

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** *World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology*

**Manuscript NO:** 73206

**Title:** Clinicopathological characterization of ten patients with primary malignant melanoma of the esophagus and literature review

**Provenance and peer review:** Unsolicited manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

**Peer-review model:** Single blind

**Reviewer's code:** 03805084

**Position:** Editorial Board

**Academic degree:** MD, PhD

**Professional title:** Professor

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** Lithuania

**Author's Country/Territory:** China

**Manuscript submission date:** 2021-12-02

**Reviewer chosen by:** AI Technique

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2021-12-20 19:06

**Reviewer performed review:** 2021-12-20 19:39

**Review time:** 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No

<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: [ <input type="checkbox"/> ] Anonymous [ <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> ] Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: [ <input type="checkbox"/> ] Yes [ <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> ] No
-------------------------------------	-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

## SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Primary malignant melanoma of the esophagus is a rare clinical entity, however, there are numerous case reports, case series and/or review papers published in current literature. Many of these papers are published by the research groups based in Asia. The assessed paper reviews 290 cases of Chinese patients with primary malignant melanoma of the esophagus. This indeed could be the largest study of the Chinese patients until now, which makes this manuscript more exclusive but mainly interesting only to the clinicians and/or researchers working in China and/or near by countries. Nevertheless, there are also some concerns regarding the scientific interest of the paper and quality of the manuscript: - analysis reflects local clinical practices and provides little or no new information for the wider international circle of the readers; - the title of the manuscript does not reflect that this is analysis is comprised of small case series (10 patients) and a literature review; - case series itself is presented with very moderate quality and mainly serves the purpose of showing that the authors team have expertise in the field but the most interesting data comes from the literature review and combined analysis of all 290 cases; - english language needs improvement. I would suggest include the cohort of 10 patients with the primary malignant melanoma of the esophagus (PMME) and present only the results of the whole pool of Chinese patients. Review all the tables and figures, and leave only essential and most informative because most of the information is extensively covered in text. Add some clinical tips & tricks, recommendation on the diagnosis and management of these patients in the context of international guidelines and local practices. Overall, the manuscript should be shortened significantly and more concentrated.

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** *World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology*

**Manuscript NO:** 73206

**Title:** Clinicopathological characterization of ten patients with primary malignant melanoma of the esophagus and literature review

**Provenance and peer review:** Unsolicited manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

**Peer-review model:** Single blind

**Reviewer's code:** 03537202

**Position:** Editorial Board

**Academic degree:** MD, PhD

**Professional title:** Adjunct Professor, Doctor, Professor

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** Italy

**Author's Country/Territory:** China

**Manuscript submission date:** 2021-12-02

**Reviewer chosen by:** Qi-Gu Yao

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2022-03-02 11:33

**Reviewer performed review:** 2022-03-02 15:59

**Review time:** 4 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No

<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: [ <input type="checkbox"/> ] Anonymous [ <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> ] Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: [ <input type="checkbox"/> ] Yes [ <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> ] No
-------------------------------------	-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

## SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Authors reported an article about the primary malignant melanoma of esophagus (PMME). The clinicopathological findings of ten cases with PMME treated in the Henan Provincial People's Hospital were summarized. Moreover, English and Chinese literature that focused on Chinese patients with PMME from 1980 to September 2021 was reviewed and analyzed by univariate and multivariate analyses. STATUS: ACCETTABLE FOR PUBBLICATION PENDING MINOR REVISIONS General considerations: This is an original article including a broad review of literature. The paper is well-written. The work is very interesting and the statistical analysis is good. There are only a few articles in literature about this topic, especially focusing on asian population. Although only 12 patients with PMME were retrieved in Henan Provincial Hospital from January 1990 to September 2021, the literature analysis is thorough and the teaching that can be learned from reading the article makes it extremely useful for spreading the concept of PMME. However, more clarity is needed in the introductory phase on the type of article and how to set it up (original article + metanalysis or original article + review?). I recommend its publication, pending minor revisions. Abstract: In the abstract paragraph, the following concept is not clear: "A total of 290 Chinese patients with PMME were enrolled in the present study". In the text I seem to understand that the records of only 12 patients with PMME were retrieved in Henan Provincial Hospital (from January 1990 to September 2021). Please, specify it better. Keywords: adequate. Paper On some aspects, the authors should address: 1)More clarity is needed in the introductory phase on the type of article and how to set it up (original article + metanalysis or original article + review?). 2)In the Results paragraph

