**Name of Journal:** *World Journal of Meta-Analysis*

**Manuscript NO:** 62050

**Manuscript Type:** MINIREVIEWS

**Should we use full analgesic dose of opioids for organ procurement in brainstem dead?**

Charlier P *et al*. Dose of opioids for organ procurement in brainstem dead

Philippe Charlier, John-David Rebibo, Nadia Benmoussa

**Philippe Charlier, Nadia Benmoussa,** Laboratory Anthropology, Archaeology, Biology (LAAB), Paris-Saclay University, Montigny-Le-Bretonneux 78180, France

**John-David Rebibo,** Department of Urology, Hôpital Privé Armand Brillard, Nogent-sur-Marne 94052, France

**Nadia Benmoussa,** Department of ENT, Gustave-Roussy Institute, Villejuif 94805, France

**Author contributions:** Charlier C wrote the first draft of the manuscript with significant critical input from Rebibo JD and Benmoussa N.

**Corresponding author: Philippe Charlier, DPhil, MD, PhD, Assistant Professor, Director,** Laboratory Anthropology, Archaeology, Biology, Paris-Saclay University, 2 avenue de la Source de la Bièvre, Montigny-Le-Bretonneux 78180, France. philippe.charlier@uvsq.fr

**Received:** December 27, 2020

**Revised:** January 30, 2021

**Accepted:** February 25, 2021

**Published online:** February 28, 2021

**Abstract**

Families facing the growing demand for organ removal from their loved ones are questioning the possible suffering of the brainstem dead patient. A frequent question they ask to coordinating doctors is: Are you sure he will not feel anything? Currently due to the risk of exacerbation of spinal reflexes and abnormal movements following surgical stimuli, it is recommended to use a curarization and an analgesic agent (most often morphine). The doses of opioids are less important than during usual anaesthesia, whereas the person is considered brainstem dead and there is no longer any cerebral integration of the pain. But what assures us that absolutely no more sensibility exists at this precise moment? Should the use of full analgesic dose of opioids not be continued anyway? Could this make the levies more "ethical"?

**Key Words:** Bioethics; Transplantation; Anaesthesiology; Brainstem dead

**©The** **Author(s) 2021.** Published by Baishideng Publishing Group Inc. All rights reserved.

**Citation:** Charlier P, Rebibo JD, Benmoussa N. Should we use full analgesic dose of opioids for organ procurement in brainstem dead? *World J Meta-Anal* 2021; 9(1): 51-53

URL: https://www.wjgnet.com/2308-3840/full/v9/i1/51.htm

DOI: https://dx.doi.org/10.13105/wjma.v9.i1.51

**Core Tip:** Families facing the growing demand for organ removal from their loved ones are questioning the possible suffering of the brainstem dead patient. A frequent question they ask to coordinating doctors is: Are you sure he will not feel anything? Currently due to the risk of exacerbation of spinal reflexes and abnormal movements following surgical stimuli, it is recommended to use a curarization and an analgesic agent (most often morphine). The doses of opioids are less important than during usual anaesthesia, whereas the person is considered brainstem dead and there is no longer any cerebral integration of the pain. But what assures us that absolutely no more sensibility exists at this precise moment? We propose that further neuroscientific analyses be conducted in order to improve our knowledge about such a sensibility. We ask to the medical community if we should rather use full analgesic dose of opioids, and question if this would make the levies more "ethical"?

**INTRODUCTION**

The definition of death is changing, driven by clinical physicians, physiologists and biomedical ethics specialists[1]. This evolution, both semantic and diagnostic, seems to be completely independent of religious influences, whether monotheistic or not. Recently, the concept of brain death has been called into question[2], with this underlying idea (and certainly provocative): What if the first motivation behind the introduction of this patho-physiological concept was not the extended possibility of access to graft organs, rather than death itself[3]?

