

**ESPS Peer-review Report**

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 6101

**Title:** MODERN APPROACH TO THE CLINICAL MANAGEMENT OF NON ALCOHOLIC FATTY LIVER DISEASE

**Reviewer code:** 00053562

**Science editor:** Qi, Yuan

**Date sent for review:** 2013-10-02 20:38

**Date reviewed:** 2013-10-02 23:49

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

**COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

The abstract need a careful restyling: for instance, the sentence “However, cardiovascular disease is the single most important cause of morbidity and mortality in this patient population” is not so obviously consequential to the preceding statements. It seems – reading the abstract – quite obvious for anybody that fatty liver can be due also to “vitamin D3 deficiency” so that treatment by D3 was considered and adopted: probably the reviewer should have a more neutral position in this regard, particularly considering the excellent quality of his research. Angulo’ statement “a subset of patients with NASH, in particular those with a more severe fibrosis, are at higher risk for progressing to liver disease complications such as decompensated cirrhosis and hepatocellular carcinoma” should be, at least, better defined in its actual proportions vs. general population and/or vs. cirrhosis and liver cancer. As it is the concept could be misleading – as often happens – for readers. The section on lifestyle changes could be improved, and more attention should be devoted to dietary profiles instead of to single nutrients. Moreover, the conceptualization of this sentence is quite contradictory: “However, very scarce evidence is available to support the hypothesis that reduced caloric intake and weight loss would eventually improve hepatic histology. The only two registered drugs for pharmacological weight reduction, Orlistat and Sibutramine, gave some positive results on serum liver enzymes, but no on liver histology in patients with NAFLD” we are talking of dietary intervention, but this point is lost by the road in favour of drugs. Insulin resistance has been demonstrated to unify NAFLD to the metabolic syndrome. Probably “demonstration is an overstatement. Despite the obvious academic distinction between “pure” liver steatosis and steatosis due to environmental factors – including poor quality food and other environmental conditions –



## **Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited**

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,  
315-321 Lockhart Road,  
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

---

which probably are currently considered “toxic”, some word should be spent in a review with a so ambitious title “MODERN APPROACH TO THE CLINICAL MANAGEMENT OF NON ALCOHOLIC FATTY LIVER DISEASE” discussing some aspect of the tools and of the criteria of lifestyle and nutritional intervention.

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 6101

**Title:** MODERN APPROACH TO THE CLINICAL MANAGEMENT OF NON ALCOHOLIC FATTY LIVER DISEASE

**Reviewer code:** 02541967

**Science editor:** Qi, Yuan

**Date sent for review:** 2013-10-02 20:38

**Date reviewed:** 2013-10-08 19:30

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Well written and comprehensive review. Comment: The uprising numbers of HCCs developing in non-cirrhotic NASH livers and a potential role of metformin as anti-tumor agent should be mentioned.

**ESPS Peer-review Report**

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 6101

**Title:** MODERN APPROACH TO THE CLINICAL MANAGEMENT OF NON ALCOHOLIC FATTY LIVER DISEASE

**Reviewer code:** 01323395

**Science editor:** Qi, Yuan

**Date sent for review:** 2013-10-02 20:38

**Date reviewed:** 2013-10-13 15:52

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

**COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

Abstract. non alcoholic steatohepatitis is redundant (please remove non alcoholic). What are the comorbidities to be treated other than diabetes, obesity, ... already mentioned few lines above? Finally, different strategies would say different approaches to the same problem, but the approach to each single factor was examined (the same is for the core tips). The chapter on obesity does not mention in the title bariatric surgery, which is conversely reported in the text. Tables are really poor and at least one figure/graphic should be included. Other treatment does not include experimental data and clinical trials reports on silymarin. A potential mitochondrial effect of different treatments may be included too.

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 6101

**Title:** MODERN APPROACH TO THE CLINICAL MANAGEMENT OF NON ALCOHOLIC FATTY LIVER DISEASE

**Reviewer code:** 01438246

**Science editor:** Qi, Yuan

**Date sent for review:** 2013-10-02 20:38

**Date reviewed:** 2013-12-15 11:17

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I would suggest to rewrite the whole review and try to give it some unique spin.

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 6101

**Title:** MODERN APPROACH TO THE CLINICAL MANAGEMENT OF NON ALCOHOLIC FATTY LIVER DISEASE

**Reviewer code:** 00199556

**Science editor:** Qi, Yuan

**Date sent for review:** 2013-10-02 20:38

**Date reviewed:** 2013-12-23 20:58

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I have carefully revised the manuscript against the response of the author. The authors have responded for the criticisms raised by the reviewers. However, there are some points should be evaluated again as follow: 1. In page 9 the author stated: In a previous study [submitted], we demonstrated.. the author cited a data that is not published (no reference) or acceptable for publication. 2. In page 9 the author stated :In a previous study, we demonstrated (where the reference). 3. The style of reference is not fixed in the text once with number Cuthbertson et al [48] and once without any number e.g. Ryan et al page 5. 4. Some grammatical errors e.g. in a few studies (page 6 2nd paragraph) should be in few studies.

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 6101

**Title:** MODERN APPROACH TO THE CLINICAL MANAGEMENT OF NON ALCOHOLIC FATTY LIVER DISEASE

**Reviewer code:** 00189256

**Science editor:** Qi, Yuan

**Date sent for review:** 2013-10-02 20:38

**Date reviewed:** 2013-12-25 04:36

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The article has an high scientific and methodological level, I recommend the article to be published.