

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 64492

Title: Is the simultaneous presence of IgG4-positive plasma cells and giant-cell hepatitis a coincidence in autoimmune hepatitis? A case report and literature review

Reviewer's code: 01553680

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Associate Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Japan

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2021-02-18

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2021-02-18 13:35

Reviewer performed review: 2021-02-25 05:32

Review time: 6 Days and 15 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript is interesting and well-written. However, the quality of IgG4 staining is not sufficient. Please replace the original figure with a high quality one.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 64492

Title: Is the simultaneous presence of IgG4-positive plasma cells and giant-cell hepatitis a coincidence in autoimmune hepatitis? A case report and literature review

Reviewer's code: 05965419

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Doctor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: China

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2021-02-18

Reviewer chosen by: Ya-Juan Ma

Reviewer accepted review: 2021-03-27 11:27

Reviewer performed review: 2021-03-27 12:28

Review time: 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors presented a rare case of 68-year-old woman with IgG4-associated autoimmune hepatitis combined with giant-cell hepatitis. Methylprednisolone treatment improved liver inflammation and fibrosis, as proved by a second liver biopsy. The authors then reviewed the literatures reporting similar pathological phenomena. The simultaneous presentation of IgG4-AIH and GCH was very rare and they analyzed the possible reasons for its appearance. Both the scientific quality and the language quality of this manuscript were good. I have a few suggestions which may improve the manuscript. 1, please label the scale bars in Figure 2 & 3. 2, Fig.2B was stated as "400X magnification". However, the nuclei in Fig.2B seemed the same size as in Fig. 2A (200X magnification) and much smaller than Fig. 2C&2D (both in 400X magnification). I think the authors made a wrong labelling of magnification of Fig. 2B and I suggest them use a new one with real 400X magnification so that the readers may better view the giant cell hepatitis. 3, For better appreciation of thinner fiber spacing and improvement of fibrosis, I would suggest the authors provide a Masson staining of the first liver biopsy specimen. 4, please refer in the manuscript where it applies as Fig. 2A, 2B, 2C or 2D, instead of using Fig.2 as an overall representation. The same situation happens to Fig. 3.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 64492

Title: Is the simultaneous presence of IgG4-positive plasma cells and giant-cell hepatitis a coincidence in autoimmune hepatitis? A case report and literature review

Reviewer's code: 03538120

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Director

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Japan

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2021-02-18

Reviewer chosen by: Ya-Juan Ma

Reviewer accepted review: 2021-03-27 03:15

Reviewer performed review: 2021-03-27 13:01

Review time: 9 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors reported a 68-year-old woman who presented IgG4-positive AIH together with giant-cell transformation of a few hepatocytes. Although the authors attempted to evaluate the possibility of simultaneous occurrence of AIH and giant-cell hepatitis, mainly based on the literature search, their conclusions seemed to be ambiguous. The reviewer is wondering whether the authors have just wanted to document that presence of giant-cell transformation of hepatocytes might solely reflect severity of inflammation due to AIH. The authors had better describe more clearly what they want to propose in this interesting case report.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 64492

Title: Is the simultaneous presence of IgG4-positive plasma cells and giant-cell hepatitis a coincidence in autoimmune hepatitis? A case report and literature review

Reviewer's code: 02447091

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Assistant Professor, Doctor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Japan

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2021-02-18

Reviewer chosen by: Ya-Juan Ma

Reviewer accepted review: 2021-03-29 06:56

Reviewer performed review: 2021-03-29 08:33

Review time: 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Youwen Tan et al case presented IgG4-related autoimmune hepatitis (IgG4-AIH) accompanied with gall cell hepatitis (GCH). English writing is fair (no grammatical error) and this work is worth enough for possible publication in WJG if some comments listed below are correctly responded. Major comments. 1. The authors need to describe in this case report whether any IgG4-related diseases including IgG4-related cholangitis are accompanied with or not. The results of imaging examinations such as MRCP or enhanced CT are necessary. Minor comments. 1. Provide page number in the manuscript. 2. Page 7, lines 13. Uemura is Umemura.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 64492

Title: Is the simultaneous presence of IgG4-positive plasma cells and giant-cell hepatitis a coincidence in autoimmune hepatitis? A case report and literature review

Reviewer's code: 03476277

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Doctor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Portugal