you wrote: “Nine patients had an accurate preoperative diagnosis of PMME, and one was diagnosed with poor differentiated carcinoma”. If it is a poorly differentiated carcinoma, why is it included in the series? 3)In the Discussion you wrote: “Even though some places in China are the high incidence area of esophageal cancer, there were fewer studies focused on Chinese patients with PMME compared with the Japanese and western populations”. Please, do not emphasize this aspect. I understand that the readers are predominantly asian, but WJCC is an international journal and would end up losing readers. 4)It would be helpful if you briefly discuss about the melanoma involving mucosal surfaces other than the esophagus. You can refer to these two articles, which you need to cite: -Rectal melanoma presenting as a solitary complex cystic liver lesion: role of contrast-specific low-MI real-time ultrasound imaging. J Ultrasound. 2015 Oct 6;19(2):135-9. doi: 10.1007/s40477-015-0182-1. PMID: 27298643; PMCID: PMC4879010. -Anorectal mucosal melanoma. Oncotarget. 2018;9(9):8785-8800. Published 2018 Jan 2. doi:10.18632/oncotarget.23835. 5)Have you also investigated about the possibility of melanoma metastases? For example, to the liver. You could discuss this same article and do both at the same time: -Rectal melanoma presenting as a solitary complex cystic liver lesion: role of contrast-specific low-MI real-time ultrasound imaging. J Ultrasound. 2015 Oct 6;19(2):135-9. doi: 10.1007/s40477-015-0182-1. PMID: 27298643; PMCID: PMC4879010. 6)You need to discuss better about the role of imaging in the diagnosis of PMME. 7)Is this tumor histotype possibly associated with multiple primary malignancies? Discuss these articles and cite them. -Increased risk of second primary cancers after a diagnosis of melanoma. Arch Dermatol. 2010 Mar;146(3):265-72. doi: 10.1001/archdermatol.2010.2. PMID: 20231496; PMCID: PMC3076705. -Multiple primary tumours: challenges and approaches, a review. ESMO Open 2017; 2(2): e000172. doi: 10.1136/esmoopen-2017-000172. eCollection 2017. 8)A linguistic revision would be advisable. Try to search “Informoration” in the text.



7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)  
**https://**[www.wjgnet.com](https://www.wjgnet.com)

Reference: please, add the ones that I suggested you.

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** *World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology*

**Manuscript NO:** 73206

**Title:** Clinicopathological characterization of ten patients with primary malignant melanoma of the esophagus and literature review

**Provenance and peer review:** Unsolicited manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

**Peer-review model:** Single blind

**Reviewer's code:** 03034605

**Position:** Editorial Board

**Academic degree:** MBBS, MCh, MD

**Professional title:** Assistant Professor, Attending Doctor, Chief Doctor, Consultant Physician-Scientist, Surgeon

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** India

**Author's Country/Territory:** China

**Manuscript submission date:** 2021-12-02

**Reviewer chosen by:** Qi-Gu Yao

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2022-02-24 17:35

**Reviewer performed review:** 2022-03-03 07:33

**Review time:** 6 Days and 13 Hours

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection

<b>Re-review</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

### SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors have conducted an interesting study to understand the clinical characteristics and outcomes of primary esophageal malignant melanoma. I have following comments regarding the manuscript. 1. How many patients underwent neoadjuvant therapy in this study? Is there any role of neoadjuvant therapy in this disease knowing that most patients have lymph nodal metastases at the time of diagnosis? 2. What does the high standard deviation in the overall and disease free survival indicate? 3. Both figure 4 and table 4 provide the same information. One of them can be omitted. 4. Discussion section is too lengthy with repetition of results. It should be revised to make it more concise and comprehensive. 5. How many patients underwent PETCT among the study patients? What is the role of PETCT in the management of this disease?