

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology

Manuscript NO: 65410

Title: Radiotherapy for gastric MALT lymphoma

Reviewer's code: 05925565

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Assistant Professor, Doctor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: China

Author's Country/Territory: France

Manuscript submission date: 2021-03-06

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2021-04-11 13:14

Reviewer performed review: 2021-04-11 13:47

Review time: 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I suggest using subheadings and numbers to make the article more structured.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology

Manuscript NO: 65410

Title: Radiotherapy for gastric MALT lymphoma

Reviewer's code: 05380317

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Assistant Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: India

Author's Country/Territory: France

Manuscript submission date: 2021-03-06

Reviewer chosen by: Man Liu

Reviewer accepted review: 2021-05-04 08:14

Reviewer performed review: 2021-05-04 08:59

Review time: 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Well written subject. Since the topic is specifically of RT in gastric MALT, author may consider shortly elaborating about various aspects like patient preparation, simulation, target volume delineation etc.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology

Manuscript NO: 65410

Title: Radiotherapy for gastric MALT lymphoma

Reviewer's code: 05493185

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Attending Doctor, Doctor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: China

Author's Country/Territory: France

Manuscript submission date: 2021-03-06

Reviewer chosen by: Man Liu

Reviewer accepted review: 2021-05-04 07:40

Reviewer performed review: 2021-05-04 15:27

Review time: 7 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This review is organized in a unprofessional way and leads me to suspect the scientific background of the authors. 1、The paper reviewed about radiotherapy in gastric MALT, however, ONLY 1/3 content is about radiotherapy. 2、The figure came from screenprint with MS word error underline, this kind of amateur makes the reviewer lost all the patience. 3、Radiation dosage, AEs, target delineate, movement management, radiation technologies need to be involved in the draft and be in a structured way. 4、The authors need to discuss the role of radiotherapy in comprehensive therapy of MALT. 5、The authors came down a conclusion which have been published years ago , here is the reference: Ruskoné-Fourmestraux A, Matysiak-Budnik T, Fabiani B, Cervera P, Brixi H, Le Malicot K, Nion-Larmurier I, Fléjou JF, Hennequin C, Quéro L; Groupe d'Étude des Lymphomes Digestifs (GELD) & Fédération Francophone de Cancérologie Digestive. Exclusive moderate-dose radiotherapy in gastric marginal zone B-cell MALT lymphoma: Results of a prospective study with a long term follow-up. *Radiother Oncol.* 2015 Oct;117(1):178-82. what's the novelty of this review?

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology

Manuscript NO: 65410

Title: Radiotherapy for gastric MALT lymphoma

Reviewer's code: 05391712

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Doctor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: India

Author's Country/Territory: France

Manuscript submission date: 2021-03-06

Reviewer chosen by: Man Liu

Reviewer accepted review: 2021-05-04 03:17

Reviewer performed review: 2021-05-06 14:52

Review time: 2 Days and 11 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors have made a wonderful attempt in summarizing all the various studies involving radiotherapy treatment for a rare disease like gastric MALT lymphoma. However there are certain corrections/ additions I would like to point out which will make the article more complete. 1. Please mention reference for first paragraph on page 1 2. Please add staging and work up of gastric MALT lymphoma. It will give the introduction more depth. 3. There is no mention on prognostic index - MALT-IPI which will help classify the patients into different risk criteria 4. The sub-heading perspectives should be modified on page 6. Various techniques of radiotherapy are mentioned below it and the sub-heading does not seem to match its content. 5. Please add a picture of radiotherapy planning. There has not been much focus on the techniques of radiotherapy, its description and target volume. Since the focus of the article is radiotherapy its important to stress on this aspect as well. For example the authors should elaborate on ISRT, IFRT 6. Do mention follow up of patients after radiotherapy. 7. In the conclusion, the authors should put in a flow chart summarizing the treatment options for gastric MALT.