

ANSWERING REVIEWERS STATEMENT



December 7, 2013

Dear Editor,

Please find enclosed the edited manuscript in Word format (file name: 5975-review.doc).

Title: Personalized surgical management of colorectal cancer in the elderly population

Authors: Giampaolo Ugolini, Federico Ghignone, Davide Zattoni, Giacomo Veronese, Isacco Montroni

Institution: Department of Medical and Surgical Sciences, University of Bologna, Policlinico S.Orsola-Malpighi, 40138 Bologna, Italy

Name of Journal: *World Journal of Gastroenterology*

ESPS Manuscript No: 5975

The manuscript has been improved according to the suggestions of the editor and the reviewers:

1. Format has been updated according to WJG instructions to authors

2. Revision has been made according to the suggestions of the reviewers:

(1) No. 00068211: *"This literature review analysis and summary 143 references, and draw a conclusion that personalized care for the patient is the true essence of Medicine. Sufficient evidence and rational argumentation are the highlights of this article."*

Changes made according to reviewer 00068211: The reviewer provided positive comments.

(2) No. 00058523: *"Thank you for the opportunity to review this. As a whole, I do not think there are major areas of concern. Minor points 1. You should set out the outline from the start e.g. we will discuss rehabilitation, ERA etc. As it stands, it is very difficult to anticipate what the authors are going to discuss next, and gives the impression of poor organisation 2. The paragraphing is poor. There are multiple sections where at least 3 paragraphs are required to divide discussion 3. I would perhaps have organised the paper a little differently, but this is not major criticism. All in all, a good effort. I would be grateful if you could provide an outline at the beginning, describing in order the topics you wish to discuss. Split your discussions into shorter paragraphs. Although the review is overly long, I can see reason to include most of this."*

(3) No. 00008369: *"The authors have excellent submission with very good points of clinical interests regarding geriatric consideration of CRC surgery. However, the current title is personalized surgical management of colorectal cancer in the elderly population, but the contents were somewhat mixing together of two points of views, geriatric consideration and personalized medicine. Therefore, the current review should be reorganized into three parts, one is geriatric*

consideration focusing, the second personalized medicine aspect, and lastly, as seen in title of talk, two points imparting clinical implication in this point of view. Second point is that though the authors subcategorized under the subtitles, but the contents within is somewhat looking general. Describe the core point of opinion as well as reference review consistent with subtitle, current is too diffuse."

Changes made according to reviewers 00058523 and 00008369: As suggested, we added table 1 which now provides the outline of the manuscript, summarizing the key elements of personalized surgical management for the elderly colorectal cancer patients. Agreeing with reviewer no. 00058523, we believe this will allow the readers to better understand the topics of the manuscript (table 1 cited in the introduction; manuscript line 28). Furthermore, we entirely revisited headings and subheadings as following: we divided our manuscript into three main sections, according to comments made by reviewer no. 00008369 (section 1 "Preoperative considerations before colorectal cancer surgery in the elderly", mostly focused on geriatric considerations [Multidisciplinary approach, holistic evaluation, preoperative risk screening tools in surgery, prehabilitation, perspectives and expectations regarding colorectal cancer surgery as subheadings]; section 2 "Personalized surgical management of colorectal cancer in the elderly"; section 3 "Postoperative recovery after colorectal cancer surgery in the elderly"). Minor changes were made in the first section (manuscript lines 31-39) with the aim to provide a clearer outline of section 1 "Preoperative considerations before colorectal cancer surgery in the elderly". Finally, following reviewer no. 00058523 suggestion, paragraphing was improved by splitting many sections into shorter paragraphs.

3. References and typesetting were corrected according to WJG instructions to authors

4. English language has been further implemented and reviewed by a professional English translation company (American English Courses by David Andrew Goldsmith <http://www.americanenglish.it>). Please find a signed statement attached.

Thank you again for publishing our manuscript in the World Journal of Gastroenterology.

Sincerely yours,

Giampaolo UGOLINI, MD, PhD
Department of Medical and Surgical Sciences
University of Bologna, Policlinico S.Orsola-Malpighi
Via Massarenti 9
40138 Bologna, Italy
Telephone: +39-051-6363344 Fax: +39-051-301834
E-mail: ugolini.g@aosp.bo.it

