



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 55358

Title: Systematic review of the prevalence and development of osteoporosis or low bone mineral density and its risk factors in patients with inflammatory bowel disease

Reviewer’s code: 05189969

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Research Fellow

Reviewer’s Country/Territory: United States

Author’s Country/Territory: Denmark

Manuscript submission date: 2020-03-28

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-03-28 17:50

Reviewer performed review: 2020-03-30 17:51

Review time: 2 Days

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Overall this is a nice review of Osteoporosis and IBD, though no meta-analysis was performed. 1) Original findings indicate that CD, more than UC, seems to be associated with Osteoporosis (though data specifically in UC is lacking from the studies). 2&3) This study also suggests associations between BMI/gender and osteoporosis, though there was a lack of ability to perform a true meta-analysis. As such, it is more of a narrative review. Additionally, while similar results have been reported previously (PMID: 31720198), this study highlights the lack of uniformity both in measurements as well as design across studies, and emphasizes the need for further investigation (particularly with stratification between UC and CD). Comments -Would change the sentence "Among healthy controls, prevalence of osteoporosis was 3% and 10%." Would note from 2 different studies and among age and sex matched controls. On first read was confusing. -Would note which gender in Haugeberg study was associated with Osteoporosis in Table 3. -When describing associations should note the direction for each: "Overall, a CD diagnosis, body mass index (BMI), body weight and gender were associated with osteoporosis or low BMD." Should note which gender, direction of BMI etc. -For Table 4 would note the time period that BMD was assessed over for each study. I would include a range in the text to give the reader an idea of the duration -Since a meta-analysis was not able to be completed, it's more a narrative review in essence. -Would explicitly mention that data just for UC patients is lacking much earlier in the paper - not explicitly mentioned until the limitations. -Sig. limitation as noted is the difference in measurements among the studies as well as other heterogeneous features that preclude a true meta-analysis.



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 55358

Title: Systematic review of the prevalence and development of osteoporosis or low bone mineral density and its risk factors in patients with inflammatory bowel disease

Reviewer’s code: 02702057

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: BSc, MSc, PhD

Professional title: Associate Professor

Reviewer’s Country/Territory: Italy

Author’s Country/Territory: Denmark

Manuscript submission date: 2020-03-28

Reviewer chosen by: Ruo-Yu Ma (Quit in 2020)

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-04-13 08:10

Reviewer performed review: 2020-04-13 09:51

Review time: 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Manuscript titled "Systematic review of the prevalence and development of osteoporosis or low bone mineral density and its risk factors in patients with inflammatory bowel disease" deal an important issue of osteoporosis. The aim of this review was to assess prevalence and development of osteoporosis and low bone mineral density (BMD), and its risk factors, in IBD patients. This Systematic review of population-based studies is interesting and well written, innovative and well described. Moreover, minor revisions are needed to update the introduction (too poor) based on the current literature. Please add a sentence or improve the current ruling regarding the osteoporosis, eg. Adding the importance of physical activity in osteoporosis. Please quote adequate missing references as follow: The importance of physical activity in osteoporosis. From the molecular pathways to the clinical evidence. *Histol Histopathol.* 2016 Nov;31(11):1183-94. RANKL is downregulated in bone cells by physical activity (treadmill and vibration stimulation training) in rat with glucocorticoid-induced osteoporosis. *Histol Histopathol.* 2013 Sep;28(9):1185-96. The effects of physical activity on apoptosis and lubricin expression in articular cartilage in rats with glucocorticoid-induced osteoporosis. *J Bone Miner Metab.* 2013 May;31(3):274-84. In the conclusion section please add the clinical relevance of your work.



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 55358

Title: Systematic review of the prevalence and development of osteoporosis or low bone mineral density and its risk factors in patients with inflammatory bowel disease

Reviewer’s code: 02439561

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: PhD

Professional title: Doctor, Staff Physician

Reviewer’s Country/Territory: South Korea

Author’s Country/Territory: Denmark

Manuscript submission date: 2020-03-28

Reviewer chosen by: Ruo-Yu Ma (Quit in 2020)

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-04-13 23:57

Reviewer performed review: 2020-04-21 01:30

Review time: 7 Days and 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

You did a great research.

RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 55358

Title: Systematic review of the prevalence and development of osteoporosis or low bone mineral density and its risk factors in patients with inflammatory bowel disease

Reviewer's code: 02702057

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: BSc, MSc, PhD

Professional title: Associate Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Italy

Author's Country/Territory: Denmark

Manuscript submission date: 2020-03-28

Reviewer chosen by: Ya-Juan Ma

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-06-29 09:07

Reviewer performed review: 2020-06-29 09:57

Review time: 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent [] Grade B: Very good [] Grade C: Good [] Grade D: Fair [] Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing [] Grade B: Minor language polishing [] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing [] Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) [] Accept (General priority) [] Minor revision [] Major revision [] Rejection
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous [] Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: [] Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

The manuscript did substantially benefit from the revisions done. The authors replied adequately and in a very satisfactory manner to the point by point request by me. In my opinion, this study is scientific consistent and fits very well with the scope, the remit and purpose of the journal. The work is good, well written and innovative. There aren't weakness and concerns that need to be addressed before recommending publication. In my opinion, in the present form, it is ready for publication.