



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,  
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242

**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243

**Manuscript No:** 71815

**Title:** In Memoriam of Thomas E. Starzl, The Pioneer of Liver Transplantation

### **Editor in Chief**

#### **Comment**

I have reviewed the Peer-Review Report, the full text of the manuscript, and the relevant ethics documents, all of which have met the basic publishing requirements of the World Journal of Transplantation, and the manuscript is conditionally accepted. I have sent the manuscript to the author(s) for its revision according to the Peer-Review Report, Editorial Office's comments and the Criteria for Manuscript Revision by Authors. However, the quality of the English language of the manuscript does not meet the requirements of the journal. Before final acceptance, the author(s) must provide the English Language Certificate issued by a professional English language editing company.

**Reviewer ID:** 03755068

#### **Comment**

This was a short article about the pioneer of liver transplantation, prof. Starzl. The first part of this manuscript briefly summarized the career of Prof. Starzl, whereas in the second part, one of the Author described his personal relationship with him. I have no comments on this paper. I would only suggest to correct some typos (e.g., her instead of his), and to add a sentence in the first part dealing with the ethical principles that led his career.

### **Response**

Based on your recommendation,



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,  
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242

**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243

**Reviewer ID:** 05703005

#### **Comment**

This article aims to give an overview of Thomas Starzl's life work. It must be acknowledged tho whilst the is entitled a memoriam - he did pass away 4 years ago and some of the language needs to reflect that. Currently, there is too little focus on his successes both scientifically, surgically and in developing the transplant community and this needs to be improved on prior to publication. - Starzl passed away in 2017 so the comment about how Starzl's death deeply saddens all transplant surgeons around the world should be in the past tense (and there is an argument that it is redundant given the passing of this amount of time) - He also worked at the University of Pittsburgh which should be mentioned in the introduction - Whilst it is important to acknowledge Bennie (note two ns) Solis' transplant - it is given too much focus with little mentioned of his successes - the immunosuppression development is vital and needs to be expanded on, it may also be worth discussing his relationship with his surviving patients as well as clinicians around the world (notably Roy Calne) which led to further developments in the field of transplantation. - The special comment is a lovely anecdote which does state a lot for his role in the development of colleagues - it perhaps could be reduced in length

#### **Response**

1. Suggested word errors were corrected by changing Benie as Bennie, saddens as saddened.
2. Thomas Starzl's revolutionary contributions to liver transplantation were briefly added.
3. English grammar was revised.

**Reviewer ID:** 05226054

#### **Comment**

Very interesting and well written memoir for Thomas E. Starzl. The draft needs proof reading and has few grammar errors.

#### **Response**

Grammar was corrected



7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,  
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242

**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243

Sincerely Yours

Sami Akbulut, MD, PhD, Prof, FACS

Department of Surgery and

Liver Transplant Institute,

Inonu University Faculty of Medicine,

Elazig Yolu 10. Km

Malatya 44280, Turkey.

Telephone: +90-422-3410660

Fax: +90-422-3410036

Email: [akbulutsami@gmail.com](mailto:akbulutsami@gmail.com)