

March 15, 2014

Dear Editor,

Please find enclosed the edited manuscript in Word format (file name: 7239-review.doc).

Title: Living Donor Liver Transplantation Does Not Increase Tumor Recurrence of Hepatocellular Carcinoma Compared to Deceased Donor Transplantation

Author: Guangqin Xiao, Jiulin Song, Shu Shen, Jiayin Yang, Lunan Yan

Name of Journal: *World Journal of Gastroenterology*

ESPS Manuscript NO: 7239

The manuscript has been improved according to the suggestions of reviewers:

1 Format has been updated

2 Revision has been made according to the suggestions of the reviewer

Reviewer 1:

(1). The statement of "Liver transplantation is the best choice" is not always appropriate. The authors should explain the condition and circumstance of its use according to criteria.

[In our manuscript we have revised the statement.](#)

(2). The conclusion part of the abstract is not compatible with the title.

[The conclusion part of the abstract has been replaced as "The outcomes of LDLT for HCC are not worse compared to the outcomes of DDLT. LDLT does not increase tumor recurrence of HCC compared to DDLT".](#)

(3). There is a statistically significant difference in the preoperative adjuvant therapy between the two groups. The authors need to provide the detailed information of the therapies and explain whether these therapies have an impact on the results.

[According to our analysis we found the percentage of the HCC patients who received the preoperative adjuvant therapy was higher in patients after DDLT than LDLT. Of the 118 patients received preoperative adjuvant therapy, 83 \(70.3%\) people received transcatheter arterial chemoembolization \(TACE\) therapy only, 18 \(15.3%\) patients radiofrequency ablation treatment only, 11 \(9.3%\) underwent hepatectomy only and 6 \(5.1%\) patients received more than two treatment methods. The analysis suggested that preoperative adjuvant therapy had no impact on the RFS and OS.](#)

(4). Apart from HBV infection, other factors cause tumor recurrence. The authors need to discuss

these factors and their effects on the results.

The key purpose of this study was to investigate whether the long-time outcome of LDLT was worse than DDLT for HCC patients. We found LDLT did not increase tumor recurrence compared to DDLT. Some factors including HBV infection can cause tumor recurrence after LT, but this interesting problem is not the issue being explored in this study, so we hardly discuss the impact of the other factors including HBV infection on the results.

(5).Please correct numerous typo errors. Grammatical and punctuation errors exist.

We have corrected numerous typo errors, grammatical and punctuation errors according reviewer's suggestions .

Reviewer 2:

(1).According to table 1, 84 recipients were in LDLT group, but there was only 80 collected data in AFP and tumor number.

Of 84 recipients received LDLT, four patients lost the data of AFP tests and tumor assessment.

(2).some investigators addressed that inadequate time to assess the biological behavior of the tumor and insufficient preoperative treatments may increased the recurrence rate of LDLT, but the current study suggested otherwise. And that, in the author's view, is biological assessment and fully pre-treatments no-longer necessary or important before LT?

Our analysis suggested that preoperative adjuvant therapy had no impact on the RFS and OS between DDLT and LDLT. According our analysis we found the portion of the tumor characteristics (including tumor number, largest tumor size and total tumor size et al) within Milan or UCSF criteria was higher in LDLT. Based on our experience, considering the safety of the donor and the value of LDLT, the indications of the recipients for LDLT were stricter than DDLT. In our own opinion, we think preoperative adjuvant therapies are still required because they can play a role in reducing tumor for a certain extent.

3 References and typesetting were corrected

Thank you again for publishing our manuscript in the *World Journal of Gastroenterology*.

Sincerely yours,



Lu-nan Yan

No.37, Guoxue Alley, Chengdu City 610041, Sichuan Province, China

Telephone: +86-28-85422867

Fax: +86-28-85422867

E-mail: yanlunan1268@163.com