

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology

Manuscript NO: 55301

Title: Achievement of complete response to nivolumab in a patient with advanced sarcomatoid hepatocellular carcinoma: A case report

Reviewer's code: 00722239

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Associate Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Japan

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2020-03-18

Reviewer chosen by: Jie Wang (Quit in 2020)

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-03-24 13:48

Reviewer performed review: 2020-03-29 01:02

Review time: 4 Days and 11 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors have reported their clinical experience of advanced sarcomatoid hepatocellular carcinoma (SHC) successfully treated with nivolumab. Because SHC is a rare and usually aggressive tumor, their clinical experience provides significant clinical implications. However, I have major comments regarding their pathological diagnosis. Although they made pathological diagnosis of SHC after many kinds of immunohistochemistry, they did not document enough rationale for pathological diagnosis of SHC. Most important differential diagnoses of present case are SHC, sarcomatoid cholangiocarcinoma (SCC), and sarcomatoid combined hepatocellular and cholangiocarcinoma (SCHC). My first impression based on provided pathological information is SCC. The results of immunohistochemistry are also consistent with SCC. I know differential diagnosis among SHC, SCC, and SCHC is very difficult in some cases. These cases are often debate even among specialized pathologists. Thus, the gross appearance (cut surface) of resected specimen, the details of HE findings (presence or absence of ductular components or trabecular pattern, similarity of HCC or CCC, etc.), and consideration for rationale of SHC based on pathological findings must be documented. Abbreviations used in immunohistochemistry (such as CK, Hep, PCEA, and GS) must be spelled out.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology

Manuscript NO: 55301

Title: Achievement of complete response to nivolumab in a patient with advanced sarcomatoid hepatocellular carcinoma: A case report

Reviewer's code: 00030603

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Greece

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2020-03-18

Reviewer chosen by: Ya-Juan Ma

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-05-09 09:19

Reviewer performed review: 2020-05-14 15:26

Review time: 5 Days and 6 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

a very interesting case of complete response of Sarcomatoid hepatocellular carcinoma to systematic immunotherapy

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology

Manuscript NO: 55301

Title: Achievement of complete response to nivolumab in a patient with advanced sarcomatoid hepatocellular carcinoma: A case report

Reviewer's code: 00069423

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: FAASLD, MD

Professional title: Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: United States

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2020-03-18

Reviewer chosen by: Xiao-Quan Yu

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-05-19 12:23

Reviewer performed review: 2020-05-23 12:25

Review time: 4 Days

Scientific quality	[<input checked="" type="radio"/>] Grade A: Excellent [<input type="radio"/>] Grade B: Very good [<input type="radio"/>] Grade C: Good [<input type="radio"/>] Grade D: Fair [<input type="radio"/>] Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	[<input checked="" type="radio"/>] Grade A: Priority publishing [<input type="radio"/>] Grade B: Minor language polishing [<input type="radio"/>] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing [<input type="radio"/>] Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	[<input checked="" type="radio"/>] Accept (High priority) [<input type="radio"/>] Accept (General priority) [<input type="radio"/>] Minor revision [<input type="radio"/>] Major revision [<input type="radio"/>] Rejection
Re-review	[<input type="radio"/>] Yes [<input checked="" type="radio"/>] No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: [<input checked="" type="radio"/>] Anonymous [<input type="radio"/>] Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: [<input type="radio"/>] Yes [<input checked="" type="radio"/>] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

May 23, 2020 Review Manuscript entitled "Achievement of complete response to nivolumab in a patient with advanced sarcomatoid hepatocellular carcinoma: A case report" Authors report their successful treatment of the rare form of hepatocellular carcinoma, sarcomatoid HCC(SHC) that was possibly attributed to chronic HBV infection. While prognosis is very poor for this form of HCC, by applying immunotherapy with nivolumab, the PD-1 inhibitor, they showed success in reducing the tumor. This is the first case experience ever reported. This experience would be of great help for other physicians and oncologists. The authors presented a good discussion with a warning of the paradoxical hyper progression that could occur with the successful immunotherapy. Comment and questions. 1. The patient had chronic hepatitis B with cirrhosis and portal hypertension and has had entecavir therapy for 5 years at the time of Diagnosis of SHC. At the time of diagnosis, he was HBsAg (-). There is no information of HBV DNA, HBeAg status, anti-HBc, anti-HBs. Even though he may have lost to HBsAg (-), HBV is the etiology for this case and is not eliminated by nucleoside analogue. And one wonders if the patient has continued on anti-HBV therapy. 2. Just curious why authors used the terminology, SGPT and SGOT in place of ALT and AST.