



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 55323

Title: Epidemiological and clinical characteristics of COVID-19 patients in Hengyang, Hunan Province, China

Reviewer's code: 02547883

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Associate Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Japan

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2020-03-13

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-03-13 17:02

Reviewer performed review: 2020-03-14 07:27

Review time: 14 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript reported on-going world wide pandemic infectious disease COVID-19 and its treatment result in Hengyang area closely neighboring to Hubei where the first COVID-19 patient was discovered on January 16, 2020. The treatment strategy and its process of the first phased victory against the pandemic were thoroughly described. This pandemic has much impact on world-wide health affair, so that prompt publish will actually needed, however tiny points had better be revised as following; To avoid time wasting I attached revising manuscript as word file.



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 55323

Title: Epidemiological and clinical characteristics of COVID-19 patients in Hengyang, Hunan Province, China

Reviewer's code: 02548034

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Doctor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Taiwan

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2020-03-13

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-03-13 15:01

Reviewer performed review: 2020-03-16 06:39

Review time: 2 Days and 15 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors investigated the epidemiology and clinical characteristics of 48 cases with new coronavirus pneumonia in Hengyang, Hunan Province, China. They found that 22.9% of the patients were 60 years or older, 64.6% were men, 31.2% had comorbidity, 91.7% had identifiable contact history, 87.5% presented with fever, 83.3% had cough, 14.6% had difficulty in breathing, 97.9% had pulmonary lesions, 16.6% (8/48) were severe. All of the patients received antiviral medications, and all survived. The study is of clinical and epidemiological interest. The information is simple, and the findings are consistent with those of recently published reports. However, the manuscript was poorly-written. The title (“coronary pneumonia”) is wrong. The abstract is too long. The introduction of the manuscript is redundant and did not provide a brief summary of recent reports on relevant clinical and epidemiological findings. Criteria of disease severity were not provided. A great deal of re-writing or polishing is needed before it could be published. Moreover, there are some obvious flaws. For example, the case number shown in Figure 1 was only 38 ($n=1+2+1+3+2+2+4+2+4+3+4+1+1+2+1+2+2+1$) instead of 48. The calculation of the incubation period is likely incorrect because 4 patients had unclear contact history.



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 55323

Title: Epidemiological and clinical characteristics of COVID-19 patients in Hengyang, Hunan Province, China

Reviewer's code: 03471208

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: PhD

Professional title: Postdoctoral Fellow, Research Scientist

Reviewer's Country/Territory: United States

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2020-03-13

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-03-17 17:13

Reviewer performed review: 2020-03-22 00:43

Review time: 4 Days and 7 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript is well presented. Minor revision requested: Please find comments below: 1. Tables need formatting. The figures should be of high resolution figure. 2. Explain clearly about method of diagnosis. Diagnostic Kit, company ? which sub type of corona virus was confirmed (more frequent), after matching the sequencing data. 3. Great deal of language polishing required and spelling and grammar check and formatting required. 4. Please try to have good follow up of patients for future studies if recurrent cases comes.



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 55323

Title: Epidemiological and clinical characteristics of COVID-19 patients in Hengyang, Hunan Province, China

Reviewer's code: 05356015

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Doctor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: United States

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2020-03-13

Reviewer chosen by: Jin-Zhou Tang (Quit in 2020)

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-03-20 13:10

Reviewer performed review: 2020-03-22 15:52

Review time: 2 Days and 2 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgooffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Review comments: The topic is of great significance in the current COVID-19 pandemic. The authors presented the clinical and epidemiological characteristics of the 48 COVID-19 patients, providing limited value for researchers and health care workers. I have some comments: Abstract: 1. A small number of COVID-19 cases should one limitation in this study. Authors may add a limitation section in the study. 2. It may be not appropriate to say that it was a miracle since only 48 cases were treated. 3. The fonts and line spacing were different throughout the paper. I feel that the paper was not completed yet. 4. Please summarize some key points in your abstract results section, and reduce the length. 5. Abstract conclusion: please re-consider your conclusion from this study, and emphasize the key points and the message authors would like audience to know. Introduction: 6. First line, it is "WHO" not "who". 7. Clinical diagnostic criteria: no section of 2.2. Results: 8. Table 1: Authors may describe the different characteristics by gender to provide more information. For age, the age range, mean age with SD are suggested. Are there more characteristics of the study population? Do you have migrant workers included in the occupation since 35% of them were farmers? These people may be rural-to-urban migrants. 9. Average visit time: please define the "visit time". 10. It may be interesting to compare the symptom, treatment and recovery between the patients with and without basic diseases. 11. Table 2: it would be interesting to see the gender and age differences of the symptoms. 12. Table 3: It would be interesting to compare the test results by age, gender, and with/without basic diseases. Discussion 13. Demographic characteristics: the discussion should not be a repeat of the results. Authors may discuss the differences compared with other studies, like studies in Wuhan. 14. Susceptible population: authors did not provide any results related to the susceptible population. I suggest removing this section. 15. Incubation period: it is not enough to



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

just list the incubation period in the discussion. 16. Visit and confirmation time: Please explain why the average time is shorter than the other studies. 17. Clinical classification: What the common type is? 18. Basic disease: Please give more details of the complication of the patients with underlying diseases. 19. Clinical symptoms: It is important that the patients with COVID-19 can be asymptomatic and infectious. So it would very important to strengthen the testing and wearing the masks. Authors may discuss more about it. 20. Treatment effects: Authors may discuss the differences between the Chinese traditional medicine and the Western medicine. And add more results about the treatment if there is any. 21. Add a section of limitations. 22. Language: Authors may go through the whole paper, revise the language, re-organize the discussion.