

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 59936

Title: Preoperative maximal voluntary ventilation, hemoglobin, albumin, lymphocytes and platelets predict postoperative survival in esophageal squamous cell carcinoma

Reviewer's code: 00041966

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: FASCRS, MD

Professional title: Doctor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Italy

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2020-10-13

Reviewer chosen by: Jia-Ping Yan

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-11-05 10:15

Reviewer performed review: 2020-11-09 08:20

Review time: 3 Days and 22 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The article is original and explores an important field of preoperative evaluation of the patients, linking the patient's features to overall survival. The data used for the score assembled are routine data, non-expensive and apparently can be used as markers for "a priori" survival rate for oesophageal cancer. Limitation of the study is to ignore completely the postoperative complication and mortality rates. Type of surgery is not made explicit. As this kind of surgery has a high-morbidity, I would appreciate a split of the mortality for what concerns the complications. I assume that the lower limit of 0.19 year survival is affected by this. In my opinion as the data of pulmonary function and nutritional status are above all linked with the incidence of complication I would say that this field should be inspected. The survival of cancer after surgery without a clear indication of what happened during and after surgery is not enough to reach good data.

The comparison of coMVV-HALP with TNM would deserve a comment in the discussion, as would a comparison between the significance of the two scores for overall and cancer specific survival. Other specific comments - The abstract well represents the text and the whole study, but is a little bit. As the study is composed of different parts with lots of comparisons, I would rather just focus on main results. - There are a few spelling errors (e.g. in line 3 of the abstract "caners"). - Illustrations and tables. I would only add the J point on the ROC curves. - Discussion: as stated for pulmonary surgery cited in literature, the association of the results with the incidence of complication is not mentioned, as well as this data of postoperative mortality is not explained in the overall survival rates. -

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 59936

Title: Preoperative maximal voluntary ventilation, hemoglobin, albumin, lymphocytes and platelets predict postoperative survival in esophageal squamous cell carcinoma

Reviewer's code: 00057299

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Doctor, Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: South Korea

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2020-10-13

Reviewer chosen by: Jia-Ping Yan

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-10-31 00:15

Reviewer performed review: 2020-11-22 13:13

Review time: 22 Days and 12 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The present manuscript shows that pulmonary function, laboratory findings reflecting nutritional and inflammatory status, and its combination can predict survival outcome in patients with esophageal squamous cell carcinoma who underwent surgery. Although the findings are predicted results, they are meaningful because these studies have been rare in esophageal squamous cell cancer. There are a few concerns to be clarified. 1. The authors stated that low FVC has been implicated as a risk prognostic factor in gastric cancer or esophageal cancer in previous studies. Please, provide difference between FVC and MVV in this cohort. 2. Low MVV would be correlated with morbidity or mortality due to post-operative respiratory complication. It needs to provide how the authors corrected this confounding factor.

RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 59936

Title: Preoperative maximal voluntary ventilation, hemoglobin, albumin, lymphocytes and platelets predict postoperative survival in esophageal squamous cell carcinoma

Reviewer's code: 00041966

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: FASCRS, MD

Professional title: Doctor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Italy

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2020-10-13

Reviewer chosen by: Jia-Ru Fan

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-12-18 04:50

Reviewer performed review: 2020-12-18 06:58

Review time: 2 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https:// www.wjgnet.com

The authors succesfully addressed all the issues raised