

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 61283

Title: Trends in the Management of Anorectal Melanoma: A Multi-institutional Retrospective Study and Review of the World Literature

Reviewer's code: 02524651

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: China

Author's Country/Territory: United States

Manuscript submission date: 2020-12-01

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-12-02 10:36

Reviewer performed review: 2020-12-06 14:37

Review time: 4 Days and 4 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In the manuscript "Trends in the Management of Anorectal Melanoma: A Multi-institutional Retrospective Study and Review of the World Literature", the authors tried to update the understanding of outcomes for patients with ARM and analyze management trends around the world. The performed a multi-institutional, retrospective study of patients treated for ARM and a literature review to assess trends in surgical management and outcomes. They conclude that there is wide variation in the management of ARM and survival outcomes remain poor regardless of approach and surgical management should aim to minimize morbidity. The topic of this work is interesting. 1, The authors conclude surgical management should aim to minimize morbidity. I suggest the authors give more details on the relationship between surgical management and morbidity in both their retrospective study and literature review. 2, The authors should show data on the complication of the surgical treatment and non-operative therapies. 3, Is it possible the authors give their evaluation and look forward to future strategies for ARM in the Discussion?

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 61283

Title: Trends in the Management of Anorectal Melanoma: A Multi-institutional Retrospective Study and Review of the World Literature

Reviewer's code: 03912278

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: PhD

Professional title: Assistant Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Saudi Arabia

Author's Country/Territory: United States

Manuscript submission date: 2020-12-01

Reviewer chosen by: Lian-Sheng Ma

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-12-03 11:59

Reviewer performed review: 2020-12-09 08:29

Review time: 5 Days and 20 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Anorectal melanoma incidences are exceptionally uncommon, as evidenced by Bleicher J, et al., identified in the present study only 24 cases over a 20-year period from seven of their participating institutes in the Salt Lake City, Utah area. The prevalence of ARM is more in women than men, and it is supported by these authors in this analysis also, as they found 16 females and 8 male cases. This is supported by the studies from different parts of the world, included in literature review analysis as they have presented in Table-3. In most of the cases with anorectal melanomas already have distant metastases at the time of presentation, the prognosis of this disease is poor with a median post-treatment survival time of less than 2 years and the 5-year survival rate of less than 20%. Thickness of the tumor appears to be correlated with the clinical outcome in anorectal melanoma. Thickness of 4.0 mm or more is more prone to relapse, metastasis, and low disease-free survival rate. In some case anorectal melanomas were misdiagnosed as other diseases also. Surgery in combination with radiotherapy and adjuvant immunotherapy, like interferon, was reported to be a choice of treatment for anorectal melanoma if the tumor is not metastasized. Evidence on optimal treatment is limited and surgical management varies widely. The authors collected the data of from various Cohort studies regarding the treatment modalities of ARM, and presented clearly in this manuscript. Their analysis helped in recommending that surgical management should aim to minimize morbidity in ARM patients. The methods of data analysis are very clear, and the results are presented well. The manuscript is written clearly and it's in acceptable form without any major changes.

RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 61283

Title: Trends in the Management of Anorectal Melanoma: A Multi-institutional Retrospective Study and Review of the World Literature

Reviewer's code: 03912278

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: PhD

Professional title: Assistant Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Saudi Arabia

Author's Country/Territory: United States

Manuscript submission date: 2020-12-01

Reviewer chosen by: Jia-Ru Fan

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-12-30 18:29

Reviewer performed review: 2020-12-30 18:39

Review time: 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

The authors made substantial improvements in their manuscript. Now this manuscript is in acceptable form.

RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 61283

Title: Trends in the Management of Anorectal Melanoma: A Multi-institutional Retrospective Study and Review of the World Literature

Reviewer's code: 02524651

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: China

Author's Country/Territory: United States

Manuscript submission date: 2020-12-01

Reviewer chosen by: Jia-Ru Fan

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-12-29 04:10

Reviewer performed review: 2020-12-31 15:23

Review time: 2 Days and 11 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The revised manuscript is acceptable