



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 63186

Title: Responses to faecal microbiota transplantation in female and male patients with irritable bowel syndrome

Reviewer's code: 03633729

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Doctor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Taiwan

Author's Country/Territory: Norway

Manuscript submission date: 2021-01-25

Reviewer chosen by: Ya-Juan Ma

Reviewer accepted review: 2021-01-27 02:13

Reviewer performed review: 2021-01-29 08:57

Review time: 2 Days and 6 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA

Telephone: +1-925-399-1568

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

https://www.wjgnet.com

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

IBS patients are known to have dysbiosis and faecal microbiota transplantation (FMT) is a promising treatment for these patients. Since there is a female predominance in IBS in the USA and Europe, whether there is a differential response between genders is relevant to clinical practice. The authors found no sex difference in the response to FMT, in the total score on the IBS-SSS, FAS or IBS-QoL, in dysbiosis, or in the faecal bacteria or SCFA level either in the placebo group or active treated group. Generally, the manuscript was well-written and the data were properly presented. However, there are several issues need to be addressed before acceptance of the manuscript for publication, which are detailed in the attached file.



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 63186

Title: Responses to faecal microbiota transplantation in female and male patients with irritable bowel syndrome

Reviewer's code: 02462331

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Doctor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: France

Author's Country/Territory: Norway

Manuscript submission date: 2021-01-25

Reviewer chosen by: Ya-Juan Ma

Reviewer accepted review: 2021-01-26 12:00

Reviewer performed review: 2021-02-08 13:02

Review time: 13 Days and 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript entitled "Responses to faecal microbiota transplantation in female and male patients with irritable bowel syndrome" did not highlight a difference between female and male. In previous literature the sex was analyzed as a second outcome and one paper highlighted a difference. While the literature is divergent, new study should focus on this specific point to answer to this question. The quality of the manuscript is very good, the manuscript is clear and easy to understand. This study did not find a new concept but add more discussion about a previous study that found a difference in FMT according to sex. For me one limitation is the number of male in the placebo group and the generalization of the data. The results should be controlled for age and IBS subtype (see my comments below). Future directions should definitely try to answer to the question is there a difference in FMT response between male and female or at least controlled the result on sex. Please find some comments: Title: Maybe include something like "Responses to faecal microbiota transplantation is similar between female and male patients with irritable bowel syndrome" Introduction: -I would use a more recent manuscript for the sex ratio. -Methods: I think you should control the main results for age while the age between male and female are different in the placebo and treatment group, but also for subtypes while FMT is probably more efficient in the IBS-D subgroup! Results: -Why the number of male in the placebo group is so small? Why haven't you randomized between FMT and placebo with the same sex ratio in your previous study? -Table 1: add the % for IBS subtype; and the p value for each line between the female and male in each group! -How do you explain a better quality of life in the male of the placebo group? -Even if the IBS-SSS was not different between the group (but what are the p value?) the distribution seemed to be different. You should discuss it. -Are your results normally distributed even in the male of the placebo group?



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

if not you should present the results as median [Q1;Q3]. Discussion: -"Furthermore, the total scores on the IBS-SSS, FAS and IBS-QoL did not differ between females and males in both the placebo and the active treated groups before FMT and at different times after FMT" it is not true for IBSQOL at baseline in the placebo group neither for fatigue at 3 months in the placebo group! -page 10 "At 1 year after FMT levels of isobutyric and isovaleric acids were Increased in IBS patients, indicating a shift in microbial fermentation from a saccharolytic to a proteolytic pattern" Correct Increased for increased -the discussion should be more detailed!