**Ethical and physiological considerations**

With this moving and fluctuating definition of death (the moment of death, but also the stage of death)[4], we see that the definition of a total insensitivity of the deceased is debated: It may not be so immediate, nor so complete as initially considered. In the context of the most ethical medical and surgical practice possible, particularly in the context of critical care medicine, it is legitimate to wonder about a possible evolution of our professional practices.

Families facing the growing demand for organ removal from their loved ones are questioning the possible suffering of the brainstem dead patient. A frequent question they ask to coordinating doctors is: Are you sure he will not feel anything? Currently due to the risk of exacerbation of spinal reflexes and abnormal movements following surgical stimuli, it is recommended to use a curarization and an analgesic agent (most often morphine). The doses of opioids are less important than during usual anaesthesia[5], whereas the person is considered brainstem dead and there is no longer any cerebral integration of the pain. In this context, what assures us that absolutely no more sensibility exists at this precise moment? Should the use of full analgesic dose of opioids not be continued anyway? Could this make the levies more “ethical”?

**CONCLUSION**

The distress of the families is understandable, but the administration of analgesics at usual dose could also create a confusion of the families and be a source of misunderstanding between the declaration of death of their relative and the use of analgesic during the procedure of organ extraction[6]. This question should be taken into account by an international college of anaesthesiologists and bioethics specialists. In addition, it is likely that neurosensory experiments are necessary, not only at the level of the cerebral stage, but also of the spinal cord.

**REFERENCES**

1 **Charlier P**, Annane D. Time for a new definition of death? *Resuscitation* 2018; **127**: e14-e15 [PMID: 29678611 DOI: 10.1016/j.resuscitation.2018.04.012]

2 **Lizza JP**. Is brain death a legal fiction? *Ethics Med Public Health* 2018; **7**: 82-87 [DOI: 10.2147/MB.S70369]

3 **Shah SK**, Miller FG. Can we handle the truth? Legal fictions in the determination of death. *Am J Law Med* 2010; **36**: 540-585 [PMID: 21302846 DOI: 10.1177/009885881003600402]

4 **Charlier P**. [Death or deaths?] *Med Sci (Paris)* 2020; **36**: 1196-1198 [PMID: 33296637 DOI: 10.1051/medsci/2020227]

5 **Young PJ**, Matta BF. Anaesthesia for organ donation in the brainstem dead--why bother? *Anaesthesia* 2000; **55**: 105-106 [PMID: 10651668 DOI: 10.1046/j.1365-2044.2000.055002105.x]

6 **Katznelson G**, Katznelson G, Clarke H. Revisiting the anaesthesiologist's role during organ procurement. *Anaesthesiol Intensive Ther* 2018; **50**: 91-94 [PMID: 29953571 DOI: 10.5603/AIT.2018.0015]

**Footnotes**

**Conflict-of-interest statement:** None for any of all authors.

**Open-Access:** This article is an open-access article that was selected by an in-house editor and fully peer-reviewed by external reviewers. It is distributed in accordance with the Creative Commons Attribution NonCommercial (CC BY-NC 4.0) license, which permits others to distribute, remix, adapt, build upon this work non-commercially, and license their derivative works on different terms, provided the original work is properly cited and the use is non-commercial. See: http://creativecommons.org/Licenses/by-nc/4.0/

**Manuscript source:** Invited manuscript

**Peer-review started:** December 27, 2020

**First decision:** January 25, 2021

**Article in press:** February 25, 2021

**Specialty type:** Medical ethics

**Country/Territory of origin:** France

**Peer-review report’s scientific quality classification**

Grade A (Excellent): 0

Grade B (Very good): B, B, B

Grade C (Good): C

Grade D (Fair): 0

Grade E (Poor): 0

**P-Reviewer:** Cheungpasitporn W, Tai MCT, Xia VW **S-Editor:** Wang JL **L-Editor:** A **P-Editor:** Li JH



Published by **Baishideng Publishing Group Inc**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite 160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA

**Telephone:** +1-925-3991568

**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

**Help Desk:** https://www.f6publishing.com/helpdesk

https://www.wjgnet.com



**© 2021 Baishideng Publishing Group Inc. All rights reserved.**