

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** *World Journal of Psychiatry*

**Manuscript NO:** 67104

**Title:** Impacts of acupuncture treatment on depression: A systematic review and meta-analysis

**Provenance and peer review:** Invited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

**Peer-review model:** Single blind

**Reviewer's code:** 05270700

**Position:** Editorial Board

**Academic degree:** DSc, MD, PhD

**Professional title:** Professor

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** Bulgaria

**Author's Country/Territory:** China

**Manuscript submission date:** 2021-04-27

**Reviewer chosen by:** AI Technique

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2021-05-04 14:13

**Reviewer performed review:** 2021-05-06 11:38

**Review time:** 1 Day and 21 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://**www.wjgnet.com

<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: [ <input checked="" type="radio"/> ] Anonymous [ <input type="radio"/> ] Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: [ <input type="radio"/> ] Yes [ <input checked="" type="radio"/> ] No
-------------------------------------	---

### **SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

This is a state-of-the-art systematic review and meta-analysis of the effects of acupuncture in treatment of depression. The study follows PRISMA guidelines and synthesizes clear positive effects of acupuncture. Authors are advised to offer comparison of acupuncture effects with standard Western methods of cognitive-behavioral therapy and psychopharmacological interventions, especially in terms of efficacy and outcome. Further guidance and recommendations on the possible combinations of conventional approaches with complementary acupuncture methods might be found useful.



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** *World Journal of Psychiatry*

**Manuscript NO:** 67104

**Title:** Impacts of acupuncture treatment on depression: A systematic review and meta-analysis

**Provenance and peer review:** Invited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

**Peer-review model:** Single blind

**Reviewer's code:** 03897290

**Position:** Editorial Board

**Academic degree:** BMed, DSc

**Professional title:** Chief Doctor, Full Professor

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** Norway

**Author's Country/Territory:** China

**Manuscript submission date:** 2021-04-27

**Reviewer chosen by:** AI Technique

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2021-05-04 06:53

**Reviewer performed review:** 2021-05-10 10:57

**Review time:** 6 Days and 4 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: [ <input checked="" type="radio"/> ] Anonymous [ <input type="radio"/> ] Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: [ <input type="radio"/> ] Yes [ <input checked="" type="radio"/> ] No
-------------------------------------	---

## SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

From language angle, this meta-analysis and review paper of the acupuncture effects on depression is a well-written one, offering some conclusion in the use of acupuncture in psychiatric disorder. However, the authors might broaden their articulation of the article, especially the followings: 1. Most acupuncture related studied are TAU or sham controlled, which is nice. However, the exact techniques of acupuncture were less undermined, for instance, some studies using acupressure only. 2. Patients with depression can be further classified into primary vs secondary, or into other different depression subtypes which can be grouped into major depression disorder or bipolar depression. 3. The therapeutic composition of acupoints are also wide and inclusive, the author might notice the meaningful comparisons between these cited RCT studies. 4. How was the “qi” evaluated in different studies? This is also a confounding factor for further study inclusion. 5. There are still many other limitations of the study, where the authors might illustrate for the reader.



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** *World Journal of Psychiatry*

**Manuscript NO:** 67104

**Title:** Impacts of acupuncture treatment on depression: A systematic review and meta-analysis

**Provenance and peer review:** Invited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

**Peer-review model:** Single blind

**Reviewer's code:** 05429012

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

**Academic degree:** MD

**Professional title:** Doctor

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** Jordan

**Author's Country/Territory:** China

**Manuscript submission date:** 2021-04-27

**Reviewer chosen by:** AI Technique

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2021-05-04 00:34

**Reviewer performed review:** 2021-05-21 02:55

**Review time:** 17 Days and 2 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://**www.wjgnet.com

<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: [ <input checked="" type="radio"/> ] Anonymous [ <input type="radio"/> ] Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: [ <input type="radio"/> ] Yes [ <input checked="" type="radio"/> ] No
-------------------------------------	---

#### **SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

1-depression is classified into moderate and severe depression. in addition to the status of having no depression according to depression scales. It is not clear if acupressure treatment was effective in severe or moderate depression scales. 2- it is not reported which parts of depression domains were affected by acupressure treatment across various studies. 3- regarding mechanisms of acupressure treatment , it is not mentioned about any mechanisms. I think that there must be some measurements including serotonin, dopamine, or other neurochemicals involved. 4- It is difficult to reach conclusions regarding acupressure treatment in improving depression status. accordingly, my decision is "major corrections" are required according to previous notes

## RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

**Name of journal:** *World Journal of Psychiatry*

**Manuscript NO:** 67104

**Title:** Impacts of acupuncture treatment on depression: A systematic review and meta-analysis

**Provenance and peer review:** Invited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

**Peer-review model:** Single blind

**Reviewer's code:** 05429012

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

**Academic degree:** MD

**Professional title:** Doctor

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** Jordan

**Author's Country/Territory:** China

**Manuscript submission date:** 2021-04-27

**Reviewer chosen by:** Yun-Xiaojuan Wu

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2021-08-09 04:27

**Reviewer performed review:** 2021-08-09 05:00

**Review time:** 1 Hour

<b>Scientific quality</b>	[ <input checked="" type="radio"/> ] Grade A: Excellent [ <input type="radio"/> ] Grade B: Very good [ <input type="radio"/> ] Grade C: Good [ <input type="radio"/> ] Grade D: Fair [ <input type="radio"/> ] Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	[ <input checked="" type="radio"/> ] Grade A: Priority publishing [ <input type="radio"/> ] Grade B: Minor language polishing [ <input type="radio"/> ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing [ <input type="radio"/> ] Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	[ <input checked="" type="radio"/> ] Accept (High priority) [ <input type="radio"/> ] Accept (General priority) [ <input type="radio"/> ] Minor revision [ <input type="radio"/> ] Major revision [ <input type="radio"/> ] Rejection
<b>Peer-reviewer</b>	Peer-Review: [ <input checked="" type="radio"/> ] Anonymous [ <input type="radio"/> ] Onymous

statements

Conflicts-of-Interest: [ ] Yes [Y] No

#### **SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

I would like to thank authors for their responding to the required corrections by the reviewer and answering all items required.



## RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

**Name of journal:** *World Journal of Psychiatry*

**Manuscript NO:** 67104

**Title:** Impacts of acupuncture treatment on depression: A systematic review and meta-analysis

**Provenance and peer review:** Invited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

**Peer-review model:** Single blind

**Reviewer's code:** 03897290

**Position:** Editorial Board

**Academic degree:** BMed, DSc

**Professional title:** Chief Doctor, Full Professor

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** Norway

**Author's Country/Territory:** China

**Manuscript submission date:** 2021-04-27

**Reviewer chosen by:** Yun-Xiaojuan Wu

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2021-08-10 06:02

**Reviewer performed review:** 2021-08-10 06:10

**Review time:** 1 Hour

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Peer-reviewer</b>	Peer-Review: <input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Onymous



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)  
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

statements

Conflicts-of-Interest: [ ] Yes [Y] No

## SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

No further comments