



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 61198

Title: Clinical diagnosis of severe COVID-19: A derivation and validation of a prediction rule

Reviewer's code: 03009065

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Associate Professor, Chief Doctor, Lecturer, Staff Physician

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Iran

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2020-12-03

Reviewer chosen by: Le Zhang

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-12-09 17:52

Reviewer performed review: 2020-12-18 18:02

Review time: 9 Days

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Manuscript Title: Derivation and validation of a prediction rule for clinical diagnosis of severe COVID-19 Article Type: Original Manuscript ID: A cross-sectional study Similarity Index: ? % Grammar: need revision Certificate of Biostatistics 61198-Institutional Review Board Approval Form or Document 61198-Non-Native Speakers of English Editing Certificate 61198-Signed Informed Consent Form(s) or Document(s) BPG-Copyright-License-agreement-signed Criteria Checklist for New Manuscript Peer-Review 1 Title. Does the title reflect the main subject/hypothesis of the manuscript? Yes, 3/5 the following title may be more attractive: The Clinical Diagnosis of Severe COVID-19; Validation of a Prediction Rule 2 Abstract. Does the abstract summarize and reflect the work described in the manuscript? Yes, 4/5 3 Keywords. Do the keywords reflect the focus of the manuscript? No, 2/5; The keywords should be designed based on MESH. More specific words, according to the MESH and the study, should be applied. COVID-19 pandemic; Infectious diseases; scoring system; severity prediction; validation; Nomogram 4 Background. Does the manuscript adequately describe the background, present status, and significance of the study? Yes, 4/5 5 Methods. Does the manuscript describe methods (e.g., experiments, data analysis, surveys, clinical trials, etc.) in adequate detail? Yes, 5/5 6 Results. Are the research objectives achieved by the experiments used in this study? What are the contributions that the study has made for research progress in this field? Yes, 4/5 The study strengthens the current criteria for the diagnosis of COVID-19 severe infection 7 Discussion. Does the manuscript interpret the findings adequately and appropriately, highlighting the key points concisely, clearly, and logically? Are the findings and their applicability/relevance to the literature stated in a clear and definite manner? Is the discussion accurate, and does it discuss the paper's scientific significance and relevance



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

to clinical practice sufficiently? Yes. However, more discussion is needed. The discussion should present each find in a separate paragraph, comparing the result with other equivalent studies, and discuss the reasons for the similarities and differences. Some claims need references. Line 265-266 Ministry of Health Guidelines[12], but different from the other practices in many other countries (References?). So far, mild and moderate patients with COVID-19 were encouraged to stay Line:275-276 As indicated by the research in China and Europe (References?) 8 Illustrations and tables. Are the figures, diagrams, and tables sufficient, good quality, and appropriately illustrative of the paper contents? Do figures require labeling with arrows, asterisks, etc., better legends? Yes 4/5 9 Biostatistics. Does the manuscript meet the requirements of biostatistics? Yes, 5/5 10 Units. Does the manuscript meet the requirements of the use of SI units? Yes, 5/5 11 References. Does the manuscript cite the latest, important and authoritative references in the introduction and discussion sections appropriately? Does the author self-cite, omit, incorrectly cite, and over-cite references? Yes, 4/5. 12 Quality of manuscript organization and presentation. Is the manuscript well, concisely, and coherently organized and presented? Is the style, language, and grammar accurate and appropriate? Yes, 4/5 13 Research methods and reporting. Authors should have prepared their manuscripts according to manuscript type and the appropriate categories, as follows: (1) CARE Checklist (2013) - Case report; (2) CONSORT 2010 Statement - Clinical Trials study, Prospective study, Randomized Controlled trial, Randomized Clinical trial; (3) PRISMA 2009 Checklist - Evidence-Based Medicine, Systematic review, Meta-Analysis; (4) STROBE Statement - Case Control study, Observational study, Retrospective Cohort study; and (5) The ARRIVE Guidelines - Basic study. Did the author prepare the manuscript according to the appropriate research methods and reporting? Yes, 5/5 14 Ethics statements. For all manuscripts involving human studies and/or animal experiments, author(s) must submit the related formal ethics documents



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA

Telephone: +1-925-399-1568

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

https://www.wjgnet.com

that were reviewed and approved by their local ethical review committee. Did the manuscript meet the requirements of ethics? Yes. The study approved by the local ethic committee.



RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 61198

Title: Clinical diagnosis of severe COVID-19: A derivation and validation of a prediction rule

Reviewer's code: 03009065

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Associate Professor, Chief Doctor, Lecturer, Staff Physician

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Iran

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2020-12-03

Reviewer chosen by: Chen-Chen Gao

Reviewer accepted review: 2021-01-01 17:09

Reviewer performed review: 2021-01-01 19:07

Review time: 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

The acronyms (e.g., NLR, P/F ratio) should be extended with the first occurrence in the abstract and the main text separately.