

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Clinical Cases*

Manuscript NO: 72053

Title: Novel mutations of the Alström syndrome 1 gene in an infant with dilated cardiomyopathy: a case report

Provenance and peer review: Unsolicited manuscript; externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 03498422

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Doctor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Italy

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2021-10-05

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2021-10-17 09:59

Reviewer performed review: 2021-10-21 18:05

Review time: 4 Days and 8 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No

Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: [<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>] Anonymous [<input type="checkbox"/>] Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: [<input type="checkbox"/>] Yes [<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>] No
-------------------------------------	---

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The Authors report a novel mutation of the ALMS1 gene causing DCM in a 1-month-old girl. The case is interesting, even though several points should be addressed. 1. Medical therapy included Angiotensin converting enzyme inhibitors, spironolactone, digoxin and diuretics. Overall, this therapy seems quite outdated compared to current guidelines on HF (sacubitril/valsartan, betablockers... are not mentioned). 2. In the manuscript "After standard anti-congestive heart failure treatment, TTE revealed acoustic enhancement in the left ventricular endocardium compared with at admission, which was suspected to have arisen from thickening of the ventricular endocardium as a result of deposition of subendocardial fibrous tissue layers during heart development[8]. Consequently, myocardial fibrosis may also play a role in AS." This concept should be removed or toned down, because subendocardial hyperintensity at cardiac ultrasound cannot be used as a surrogate for myocardial fibrosis, which should be demonstrated by the presence of late enhancement at cardiac magnetic resonance. 3. In the summary the terms "antiventricular remodeling treatment" and "acoustic enhancement in the left ventricular endocardium" are quite unusual and difficult to understand; I would strongly recommend to rephrase this sentence ("heart failure therapy" or "anti-remodelling therapy".... and "subendocardial hyperechogenicity"... respectively, even though this last concept should be removed/rephrased as indicated in point 2). 4. There are no biohumoral exams at follow-up (did NTproBNP decrease on medical therapy)? 5. There are no data about the arrhythmic burden; was a 24-holter ECG monitoring performed at baseline and/or at follow-up?

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Clinical Cases*

Manuscript NO: 72053

Title: Novel mutations of the Alström syndrome 1 gene in an infant with dilated cardiomyopathy: a case report

Provenance and peer review: Unsolicited manuscript; externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 03908435

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MBBS

Professional title: Consultant Physician-Scientist, Doctor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: India

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2021-10-05

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2021-10-17 17:25

Reviewer performed review: 2021-10-28 18:42

Review time: 11 Days and 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No

Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: [<input type="checkbox"/>] Anonymous [<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>] Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: [<input type="checkbox"/>] Yes [<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>] No
-------------------------------------	---

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

An interesting addition to the existing knowledge on the genotype of Alström syndrome. I'd like to draw the attention of the authors to the following- 1. The authors' statement - // There have been no cases reported with a relationship between DCM and mutation of ALMS1.// is ambiguous. What do the authors try to convey? When cardiomyopathy is an important feature of Alström's, how do the authors say that there has been no case with ALMS1 mutation and DCM? 2. In the case presentation part, the sequence of findings that led to the suspicion of Alström's clinically should be described. This should come prior to the genetic testing part. 3. In discussion, try to add a few words about the differences between phenotypes (if any) when mutation is found in the hot-spot exons and the non-hotspot exons.