

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Psychiatry*

Manuscript NO: 72814

Title: Changes in the Amplitude of Low-Frequency Fluctuations in Specific Frequency Bands in Major Depressive Disorder after Electroconvulsive Therapy

Provenance and peer review: Invited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 05212850

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MBBS, MD, PhD

Professional title: Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: India

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2021-12-22

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2022-01-01 23:10

Reviewer performed review: 2022-01-13 06:56

Review time: 11 Days and 7 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: [<input checked="" type="radio"/>] Anonymous [<input type="radio"/>] Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: [<input type="radio"/>] Yes [<input checked="" type="radio"/>] No
-------------------------------------	---

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

A good study which demonstrated that the effectiveness of ECT treatment for MDD may be partly proven by significantly decreased ALFF in the slow-5 band. These results may help us to understand more fully the potential therapeutic mechanisms of ECT for MDD patients. This manuscript shows a way forward in understanding the therapeutic mechanism of ECT. The limitations are small sample size. Subjects were not matched in education. Also the second MRI was done after the eighth ECT irrespective of the clinical status of the patient. A more detailed longitudinal study would have probably given better results. The authors may include a few sentences on future directions .

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Psychiatry*

Manuscript NO: 72814

Title: Changes in the Amplitude of Low-Frequency Fluctuations in Specific Frequency Bands in Major Depressive Disorder after Electroconvulsive Therapy

Provenance and peer review: Invited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 02729669

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Additional Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: India

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2021-12-22

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2022-01-28 02:43

Reviewer performed review: 2022-01-29 15:57

Review time: 1 Day and 13 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
-------------------------------------	---

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

a. The authors in this article discussed about important electroneurophysiological changes following ECT in patients with major depressive disorder. b. Abstract: The statement “Major depressive disorder (MDD) tends to have a high incidence and high risk” sounds incomplete. Kindly mention high risk of what? c. Similarly, the claim “Electroconvulsive therapy (ECT) is currently the most effective treatment for MDD” sounds baseless. Kindly refer to the existing evidences. d. Kindly refer to the statement “With rapid and high response rates, electroconvulsive therapy (ECT) is usually used when other treatments fail. It is particularly important in suicidal, psychotic, or tonic depression[7].” What do you mean by tonic depression? e. Authors need to mention about the study design, sampling techniques and sample size estimation in more detail in the study. f. What was the study period (time frame)? g. Why DSM-IV criteria was used instead of DSM 5? h. Kindly describe what the authors mean by severe somatic disease? i. Whether the authors did cognitive assessment during the course of ECT?