



## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Hepatology

**Manuscript NO:** 65396

**Title:** Therapeutic plasma exchange in liver failure

**Reviewer's code:** 02731621

**Position:** Editorial Board

**Academic degree:** FEBS, MD

**Professional title:** Associate Professor, Lecturer, Surgeon

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** Turkey

**Author's Country/Territory:** United States

**Manuscript submission date:** 2021-03-07

**Reviewer chosen by:** AI Technique

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2021-03-18 13:30

**Reviewer performed review:** 2021-03-20 16:26

**Review time:** 2 Days and 2 Hours

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Re-review</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA

**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568

**E-mail:** [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)

**https://**[www.wjgnet.com](http://www.wjgnet.com)

#### **SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

The manuscript entitled "Therapeutic Plasma Exchange in Liver Failure" is a comprehensive and well written review.



## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Hepatology

**Manuscript NO:** 65396

**Title:** Therapeutic plasma exchange in liver failure

**Reviewer's code:** 03446972

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

**Academic degree:** MD

**Professional title:** Chief Physician, Professor

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** China

**Author's Country/Territory:** United States

**Manuscript submission date:** 2021-03-07

**Reviewer chosen by:** AI Technique

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2021-03-15 10:36

**Reviewer performed review:** 2021-03-22 06:06

**Review time:** 6 Days and 19 Hours

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Re-review</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)  
**https://**[www.wjgnet.com](http://www.wjgnet.com)

#### **SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

In this manuscript of Abimbola Chris-Olaiya, et al, authors discussed efficacy and technical considerations of TPE in both acute and acute-on-chronic liver failure. It is controversial whether ALF of ACLF patients can benefit from OS by TPE and more RCT are still needed to supply clinical poofs. This manuscript is helpful in knowing the development of TPE for readers. It was well written and I recommend this paper to be published on WJG.



## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Hepatology

**Manuscript NO:** 65396

**Title:** Therapeutic plasma exchange in liver failure

**Reviewer's code:** 05242826

**Position:** Editorial Board

**Academic degree:** MD, PhD

**Professional title:** Associate Professor

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** Slovakia

**Author's Country/Territory:** United States

**Manuscript submission date:** 2021-03-07

**Reviewer chosen by:** Man Liu

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2021-03-17 13:17

**Reviewer performed review:** 2021-03-24 12:54

**Review time:** 6 Days and 23 Hours

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Re-review</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://**www.wjgnet.com

#### **SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

1) The manuscript is a narrative review of the current state of the art in therapeutic plasma exchange in patients with acute and acute-on-chronic liver failure. 2) The manuscript mainly evaluates the efficacy of TPE in these clinical scenarios, however, this type of review (narrative) is not adequate for the purpose. A formal systematic review according to PRISMA checklist would be more appropriate - see *World J Gastroenterol.* 2020 Jan 14; 26(2): 219-245. Published online 2020 Jan 14. doi: 10.3748/wjg.v26.i2.219

3) In the introduction there is an attempt to compare TPE with ECAD - this is very interesting topic, but the main point of the paragraph is wrong. Citing: "The theoretical advantage of TPE over ECAD hinges on the exchange of plasma, which replaces plasma factors that are lacking as a result of impaired hepatic synthetic function in both ALF and ACLF". However the main advantage of TPE is the removal of large proteins - cytokines and immunoglobulins (60-70% reduction) where MARS has a technical limit of 50-60 kDa based on the membrane). It would be useful to more thoroughly compare the two methods. 4) 1st line on page 9 is unclear - what is one plasma volume? 5) organisation of the manuscript is confounding. Outcomes and results of the same study are reported in different sections (outcomes and technical aspects) Technical aspects section should contain only options how to perform TPE with the reference to the outcomes section 6) No mention about TPE in acute alcoholic hepatitis is present. These are the majority of patients with ACLF where TPE is considered.