degree:** MD, MSc

**Professional title:** Associate Professor, Director, Surgeon

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** Turkey

**Author's Country/Territory:** Spain

**Manuscript submission date:** 2020-03-05

**Reviewer chosen by:** Jia-Ping Yan

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2020-05-09 10:55

**Reviewer performed review:** 2020-05-13 12:57

**Review time:** 4 Days and 2 Hours

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Re-review</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

#### **SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

The CCI and value of other comorbidity/complication indexes should be introduced to the reader in the Introduction section. There are some comments at the results section, such as suggestions, which should only be included at the discussion section. The method of the study is not clear and should be revised. In retrospective cohort studies two groups are retrospectively identified and “prospectively” compared according to a given variable. Methods section should be clarified to match the study description or the description should be revised. There are several grammatical and english mistakes.



## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery

**Manuscript NO:** 55106

**Title:** Influence of postoperative complications on long-term survival in liver transplant patients

**Reviewer's code:** 03021264

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

**Academic degree:** MD, PhD

**Professional title:** Professor

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** China

**Author's Country/Territory:** Spain

**Manuscript submission date:** 2020-03-05

**Reviewer chosen by:** Jia-Ping Yan

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2020-05-13 02:32

**Reviewer performed review:** 2020-05-16 14:17

**Review time:** 3 Days and 11 Hours

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Re-review</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

## SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

- This article found that the CCI score showed significant influence on long-term survival in liver transplant recipients, and such similar studies had not been reported before. The authors suggested that only one complication requiring interventional treatment under general anesthesia or two treated without general anesthesia are enough to influence long-term survival. As a result, enhancing postoperative care is extremely important not only to minimize postoperative mortality but also to improve long-term survival.
- The disadvantages of the article are:
  - 1. Comparison between patients with CCI  $<20.9$  vs  $> 20.9$  ( $20.9 = \text{mode CCI value}$ ) showed estimated 5-year survival was 57.4 and 45.71 months, respectively ( $\log\text{-rank}=0.167$ ). — — There are some errors in the above data.
  - 2. The study of this paper is relatively simple and has little reference value for clinical work.

## RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery

**Manuscript NO:** 55106

**Title:** Influence of postoperative complications on long-term survival in liver transplant patients

**Reviewer's code:** 05117991

**Position:** Associate Editor

**Academic degree:** MD, MSc

**Professional title:** Associate Professor, Director, Surgeon

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** Turkey

**Author's Country/Territory:** Spain

**Manuscript submission date:** 2020-03-05

**Reviewer chosen by:** Ya-Juan Ma

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2020-06-22 12:08

**Reviewer performed review:** 2020-06-22 12:23

**Review time:** 1 Hour

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: <input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

## SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The Article has been corrected and revised according to reviewer's comments. Now it represents the clinical study better and is easily readable. I would like to thank the authors for their valuable contributions. Thank you. Kind Regards, Sanem Cimen

## RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery

**Manuscript NO:** 55106

**Title:** Influence of postoperative complications on long-term survival in liver transplant patients

**Reviewer's code:** 00057659

**Position:** Editorial Board

**Academic degree:** FACS, MD, PhD

**Professional title:** Chief Doctor, Professor

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** Germany

**Author's Country/Territory:** Spain

**Manuscript submission date:** 2020-03-05

**Reviewer chosen by:** Ya-Juan Ma

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2020-06-23 04:57

**Reviewer performed review:** 2020-06-23 05:18

**Review time:** 1 Hour

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

## SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS



7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)  
**https://**[www.wjgnet.com](https://www.wjgnet.com)

In this form, the paper can be accepted for publication.

## RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery

**Manuscript NO:** 55106

**Title:** Influence of postoperative complications on long-term survival in liver transplant patients

**Reviewer's code:** 02726701

**Position:** Editorial Board

**Academic degree:** MD

**Professional title:** Associate Professor

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** Chile

**Author's Country/Territory:** Spain

**Manuscript submission date:** 2020-03-05

**Reviewer chosen by:** Ya-Juan Ma

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2020-06-23 12:56

**Reviewer performed review:** 2020-06-24 00:26

**Review time:** 11 Hours

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

## SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Authors' answers and corrections added to the manuscript corrected the commented issues during the first review round.



## RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery

**Manuscript NO:** 55106

**Title:** Influence of postoperative complications on long-term survival in liver transplant patients

**Reviewer's code:** 03021264

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

**Academic degree:** MD, PhD

**Professional title:** Professor

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** China

**Author's Country/Territory:** Spain

**Manuscript submission date:** 2020-03-05

**Reviewer chosen by:** Ya-Juan Ma

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2020-06-23 23:43

**Reviewer performed review:** 2020-06-25 08:06

**Review time:** 1 Day and 8 Hours

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

## SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS



7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)  
**https://**[www.wjgnet.com](https://www.wjgnet.com)

The paper has clinical value, conforms to the journal publication requirement, agrees to publish