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2021-02-18

Reviewer chosen by: Ya-Juan Ma

Reviewer accepted review: 2021-04-01 15:34

Reviewer performed review: 2021-04-02 11:03

Review time: 19 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Authors presented a case of IgG4-associated autoimmune hepatitis with concomitant giant cells hepatitis. Despite being an interesting and rare case there are some issues that should be addressed: - Which classification was used to quantify fibrosis? Ishak? Metavir score? Authors says that fibrosis improved – please specify the degree of improvement using a validated classification. - Authors concluded that “liver inflammation, and fibrosis was often more severe than typical AIH but sensitive to corticosteroids, and both pathological features disappeared upon treatment” but these conclusions can’t be made based only on this case – remove it from abstract section as it seems that it is a conclusion of the case. Furthermore, I think authors should be more cautious and not so assertive in conclusions. For example, 25% of patients did not response do corticosteroids (1 in 4 is not neglectable) – we can only say that it seems to be steroid sensitive in most of cases. - The discussion is too long - The phrase “It has been recently reported that in the diagnosis of IgG4-autoimmune hepatitis (IgG4-AIH) [2, 3], that is, in the classic AIH, elevated serum IgG4 and IgG4-positive plasma cells are observed “ in introduction makes no sense. Please rewrite it. - The correct term is interface hepatitis (and not interfacial hepatitis, repeated many times in the manuscript). Please correct.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 64492

Title: Is the simultaneous presence of IgG4-positive plasma cells and giant-cell hepatitis a coincidence in autoimmune hepatitis? A case report and literature review

Reviewer's code: 05909642

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Doctor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Japan

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2021-02-18

Reviewer chosen by: Ya-Juan Ma

Reviewer accepted review: 2021-03-26 09:21

Reviewer performed review: 2021-04-08 10:03

Review time: 13 Days

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Tan and Chen reported a co-occurent case of IgG4-AIH and GCH with literature review. Though appropriately demonstration of and discussion for such co-incidence may broaden our understanding for the pathogenesis of somewhat controversial IgG4-AIH, their manuscript lacks the sufficient logical flow, accompanying with redundant writing and incorrect reference. Comments to authors: 1. The title “Is the simultaneous presence of IgG4-positive plasma cells and giant-cell hepatitis a coincidence” was a vaguely raised sentence. It is likely better to add “in AIH”. 2. In Abstract, line 1: In IgG4-AIH, causal association of IgG4-positive plasma cells and liver injury has not yet been demonstrated in the literatures. 3. In Abstract, Conclusion: “AIH with simultaneous IgG4-positive plasma cell infiltration and GCH, liver inflammation, and fibrosis was often more severe” is an overstatement. 4. Throughout manuscript: Interfacial inflammation should be corrected to interface hepatitis. 5. In Discussion, Reference 5: It was a report for IgG4-positive plasma cell -associated pulmonary inflammation, not for IgG4-related liver disease. 6. In Discussion, page 2, line 7-8: Authors should mention the criteria of IgG4-AIH in Reference 16, which was based on the ratio of IgG4-positive plasma cells, being different from the previous criteria. 7. In Discussion, page 2, line 8-12: Reference number 16 should be inserted to this sentence. 8. How frequent was the co-occurrence of typical AIH and GCH? Authors are encouraged to mention and discuss about the relative importance of GCH in IgG4-AIH, comparing to that in classical AIH. 9. In Discussion, the last paragraph: “The simultaneous occurrence of IgG4 and GCH in AIH” is inappropriate depiction: Relating to the above comment 7, authors should discuss whether IgG4-AIH and typical AIH are distinct disease entity or within continuing spectrum.

RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 64492

Title: Is the simultaneous presence of IgG4-positive plasma cells and giant-cell hepatitis a coincidence in autoimmune hepatitis? A case report and literature review

Reviewer's code: 03476277

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Doctor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Portugal

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2021-02-18

Reviewer chosen by: Jia-Ru Fan

Reviewer accepted review: 2021-04-25 11:29

Reviewer performed review: 2021-04-26 08:57

Review time: 21 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Authors addressed the majority of comments. However, in my opinion, discussion is still too extensive - it is difficult to stay focus and understand what authors really want to discuss. Authors should reduce this section and be more clear about what they want to emphasise with this case (there's not a clear message).

RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 64492

Title: Is the simultaneous presence of IgG4-positive plasma cells and giant-cell hepatitis a coincidence in autoimmune hepatitis? A case report and literature review

Reviewer's code: 05909642

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Doctor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Japan

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2021-02-18

Reviewer chosen by: Jia-Ru Fan

Reviewer accepted review: 2021-04-25 22:41

Reviewer performed review: 2021-04-27 10:06

Review time: 1 Day and 11 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Authors responded appropriately to Review 1's concerns.