

Number ID 03476715

Review Info

Specific Comments To Authors

Specific Comments To Authors (File)

Conclusion: Minor revision

Scientific Quality: Grade B (Very good)

Language Quality: Grade A (Priority publishing)

The manuscript comprehensively introduced the liver transplant allocation policies and outcomes in USA, which is informative for the readers. It is more like an introductory article rather than a systematic review. Although there are some merits in the article, several minor issues should not be ignored. 1. How does the author know "Region redistricting was not implemented due to statistically insignificant change in waitlist survival." The source should be stated. 2. "The sequence of distribution is for candidates within a radius of 150 nautical miles from the donor hospital, then secondly for candidates within a radius of 150 nautical miles from the hospital and lastly for candidates within a radius of 500 nautical miles from the donor hospital [16]." It seems the distances would be a radius < 150 nautical miles, 150~500 nautical miles, > 500 nautical miles. 3. It would be helpful and ready to grasp the information in the manuscript if key outcome indices could be listed in a table.

Answering reviewers:

First of all, all the authors would like to thank the reviewers for reviewing our manuscript. We accept that the reviewer's comments are valuable.

1. We agreed with the reviewer. It was the assumption. We have deleted the sentence "Region redistricting was not implemented due to statistically insignificant change in waitlist survival." from the manuscript.
2. We agreed with reviewer and edited the sentence to be more elegant and easy to understand as follows: "The sequence of distribution is for candidates within a radius < 150 nautical miles, then 150 ~ 500 nautical miles and lastly > 500 nautical miles from the donor hospital [16]."
3. We thanked the reviewer for their suggestion. However, we already have 2 tables for this manuscript and elected not to provide with additional table for outcome indices as we already elaborate all the outcome metrics and indices at length in our manuscript.