



## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Transplantation

**Manuscript NO:** 56712

**Title:** Practical recommendations for kidney transplantation in the COVID-19 pandemic

**Reviewer's code:** 05347087

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

**Academic degree:** MD

**Professional title:** Doctor, Medical Assistant, Research Assistant Professor, Surgeon,  
Surgical Oncologist

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** Italy

**Author's Country/Territory:** Israel

**Manuscript submission date:** 2020-05-11

**Reviewer chosen by:** AI Technique

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2020-05-11 14:37

**Reviewer performed review:** 2020-05-11 14:50

**Review time:** 1 Hour

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Re-review</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)  
**https://**[www.wjgnet.com](http://www.wjgnet.com)

#### **SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

Interesting job, but why don't speak also about medical staff condition. Please add a subsection in the discussion. Please look at these references: Montemurro N. The emotional impact of COVID-19: From medical staff to common people. *Brain Behav Immun.* 2020 Mar 30. pii: S0889-1591(20)30411-6. doi: 10.1016/j.bbi.2020.03.032. [Epub ahead of print] Chen Y et al. Prevalence of self-reported depression and anxiety among pediatric medical staff members during the COVID-19 outbreak in Guiyang, China. *Psychiatry Res.* 2020 Apr 16;288:113005. doi: 10.1016/j.psychres.2020.113005. [Epub ahead of print] Chen Q et al. Mental health care for medical staff in China during the COVID-19 outbreak. *Lancet Psychiatry.* 2020 Apr;7(4):e15-e16.



**PEER-REVIEW REPORT**

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Transplantation

**Manuscript NO:** 56712

**Title:** Practical recommendations for kidney transplantation in the COVID-19 pandemic

**Reviewer’s code:** 02594199

**Position:** Editorial Board

**Academic degree:** MD, PhD

**Professional title:** Chief Doctor, Staff Physician

**Reviewer’s Country/Territory:** Japan

**Author’s Country/Territory:** Israel

**Manuscript submission date:** 2020-05-11

**Reviewer chosen by:** AI Technique

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2020-05-12 01:10

**Reviewer performed review:** 2020-05-12 01:29

**Review time:** 1 Hour

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Re-review</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

**SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)  
**https://**[www.wjgnet.com](http://www.wjgnet.com)

The authors highlighted their local measures and guidelines that were adopted by the kidney transplantation unit at Hadassah - Hebrew University Medical Center in Jerusalem, Israel. As there has been no accurate guideline in this field, it is difficult to evaluate this kind of articles, but their idea might be acceptable from general consideration.



**PEER-REVIEW REPORT**

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Transplantation

**Manuscript NO:** 56712

**Title:** Practical recommendations for kidney transplantation in the COVID-19 pandemic

**Reviewer’s code:** 00504341

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

**Academic degree:** MD

**Professional title:** Professor

**Reviewer’s Country/Territory:** France

**Author’s Country/Territory:** Israel

**Manuscript submission date:** 2020-05-11

**Reviewer chosen by:** AI Technique

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2020-05-11 13:16

**Reviewer performed review:** 2020-05-13 05:43

**Review time:** 1 Day and 16 Hours

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Re-review</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

**SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)  
**https://**[www.wjgnet.com](http://www.wjgnet.com)

In this study the authors analyze Practical Recommendations for Kidney Transplantation in the COVID -19 Pandemic. Without a doubt, this is a highly relevant problem, profusely updated in multiple publications in the literature. The authors basically investigate into the subject of immunosuppression and the different pre and post-operative behaviors; in these patients. By the way, this subject is intensely and deeply treated in several publications. However, regarding the potential risk of mortality of the transplanted patient in general, and basically in the cases of the transplant in its immediate and postoperative period, was only mentioned considering a single bibliography referring to two cases (Gandolfini I, et al; COVID-19 in Kidney Transplant Recipients. American Journal of Transplantation 2020;n/a. : “There are only limited data on COVID-19 in transplant recipients.2 Herein, we report the outcomes of two deceased-donor kidney transplant recipients with COVID-19 pneumonia admitted to the Hospital of Parma (Parma, Italy), between March 2 and 12, 2020” On the other hand, and surely of main interest, the basic conception regarding the follow up of transplants and organs in these moments of Pandemic, are clearly evidenced in the works of Enver Akalin, M.D. et al Covid-19 and Kidney Transplantation. (s letter was published on April 24, 2020 at NEJM.org <https://www.nejm.org/doi/full/10.1056/NEJMc2011117>: (Kidney-transplant recipients appear to be at particularly high risk for critical Covid-19 illness due to chronic immunosuppression and coexisting conditions. At Montefiore Medical Center, we identified 36 consecutive adult kidney-transplant recipients who tested positive for Covid-19 between March 16 and April 1, 2020. Results show a very high early mortality among kidney-transplant recipients with Covid-19 – 28% at 3 weeks as compared with the reported 1% to 5% mortality among patients with Covid-19 in the general population who have undergone testing in the United States and the reported 8 to 15% mortality among patients with Covid-19 who are older than 70 years of age), where a basic behavior of abstaining from kidney transplantation in this period



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)  
**https://**[www.wjgnet.com](https://www.wjgnet.com)

of pandemic. Concerning this paper Pam Harrison in, COVID-19 Mortality Hits Almost 30% in Kidney Transplant Patient April 28, 2020. News > Medscape Medical News <https://www.medscape.com/viewarticle/929585> ; comments:" (Akalin told that 80% of patients in the Montefiore hospital are COVID-19 patients, and if more than 80% of your hospital is full of COVID-positive patients, how can you find a safe place to do transplantation?" and a Harrison added the Akalin statement, "So we stopped our kidney transplantation program 5 weeks ago because we have dialysis, so to delay transplantation a few months until the pandemic is cleared is not going to hurt the patient). As well, Debasish Banerjee et al COVID-19 infection in kidney transplant recipients April 2020 Kidney International DOI: 10.1016/j.kint.2020.03.0. Suggested to stopping kidney transplant programs. Consequently, should be important that in papers concerning indication of organ transplantation in the Covid19 pandemic time, to underline the high significant morbid mortality risks of the procedure. Nevertheless, the indication of the transplant face of risk of death (heart, liver, lung), with deceased organs should be suggested as the basically indication in force at the moment.



## RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Transplantation

**Manuscript NO:** 56712

**Title:** Practical recommendations for kidney transplantation in the COVID-19 pandemic

**Reviewer's code:** 05347087

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

**Academic degree:** MD

**Professional title:** Doctor, Medical Assistant, Research Assistant Professor, Surgeon,  
Surgical Oncologist

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** Italy

**Author's Country/Territory:** Israel

**Manuscript submission date:** 2020-05-11

**Reviewer chosen by:** Jia-Ping Yan

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2020-07-06 19:17

**Reviewer performed review:** 2020-07-06 19:21

**Review time:** 1 Hour

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

### SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)  
**https://**[www.wjgnet.com](http://www.wjgnet.com)

Interesting paper, well done!