

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

Manuscript NO: 55138

Title: Cell competition in liver carcinogenesis

Reviewer's code: 02445571

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: China

Author's Country/Territory: Italy

Manuscript submission date: 2020-03-03

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-03-03 23:12

Reviewer performed review: 2020-03-21 06:43

Review time: 17 Days and 7 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This paper reviewed the role of cell competition in liver physiology and pathology, edging the risk of cancer development. This is a very interesting concept and topic. The overall writing need to be improved or refined. In particular, need some refine work on the abstract, introduction, and conclusion paragraphs. The abstract is lack of focus and brief, what are the aims and significance in this review? The introduction is also not very clearly in regarding to concepts of cell competition, the purposes of the paper. Last paragraph is also too much narrative description, like discussion, need reshape.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

Manuscript NO: 55138

Title: Cell competition in liver carcinogenesis

Reviewer's code: 00227444

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Japan

Author's Country/Territory: Italy

Manuscript submission date: 2020-03-03

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-03-04 01:58

Reviewer performed review: 2020-03-23 06:45

Review time: 19 Days and 4 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

World journal of Hepatology Manuscript NO: 55138, Fabio Marongiu and E Laconi Cell competition in liver carcinogenesis Cell competition is a quality control strategy to optimize cell and tissue fitness in multicellular organisms, which is physiologically important, but also might be co-opted by neoplastic cell populations in carcinogenesis. In this mini-review, the authors discuss the relevance of these concepts to liver carcinogenesis. Overall, I think that the paper is clear in terms of the point of the discussion, and might contribute to the related field. My comments are as follows. 1. I would like to know more about cancer-specific markers, since only myc is described. 2. In Introduction, "However remarkable this capacity might appear," 3. I cannot see the sentences related to references 2, 30 and 31.