

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Stem Cells

Manuscript NO: 56499

Title: Medical, ethical, and legal aspects of hematopoietic stem cell transplantation of crohn's disease in brazil

Reviewer's code: 01557050

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Japan

Author's Country/Territory: Brazil

Manuscript submission date: 2020-05-02

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-05-03 01:26

Reviewer performed review: 2020-05-05 08:26

Review time: 2 Days and 6 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1) General comments Dr. Ruiz, et al. reviewed 'Medical, Ethical, and Legal Aspects of Hematopoietic Stem Cell Transplantation of Crohn's Disease in Brazil'. The article is well presented. The reviewer has some comments. 1. This is a review article, please describe effects of HSCT for several diseases from current reports. 2. Please describe mechanisms or pathophysiology of HSCT for CD more detail. 3. Then, the authors can describe effects of HSCT for CD from current reports including non-effective reports. 4. The authors should explain the efficacy points or endo points in each study in carefully. Because some studies report no effects of this HSCT for CD, the authors should clarify the differentiations of each study. 5. In Brazil studies, the authors should explain with actual data more detail. 6. Then, the authors can summarize which CD patients would be useful for HDCT.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Stem Cells

Manuscript NO: 56499

Title: Medical, ethical, and legal aspects of hematopoietic stem cell transplantation of crohn's disease in brazil

Reviewer's code: 00503405

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Senior Lecturer, Senior Scientist

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Hungary

Author's Country/Territory: Brazil

Manuscript submission date: 2020-05-02

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-05-04 06:32

Reviewer performed review: 2020-05-05 16:42

Review time: 1 Day and 10 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In the original article of Ruiz et al. the authors aimed to summarize the current situation regarding the treatment of Crohn's disease (CD) with autologous HSCT and to emphasize medical, ethical, legal, and aspects that permeate the procedure in Brazil. The manuscript is of clinical importance since the use of HSCT in therapy refractory Crohn's disease is a potential option. However, there are some points that need revision. The Introduction is too long, it must be shortened and focused on the real topic of the manuscript. In the review of the use of HSCT in CD all around the world, the authors briefly display the results of known trials. I miss the summary of the inclusion and exclusion criteria in these studies. Regarding the Brazilian situation, the authors wrote the ethical considerations, then they describe the first experiments with HSCT therapy in CD patients. Please, describe the exact protocols of HSCTs used in the different hospitals. What is the reason of the altered amount of involved patients between A, B, C and D hospitals? (In hospital A 50 pts, however together only 8 pts. in the other hospitals). English language needs major revision. The current form of the manuscript needs major revision before reconsidering for a potential acceptance in WJSC.