

## ANSWERING REVIEWERS



December 10, 2013

Dear Editor,

Please find enclosed the edited manuscript in Word format.

**Title:** A review of natural products with hepatoprotective effect

**Author:** Eduardo Madrigal-Santillán, Eduardo Madrigal-Bujaidar, Rosa Isela Álvarez-González, María Teresa Sumaya-Martínez, José Gutiérrez-Salinas, Mirandeli Bautista, Ángel Morales-González, Manuel García-Luna y González-Rubio, J. Leopoldo Aguilar-Faisal and José A. Morales-González

**Name of Journal:** *World Journal of Gastroenterology*

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 7094

The manuscript has been improved according to the suggestions of reviewers:

1 Format has been updated

**Answer:** The format was updated with comments from reviewers

2 Revision has been made according to the suggestions of the reviewer

**Reviewer 1.** The English grammar and syntax need a great deal of polishing. Several sentences do not convey a clear message and works are either repeated or missing. Title page: the authors contribution is in Spanish and not English Title: The authors may want to rephrase the title as it indicates '...ethanol-related hepatic damage' but the way the review is written it does not cover ethanol only but also other toxic conditions (CCl<sub>4</sub>, paracetamol, thioacetamide, etc. Abbreviations: there are a large number of abbreviations within the text. A list of abbreviations at the end of the review will be useful. p 10: in describing the protective effect of cranberries on CCl<sub>4</sub> intoxication it is not clear if this protection applies to both acute and chronic CCl<sub>4</sub> administration. p15: mid-page: what the authors mean with '...ethanol plus...'? p. 16, 9th line from bottom: dyspnea, not dysnea. p23: line 11: Mt? no indication of Table 2 in the text.

**Answer:** We have corrected the spelling and grammatical errors in the English language. The title has been changed. We have include the full terms for the abbreviations. The abbreviations used are generally known to readers. We have considered the observations of pages 10, 15 and 16. We have modified the wording of the text. The abbreviation "Mt" appears in the text. We have changed the number of the tables (Table 1 has been removed). Table 2 is now Table 1 (this change has also been corrected in the text).

**Reviewer 2.** The authors put together a large amount of data. However, large pool of data, made it difficult to keep the presentation concise. The authors need to shorten the manuscript at least by 50%. All unnecessary wording should be removed. Language is sometime awkward, and needs to be improved. The following are examples of how the manuscript could be shortened.

1. Please, replace Generalities with word Overview.
2. Section Introduction Too long. Briefly state the objectives and rationale, and provide with a short description of the content.
3. Page 10, lines 8-21 This paragraph could be safely removed.

4. Page 12, lines 1-6 Remove.
5. Page 10, lines 3-6 from the bottom Remove.
6. Page 11 Make it more concise.
7. Page 12, lines 1-10 from the bottom, page 13, lines 1-9 Remove.
8. page 13, lines 11-20 Make it more concise.
9. Page 14 Remove all unnecessary wording and make it more concise.
10. Page 16 Section Generalities should be shortened by 80%. Instead of Generalities, use word Overview.
11. Page 10, lines 12-23 Remove.
12. page 20, lines 10-17 Remove.
13. Page 22, lines 1-15 from the bottom Shorten by 80%.
14. Table 1 The table could be safely removed.
15. These are just few examples of how the manuscript could be shortened. Please make corresponding revisions throughout the entire manuscript.

**Answer:** We have improved the wording of the text and we have considered some of the observations.

We have changed the word "Generalities" to the word "Overview."

We have improved the wording of the text, and we have corrected the spelling and grammatical errors in the English language. With regard to the comments from point 3 to point 13, we have improved the wording of the text. We believe that the information is important for understanding the text. We have not reduced the text.

Table 1 has been removed

**Reviewer 3.** This manuscript represents an encyclopedic list of naturally occurring hepatocyte protective substances. The literature reviewed represents mostly animal studies and therefore the application of this information to clinical medicine is limited. A summary table would be helpful to the reader.

**Answer:** The authors agree that the information focuses primarily on animal studies. However, it is important to remember that the fruits (grapefruit, cranberries, and grapes), plants (cactus pear, cactus pear fruit, chamomile, silymarin, and spirulina) and natural resin (propolis) mentioned in the text are frequently consumed by humans. Some of them have been used in traditional medicine for many years, and there are some studies that were developed or evaluated in humans. This review could be the central point for beginning to develop clinical studies. It is also important to remember that the stages for the development of new drugs start with *in vitro* and *in vivo* studies (especially in animals). If the effects are as expected, then clinical studies can be developed to confirm the effects. It is difficult and inconvenient to create a summary table of the clinical studies because there have been few studies of this type.

**Reviewer 4.** This is an interesting reading. However, there are several aspects of the presentation that require additional attention. These are: The language and grammar - some examples; Page 5, last paragraph .. "The use of fruits....have placed ?? Page 6, second paragraph, "directed focused ??? ". Also, please note; it is yogurt and not "yoghurt". In addition, the nomenclature for carbohydrates should follow that accepted recommendations and not some coined by you creations (see page 5, Galactosamine as Gal ??? Finally, in the title word "Protector effect" should be changed to "Protective effect". Otherwise, good effort !

**Answer:** All of the observations and suggestions were considered. We have improved the wording of the text, and we have corrected the spelling and grammatical errors in the English language.

3 References and typesetting were corrected

Thank you again for publishing our manuscript in the *World Journal of Gastroenterology*.

Sincerely yours,

José A. Morales-González, MD, PhD  
Laboratorio Medicina de Conservación  
Escuela Superior de Medicina  
Instituto Politécnico Nacional  
Plan de San Luis y Díaz Mirón, Casco de Santo Tomás  
11340 DF, México  
Fax: 01-55-53 96 35 03  
E-mail: jmorales101@yahoo.com.mx