

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery

Manuscript NO: 58470

Title: Liver Transplant for Larger Hepatocellular Carcinoma in Malatya: The Role of Gamma Glutamyl Transferase and Alpha-fetoprotein, A Retrospective Cohort Study

Reviewer's code: 03538879

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Chief Doctor, Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: China

Author's Country/Territory: Turkey

Manuscript submission date: 2020-07-24

Reviewer chosen by: Ya-Juan Ma

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-08-24 02:39

Reviewer performed review: 2020-08-27 07:38

Review time: 3 Days and 4 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgooffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1. I strongly suggest authors revise the manuscript according to STROBE statement and use sub-sections. Current structures were too disordered. 2. The introduction section should explain the reason and rationale of this study. Authors should modify relevant contents to let readers clearly understand the meaning of this study. In addition, authors mentioned GGT-II in the introduction, while no further work was done on it. So why mention it? 3. Treatments after surgery may also significantly influence the prognosis. I am wondering the reasons why post-surgery treatments were not involved in analysis. 4. In the last paragraph of results, authors divided the cohort into two groups according to the tumor size. How the 10cm was determined? 5. The decimal points in the figures was all written as ",". Please revise.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery

Manuscript NO: 58470

Title: Liver Transplant for Larger Hepatocellular Carcinoma in Malatya: The Role of Gamma Glutamyl Transferase and Alpha-fetoprotein, A Retrospective Cohort Study

Reviewer's code: 03021264

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: China

Author's Country/Territory: Turkey

Manuscript submission date: 2020-07-24

Reviewer chosen by: Ya-Juan Ma

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-09-25 04:43

Reviewer performed review: 2020-10-01 04:57

Review time: 6 Days

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors continued previous studies on the relationship between AFP/GGT and prognosis of HCC in liver transplantation, focused on patients having tumors beyond Malatya criteria patients, MTD > 6.0 cm HCCs, found significantly longer overall-survival and disease-free-survival for patients who had lower values of AFP and GGT, compared with higher values. AFP and GGT, both singly and combined together, represent a simple prognostic identifier for patients with large size HCCs after liver transplantation. The results of this study are helpful for clinical practice. This article meets the publication requirements AND can be accepted. 1. The authors found that AFP groups had non-significant changes in GGT values, AND neither tumor differentiation nor microvascular invasion were different between the 2 AFP groups. This result is the likely cause of the cutoff value of AFP is not ideal?

RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery

Manuscript NO: 58470

Title: Liver Transplant for Larger Hepatocellular Carcinoma in Malatya: The Role of Gamma Glutamyl Transferase and Alpha-fetoprotein, A Retrospective Cohort Study

Reviewer's code: 03021264

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: China

Author's Country/Territory: Turkey

Manuscript submission date: 2020-07-24

Reviewer chosen by: Chen-Chen Gao

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-11-06 12:51

Reviewer performed review: 2020-11-07 17:50

Review time: 1 Day and 4 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1. Many clinical parameters have impacts on the prognosis of liver transplantation for liver cancer. I suggest the author add some clinical parameters during operation, such as blood loss, operation time, etc 2. The author said "We previously found, by multivariate analysis of a large HCC cohort, that an MTD of 6 cm had a high and significant Hazard Ratio for survival", Therefore, tumor diameter has an important impact on the prognosis of liver cancer. From Figure 3, the author found no patients with MTD >10cm who also had low serum AFP plus low serum GGT levels, so I am wondering why there was no statistical difference in MTD of the two groups in table 3? 3、 how the MTD Measured? From CT image or pathological specimen?

RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery

Manuscript NO: 58470

Title: Liver Transplant for Larger Hepatocellular Carcinoma in Malatya: The Role of Gamma Glutamyl Transferase and Alpha-fetoprotein, A Retrospective Cohort Study

Reviewer's code: 03538879

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Chief Doctor, Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: China

Author's Country/Territory: Turkey

Manuscript submission date: 2020-07-24

Reviewer chosen by: Chen-Chen Gao

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-11-06 00:23

Reviewer performed review: 2020-11-09 01:17

Review time: 3 Days

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

Authors have answered my questions and made appropriate revision. I still suggest authors modify the structure of results section using sub-titles. Current presentation is not friendly to read.