

Reviewer #1:

Scientific Quality: Grade C (Good)

Language Quality: Grade A (Priority publishing)

Conclusion: Accept (General priority)

Specific Comments to Authors: **Please try to find the root cause of PPM, how it is formed (is it the cause of genetic or environmental, food, etc.).**

Answer:

Thank you for your suggestion. At present, there are few reports about PPMs, and most of them are case reports. We have not found a study on the root cause of PPMs. Various hypotheses about its origin were mentioned in our discussion. Future studies with larger samples or related animal studies are needed to explore the underlying causes.

Reviewer #2:

Scientific Quality: Grade B (Very good)

Language Quality: Grade B (Minor language polishing)

Conclusion: Minor revision

Specific Comments to Authors: The manuscript is interesting.

I suggest to check the number of all the articles found with PPM, in fact, in the last years several reports have been done. Also, you can mention the exact period included in your search (the month of 2021). In the ending 2021, some reports have been done: Bas A, Valiyev E, Ozkan ND, Tombul I, Yonat S, Sayan M, Kurul IC. A Rare Entity: Primary Pulmonary Meningioma. Turk Patoloji Derg. 2021 May 10. English. doi: 10.5146/tjpath.2021.01535. Epub ahead of print. PMID: 34514565. Oh JH, Cho HS, Hwang HS, Ji W. Primary pulmonary meningioma presenting as multiple lung nodules: A case report. Thorac Cancer. 2021 Dec 8. doi: 10.1111/1759-7714.14270. Epub ahead of print. PMID: 34878222. Jiang M, Chen P, Huang R, Zhang J, Zheng J. A case report of primary pulmonary meningioma masquerading as lung metastasis in a patient with rectal carcinoma: role of 18F-FDG PET/CT. J Cardiothorac Surg. 2021 May 29;16(1):153. doi: 10.1186/s13019-021-01546-3. PMID: 34051819; PMCID: PMC8164743. Please check the total number of references, as you mentioned 48 patients (and practically each one with a different author in the tables)...A total of 63 patients diagnosed with PPM were reported in the literature from 1982 to 2021. All of these patients received histological assessment confirming PPM. Sixteen cases were excluded because (1) they underwent no radiological examination or (2) they received no radiological evaluation of the CNS negative for meningioma. Ultimately, 48 patients (including the case reported above) were included in the analysis. If is the case, the number of reference for introduction and discussion is very limited (more than 300 papers are about the topic, albeit not all are case reports or presenting all the requirements to be included in your work.

Answer:

Thank you for your comments. Please allow me to answer your questions in the following two aspects:

- 1) **About the latest literature you listed**, I am sorry that we may not have retrieved two papers listed by you when we submitted the manuscript. To ensure the integrity of literature review, it is necessary to set our literature search time at the end of 2021. Thus, we have added them to our manuscript.
 - 2) **We have checked the total number of references**. There are over 300 papers on this topic, including 51 papers of PPMS (67 patients); 25 papers of meningiomas; 45 papers of lung metastasis of CNS meningiomas; 30 other primary tumors metastasized to meninges; and more than 150 other papers. Referring to the previous review[1], we set the above conditions to exclude studies that performed only clinical neurologic assessment without a radiologic study. Also, primary extracranial and extrapulmonary meningiomas, pulmonary meningothelial-like nodules, and lung metastasis of CNS meningiomas were excluded from review.
1. Han D, Deng H, Liu Y: Primary pulmonary meningiomas: report of two cases and review of the literature. *Pathology, research and practice* 2020, 216(12):153232.

Science editor:

The manuscript elaborated a case of primary pulmonary meningioma. The manuscript is well written and can be helpful for the readers to ameliorate the diagnostic and therapeutic approach for this scenario. Nevertheless, there are a number points that may deserve some revisions. 1. PPM is indeed a rare case, but it has been reported in the literature. What's new about the author's manuscript? 2. Authors should not upload a revised version of the manuscript.

Language Quality: Grade B (Minor language polishing)

Scientific Quality: Grade B (Very good)

Answer:

Thank you for your suggestion.

- 1) The present study reported a case with very complete clinical procedure and imaging data, including preoperative enhanced CT examination, PET-CT examination, bronchoscopy biopsy, and postoperative pathological results. There were rare signs of calcification on CT, false positives on PET-CT and errors in our biopsy results. This suggests that we need to be cautious when excluding PPM only through auxiliary examination or even needle biopsy in clinical work.
- 2) We have corrected this mistake.

Company editor-in-chief:

I have reviewed the Peer-Review Report, the full text of the manuscript, and the relevant ethics documents, all of which have met the basic publishing requirements of the World Journal of Clinical Cases, and the manuscript is conditionally accepted. I have sent the manuscript to the author(s) for its

revision according to the Peer-Review Report, Editorial Office's comments and the Criteria for Manuscript Revision by Authors. Before its final acceptance, the author(s) must provide the Signed Consent for Treatment Form(s) or Document(s). Please provide the original figure documents. Please prepare and arrange the figures using PowerPoint to ensure that all graphs or arrows or text portions can be reprocessed by the editor. Authors are required to provide standard three-line tables, that is, only the top line, bottom line, and column line are displayed, while other table lines are hidden. The contents of each cell in the table should conform to the editing specifications, and the lines of each row or column of the table should be aligned. Do not use carriage returns or spaces to replace lines or vertical lines and do not segment cell content.

Answer:

Thank you for your suggestion. We have provided the Signed Consent for Treatment Form with PowerPoint format.